



Architectural Review Board Report

Architectural Review Board Meeting: March 2, 2020

Agenda Item: 7.2

To: Architectural Review Board
From: Michael Rocque, Associate Planner
Cc: Stephanie Reich, AIA, LEED AP, Design & Historic Preservation Planner
Subject: 19ARB-0564 to review building design, colors, materials and landscape plans for a two-story, 3-unit residential building.
Address: 949 10th Street
Applicant: Giovanni D. Fruttaldo

Recommended Action

It is recommended that the Architectural Review Board approve application 19ARB-0564 based upon the findings and subject to the conditions contained within this report.

Executive Summary

Proposed is a new contemporary two-story, three-unit building with semi-subterranean private parking spaces, accessed from a single driveway along the alley.

Staff recommends approval of the building and site improvements with conditions and findings contained in this report.

Background

The subject site is improved with a single-unit building and detached garage that was constructed in 1916. The property is listed on the Historic Resource Inventory.

19ENT-0258: On October 2, 2019, the Planning Commission approved a Vesting Tentative Parcel Map for the three-unit condominium.

The Landmarks Commission reviewed a demolition permit for the site on July 9, 2018 and took no action.

Project / Site Information

The existing site is a mid-block parcel located on the east side of 10th Street between Washington Avenue and Idaho Avenue. Multi-family buildings of varying styles and eras surround the parcel.

The following table provides a brief summary of project data:

Zoning District / Design Guidelines:	R2 (Low Density Residential)
Parcel Area (SF):	7,500 SF
Parcel Dimensions:	50' x 150'
Existing On-Site Improvements (Year Built):	Single Family Residence with detached garage (1916)
Historic Resource Inventory Status	Property is listed on the HRI-Individual Resource
CEQA	Exempt pursuant to Section 15061 (b)(3)
Adjacent Zoning & Use:	North: R2- Multi-Unit Residential South: R2- Multi-Unit Residential East: R2 - Multi-Unit Residential West: R2 - Multi-Unit Residential

Analysis

Site Planning

The proposal is for a building with three modern condominiums replacing an existing single unit dwelling. The building is generally rectangular in design with an elongated volume that provides subtle articulation defining the individual units, front entry court and private outdoor spaces at the front and rear of the building. The building is designed with two units at the ground floor and third unit occupying the entire second floor. Access to all three units is provided along the north interior side yard with recessed covered canopy entries. Required parking is accessed from the alley (10th Court) and is designed with six semi-subterranean parking spaces. A trash collection/recycling area is located at the ground level along the alley. Each unit includes a private outdoor patio space at the ground floor and second floor levels.

Landscape Design

Landscaping is proposed in the front, and as a buffer in the side setbacks. There is a layered approach in the front yard whereby a combination of low retaining walls and shrubs provides a buffer while retaining a sense of openness. The drought tolerant palette provides a diversity in plant materials with predominantly low lying shrubs and accents used as borders and ground cover within the front setback and at the property line including *Lomandra Longifolia* (Dwarf Mat Rush) and *Anigozanthos Haematocephala* (Red Kangaroo Paw) and *Prunus Illicifolia* (Holly Leaf Cherry) located within a planter behind the shrubs at the sidewalk. Also, located within the front setback area are two proposed *Olea Europaeas* (Olive Trees). The use of shrubs, especially the Holly Leaf Cherry, wraps and continues to border along both interior side yards to ensure adequate buffers for the residents and provide adequate to/from the adjoining neighbors. There are two other smaller pockets of landscaping proposed at the interior stairwell to the upper unit and at the rear yard adjacent to the alley. The placement and layering of the plant species will achieve an attractive landscape design that complements the building design.

Building Design/Architectural Concept

The proposed building is a well-conceived modernist design that uses shape, form and varying materials to create shade, shadow and recesses to provide identity to each unit and enhance the residential function of the building. The building concept consist of a linear condition with varying forms that are different in materials, sizes and shapes that are not perfectly aligned. The blocks present a sophisticated play of projecting and recessed forms to highlight building entries and other features. Stone cladding offered in both a sandblast and bush hammered finish is predominantly used on all elevations with white cement steel trowel stucco used as a complementary material. The residential nature of the project is expressed using canopies, open trellis and a diverse pattern for windows and doors. The proposed design expresses a clear architectural concept.

Mass and Scale

The perceived mass and scale is consistent with the surrounding properties which are generally two stories or taller. The mass and scale are broken up through the composition of various projecting and receding volumes along the elevations as well as the change of colors and materials, a positive aspect of the design. The front elevation creates some interesting three-dimensionality by setting back the second-floor volume from the first floor, breaking up the massing. The rest of the building volume is divided in smaller parts allowing the mass and scale to relate to the neighboring volumes. This treatment allows the building to take on a 3-dimensional quality while expressing a cohesive design.

Design, Details and Materials

The contemporary building will be clad with a minimal color palette of stone wall cladding employed in both a sandblast and bush hammered finish and white cement steel trowel stucco, accentuated by bronze anodized windows framed with aluminum. The window size and pattern appear to reinforce subtly varied architectural forms. On the south elevation there is steel ladder proposed towards the center of the building which extends from finished floor to roof line. Staff recommends that the ladder either be relocated or perhaps a different color or material, so it is not as visible. A condition has been included for details of windows and other unique conditions to be approved by staff prior to submittal for building permits.

A conceptual lighting plan is proposed on the site which appears to enhance the project as it is limited to highlighting key plant specimens and walkways. A condition has been included to provide additional details of proposed lighting fixtures as well as a photometric plan prior to submittal for building permits to ensure appropriate lighting levels. The use of high-quality materials and attention to detail create a well-designed building appropriate to the neighborhood.

DESIGN ELEMENTS	PROPOSED EXTERIOR MATERIAL, FINISH AND COLOR
Façade	Stucco: Smooth steel trowel (white) Stone: Bush hammered /sandblasted (white/grey)
Windows	Aluminum Frame (bronze anodized aluminum)
Doors / Gates	Exterior Doors: Wood
Roof	Single Ply membrane

Mechanical Screening/Enclosure	Perforated aluminum panel (powder coated finish)
Trellis/Awning/Canopy	Aluminum smooth anodized (bronze)
Lighting	Wall Sconces, path lighting, step lighting, and Recessed Lights

Impact on Historic Resources

The subject property is listed on the City’s Historic Resources Inventory. The Landmarks Commission held a preliminary hearing on the demolition permit (18BLD-6450) on July 9, 2018 and determined that there is not credible evidence in the record to proceed with a further public hearing to determine whether the buildings or structures meet the criteria for a City Landmark or Structure of Merit.

Code Compliance

This application has only been preliminarily reviewed for compliance with the base district’s development standards which address aspects of the plan that could result in significant changes to the project’s design. A complete code-compliance review will not occur until the application is submitted for plan check. Any significant changes to the design subsequent to any ARB approval will require review and approval by the Board.

CEQA Status

The project is exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15061 (b)(3) in that it can be seen with certainty that the proposed project does not have the potential for causing a significant effect on the environment in that the project involves the review of design-related issues associated with the proposed structure(s) in terms of general architectural design, proposed materials, colors, mechanical screening and/or landscape plans.

Summary

The proposed modern style building will replace a single-family residence on site and accommodates three dwelling units over two levels and six semi-subterranean garage parking spaces with access from the alley. The project appears to have a clear architectural concept, and the mass and scale is consistent with the surrounding properties and neighborhood. The proposed landscape palette is diverse and drought tolerant and its design complements the building’s architecture.

FINDINGS:

- A. The plan for the proposed building or structure is expressive of good taste, good design, and in general contributes to the image of Santa Monica as a place of beauty, creativity and individuality in that the proposed contemporary building expresses a clear architectural idea and adds to the eclectic design found in the immediate neighborhood. The landscape design incorporates a diverse drought tolerant plant palette that complements the building and buffers the property from adjoining land uses.
- B. The proposed building or structure is not of inferior quality such as to cause the nature of the local neighborhood or environment to materially depreciate in

appearance and value in that high quality materials such as anodized aluminum windows, smooth steel troweled stucco and bush hammered and sandblasted stone façade are proposed in the application submittal and as presented to the Architectural Review Board will be used.

- C. The proposed design of the building or structure is compatible with developments on land in the general area in that the perceived mass and scale are addressed through various design techniques, including use of colors, materials, fenestration pattern, and building form. The proposed design is compatible with surrounding developments as other contemporary buildings exist in the neighborhood. The proposed project is also compliant with the Zoning Ordinance in terms of number of units, setback, height, and parking requirements.
- D. The proposed development conforms to the effective guidelines and standards adopted pursuant to Chapter 9.55 – *Architectural Review Board*, and all other applicable ordinances insofar as the location and appearance of the buildings and structures are involved. Specifically, the location and appearance of the buildings and structures comply with required findings set forth in Chapter 9.55, as documented by the Architectural Review Board, and as conditioned, the plans will fully comply with all applicable regulations prior to the issuance of a building permit.

CONDITIONS:

- 1. All details including windows, doors, roof top screening, and other unique conditions shall be provided to staff for review and approval prior to plan check submittal to ensure high quality details for proper implementation.
- 2. Prior to submittal for building permit, the applicant shall provide a lighting plan with a photometric study for approval by staff to ensure adequate lighting on site.
- 3. Stucco used shall be smooth steel troweled finish.
- 4. This approval shall expire when the administrative or discretionary entitlements, not including any Subdivision Map approvals, previously granted for the project have lapsed. If no such entitlements have been granted, this approval shall expire 24 months from its effective date, or 30 months if in the Coastal Zone unless appealed.
- 5. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall demonstrate landscape and irrigation plan compliance with the City’s Green Building Ordinance standards (SMMC 8.108) subject to staff approval. Modifications to the landscape plan that effect less than 150 square feet of area may be reviewed and approved by the Staff Liaison to the Board.
- 6. Prior to the issuance of a building permit a hydrozone matrix shall be included in the landscape and irrigation plans that describes for each hydrozone the following: the square footage, percentage of total landscaped area, plant type and plant form, hydrozone basis, hydrozone description, exposure or micro-climate, irrigation

method, irrigation devices (including manufacturer, make and model), zone pressure, precipitation rates, zone gallons per minute and controller station numbers.

7. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall demonstrate that the plans comply with all applicable provisions of the Zoning Ordinance. Significant changes to a project's design shall require review and approval of the Architectural Review Board. Minor changes may be approved administratively pursuant to all applicable guidelines.

The Architectural Review Board's approval, conditions of approval, or denial of this application may be appealed to the Planning Commission if the appeal is filed with the Zoning Administrator within ten consecutive days following the date of the Architectural Review Board's determination in the manner provided in SMMC 9.61.100.

Attachments

Applicant's Submittal Material

F:\CityPlanning\Share\ARB\STFRPT\SR19\19RB-0546 (949 10th Street).doc