



Architectural Review Board Report

Architectural Review Board Meeting: July 6, 2020

Agenda Item: 7.1

To: Architectural Review Board
From: James Combs, Associate Planner
Cc: Stephanie Reich, AIA, LEED AP, Design & Historic Preservation Planner
Subject: 20ARB-0145 to review building design, colors, and materials for an addition to an existing duplex in the South Beach neighborhood.
Address: 157 Hart Avenue
Applicant: Bahram Badiyi

Recommended Action

It is recommended that the Architectural Review Board approve application 20ARB-0145 based upon the findings and subject to the conditions contained within this report.

Executive Summary

The proposal seeks to raise the ceiling height of an existing attic creating a second floor, provide access to a new roof deck and legalize an enclosure of the front porch. An upper level outdoor space shared between the units will be converted to a stairway for rooftop access. The proposed second floor provides a contemporary interpretation of the existing vernacular building.

Staff recommends the board provide guidance and/or conditions for an approval for the the proposed addition.

Background

The parcel was originally developed between 1905 and 1907 with seemingly unpermitted additions and modifications taking place sometime after 1983. No permits have been reviewed by the Architectural Review Board to modify the property. The subject property is identified on the Historic Resources Inventory (HRI) as a contributor to a potential South Beach historic district.

Project / Site Information

The mid-block property is located on Hart two lots west of Neilson Way. The parcel is surrounded to the north, south, and west with single-unit buildings.

The following table provides a brief summary of project data:

Zoning District / Design Guidelines:	R2 (Low Density Residential) District
Parcel Area (SF):	3,000 SF
Parcel Dimensions:	94.3' x 32.75'

Existing On-Site Improvements (Year Built):	1906/1907
Historic Resources Inventory Status	The existing building has a status code of 5D3 as a contributor to the potential South Beach Historic District.
CEQA	Exempt pursuant to Section 15061 (b)(3)
Adjacent Zoning & Use:	North: R2 – Low Density Residential South: R2 – Low Density Residential East: R2 – Low Density Residential West: R2 – Low Density Residential

Analysis

Site and Landscape Design

The site is developed with a two-story duplex with uncovered tandem parking along the east property line. Existing landscape is limited to tall grasses and shrubs along the property lines and approximately 100 square feet of existing landscape within the front yard. Except for a new 26 SF utility closet at the rear the existing landscape and hardscape will remain as-is.

Building Design/Architectural Concept

The house originally included a bay window and an expansive covered porch across the front façade as detailed on sheets AD-15 and AD-16. Sometime between 1983 and 2003 the front porch was enclosed. No permits are available for this work and part of the subject request is to legalize the enclosure.

The proposed second-story addition will be setback from the façade, preserving the existing expansive front porch and roof form(s) at the front 22 feet of the existing building. The design concept is a contemporary interpretation of the existing vernacular building and maintains the existing symmetry. The side elevations incorporate design details of the existing building and simplify the roof form to accommodate a roof deck, hidden from the street by the frontmost addition. The neighborhood has numerous turn-of-the-century beach bungalows with additions in a variety of configurations and styles.

Mass and Scale

The proposed height increase is set back approximately 30 feet from the front property line and 22 feet from the front of the building reducing the impact of the increased second story height from the street. At the side elevations the second story is stepped back from the existing first floor walls and incorporates a mix of window sizes and shapes which provide visually interest. The enclosed porch does bring more mass forward to the street but is not a significant impact given the design of neighboring buildings.

The mass and scale have been adequately addressed and is appropriate for the neighborhood where most of the lots are narrow and developed with two and nonconforming three-story residences. However, the massing of the second story gives a more vertical impression than the existing building. The Board should consider if the proposed second floor is appropriately placed and shaped in order to maintain the sensibility of the structure as a potential contributor to a potential South Beach Historic

District. A three conditions have been included to modify the second floor to have a more horizontal massing, be lower, and to generally better complement the existing building.

Design, Details and Materials

The proposed finishes have been selected to match the existing building as closely as possible, while differentiated from the existing per the Secretary of Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation. The existing windows are not original and appear to be a mix of vinyl and/or aluminum windows primarily with a slider type operation. All new windows will be vinyl clad wood windows using hung, fixed, and casement operations to be more consistent with the vernacular design. Staff recommends wood windows be used, especially at the ground floor. The infilled porch will maintain the decorative upper sashes and proposes casement windows at the lower portion to provide passive air flow through the building.

The existing wood siding is a mix of sizes; the original siding at the front of the house utilizes a six-inch-wide horizontal board which will be utilized on all new locations and where repairs are necessary. No more than 25% of the siding at the front and 50% of the siding overall will be removed. Existing siding will remain where repairs are not necessary. The new roof deck will be surrounded by a 42" high glass guardrail. The fenestration, proportion, and alignment of the proposed windows are generally appropriate on all elevations.

The material palette and color scheme are high quality and complement the building design.

DESIGN ELEMENTS	PROPOSED EXTERIOR MATERIAL, FINISH AND COLOR
Façade	Horizontal wood siding of various widths (existing) Six-inch-wide horizontal wood siding (proposed)
Windows	Vinyl clad wood windows Casement, hung, and fixed.
Doors	Aluminum and glass doors.
Roof	Asphalt roofing to match existing

Impact on Historic Resources

The subject property is a contributor to the Potential South Beach Historic District and listed with a status code of 5D3. As conditioned, the proposal will meet with the Secretary of Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation and will maintain its integrity as a potential resource.

Code Compliance

This application has only been preliminarily reviewed for compliance with the base district’s development standards which address aspects of the plan that could result in significant changes to the project’s design. A complete code-compliance review will not occur until the application is submitted for plan check. Any significant changes to the design subsequent to any ARB approval will require Board approval.

CEQA Status

The project is exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15061 (b)(3) in that it can be seen with certainty that the

proposed project does not have the potential for causing a significant effect on the environment in that the project involves the review of design-related issues associated with the proposed structure(s) in terms of general architectural design, proposed materials, colors, mechanical screening and/or landscape plans. As noted above, as conditioned, the proposal will meet with the Secretary of Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation and will maintain its integrity as a potential resource.

Summary

The proposed project is conversion of an attic into a second floor and legalizing the enclosure of a porch on an existing vernacular building. The proposal does not create an overly massive building in relation to surrounding structures. The Board may wish to consider how the expanded second floor and enclosed porch could be more appropriate to existing vernacular building. Should the Board wish to approve the project they can use the findings and conditions below.

FINDINGS:

- A. The plan for the proposed building or structure is expressive of good taste, good design, and in general contributes to the image of Santa Monica as a place of beauty, creativity and individuality in that the proposed contemporary building expresses a clear architectural idea and complements the existing building while maintaining its integrity as a potential historic resource.
- B. The proposed building or structure, as conditioned, is not of inferior quality such as to cause the nature of the local neighborhood or environment to materially depreciate in appearance and value in that high quality materials such as wood siding and windows and glass guardrails, will be incorporated into the building design as proposed in the application submittal and as presented to the Architectural Review Board. These finishes and associated color scheme support and enhance the contemporary building addition and its three-dimensional quality.
- C. The proposed design is compatible with surrounding developments as many of the surrounding building are small vernacular buildings with subsequent second floor additions. As shown, the proposed addition will be compliant with the Zoning Ordinance in terms of setback and parcel coverage, and height and no deviation from Code is requested.
- D. The proposed development conforms to the effective guidelines and standards adopted pursuant to Chapter 9.55 – *Architectural Review Board*, and all other applicable ordinances insofar as the location and appearance of the buildings and structures are involved. Specifically, the location and appearance of the buildings and structures comply with required findings set forth in Chapter 9.55, as documented by the Architectural Review Board, and as conditioned, the plans will fully comply with all applicable regulations prior to the issuance of a building permit.

CONDITIONS:

1. Prior to building permit submittal plans shall be revised to include wood windows at the ground floor using hung, casement, and fixed window configurations.
2. Prior to building permit submittal, the proportions of the second-floor façade shall be adjusted to portray a more horizontal aesthetic to better complement the existing building.
3. Prior to building permit submittal, the roof of the additional shall be decreased.
4. Prior to building permit submittal, the applicant shall modify the roof form of the addition to better complement the existing roof.
5. All new materials shall be distinguished from existing materials as required by the Secretary of Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation. For example, the siding at the second floor should be a slightly different width than the existing building for ease of differentiation.
6. This approval shall expire when the administrative or discretionary entitlements, not including any Subdivision Map approvals, previously granted for the project have lapsed. If no such entitlements have been granted, this approval shall expire 24 months from its effective date, or 30 months if in the Coastal Zone unless appealed.
7. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall demonstrate landscape and irrigation plan compliance with the City's Green Building Ordinance standards (SMMC 8.108) subject to staff approval. Modifications to the landscape plan that effect less than 150 square feet of area may be reviewed and approved by the Staff Liaison to the Board.
8. Prior to the issuance of a building permit a hydrozone matrix shall be included in the landscape and irrigation plans that describes for each hydrozone the following: the square footage, percentage of total landscaped area, plant type and plant form, hydrozone basis, hydrozone description, exposure or micro-climate, irrigation method, irrigation devices (including manufacturer, make and model), zone pressure, precipitation rates, zone gallons per minute and controller station numbers.
9. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall demonstrate that the plans comply with all applicable provisions of the Zoning Ordinance. Significant changes to a project's design shall require review and approval of the Architectural Review Board. Minor changes may be approved administratively pursuant to all applicable guidelines.

The Architectural Review Board's approval, conditions of approval, or denial of this application may be appealed to the Planning Commission if the appeal is filed with the Zoning Administrator within ten consecutive days following the date of the Architectural Review Board's determination in the manner provided in SMMC 9.61.100.

Attachments

Applicant's Submittal Material
DPR sheet for 157 Hart

[https://smgov365.sharepoint.com/teams/pcdsp/CityPlanning/ARB/STFRPT/SR20/20ARB-0145 \(157 Hart\)/20ARB-0145 \(157 Hart\).docx](https://smgov365.sharepoint.com/teams/pcdsp/CityPlanning/ARB/STFRPT/SR20/20ARB-0145 (157 Hart)/20ARB-0145 (157 Hart).docx)