

SUSTAINABLE CITY PROGRESS REPORT

***Initial Progress Report on Santa Monica's Sustainable City
Program***

December 1996

*City of Santa Monica
Task Force on the Environment*

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Santa Monica Task Force on the Environment

Current Members

Mark Gold (Chair) - Director, Heal the Bay

Steve Davis - Architect, former Chair of the Santa Monica Chamber of
Commerce Environmental Affairs Committee

Bob Gottlieb - Professor of Urban Planning, UCLA

Miriam Koral - Environmental Consultant, Koral & Company

Bill Selby - Professor of Earth Sciences, Santa Monica College

April Smith - Environmental Consultant, Rethink, Inc.

Linda Waade - Director, Coalition for Clean Air

Past Members

Gero Leson - Energy Consultant

David Phillips - Chair, Psychology Dept., Santa Monica College

Lisa Weil - American Oceans Campaign

This report was prepared by:

Dean Kubani
Environmental Programs Division
City of Santa Monica
200 Santa Monica Pier
Santa Monica, CA 90401
(310) 458-2227

under the guidance of the Task Force on the Environment

Review, input and assistance were provided by members of the Task Force on the Environment and City staff from the following departments: City Clerk's Office, City Manager's Office, Community and Cultural Services, Environmental and Public Works Management, Finance, Fire, Library, Planning and Community Development, Police, Rent Control, Resource Management, and Transportation. Additional research assistance was provided by intern Adam Diamond.

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

Introduction

In September 1994, Santa Monica's City Council adopted the Santa Monica Sustainable City Program. This program was developed by the City's Task Force on the Environment and City staff as a way to create the basis for a more sustainable way of life - one that safeguards and enhances our resources, prevents harm to the natural environment and human health, and sustains and benefits the community and local economy - for the sake of current and future generations. This report assesses the City's progress in implementing the Sustainable City Program and meeting the program's goals.

General Findings

- The City is currently implementing numerous effective sustainable programs and policies in most areas of City operations.
- The City has made significant progress towards meeting the indicator targets for Water Usage, Landfilled Solid Waste, City Fleet Vehicles Using Reduced-Emission Fuels, Wastewater Flows, Average Vehicle Ridership of Employers with over 50 Employees, Dry Weather Stormdrain Discharges to the Ocean, Deed-Restricted Affordable Housing Units, and Public Open Space.
- Little or no progress has been made towards meeting the indicator targets for Energy Usage, Ridership on Santa Monica Municipal Bus Lines, Community Gardens, and Implementation of a Sustainable Schools Program.
- Progress cannot be adequately measured, or outside variables affect the City's ability to meet, the indicator targets for Postconsumer Recycled Content of City Paper Purchases, Trees in Public Spaces, Use of Hazardous Materials city-wide, and Known Underground Storage Tanks Sites Requiring Cleanup.
- Despite the progress made towards meeting the various indicator targets, sustainable policies and programs are still being undertaken on a "piecemeal" basis within the City. Coordinated implementation of the Sustainable City Program within the City has not yet been achieved. Many City staff are currently not aware of the program, and most of those that are aware of it do not see it as a high priority. To date, little or no effort has been made to merge the goals and objectives of the Sustainable City Program with the goals and objectives presented in the elements of the City's General Plan, Consolidated Plan, and various strategic plans for Human Services within the city. This situation is due to the fact that the implementation plan developed for the Sustainable City Program has not been systematically carried out, staff responsibility for implementing the program has never been adequately defined, and staffing and funding necessary to properly implement the program have not been identified.
- To date, little or no effort has been made to involve the Business Community, School District, Santa Monica College, Local Non-Profit Groups and residents in the program. As a result the program is not well known or understood in the community and thus, is not fully serving the community. This situation is also due to poor implementation and the lack of adequate staffing and funding to effectively implement the program.

General Recommendations

- 1.) An updated implementation plan should be developed for the Sustainable City Program. This plan should: include specific action plans for meeting the Sustainable City indicator targets and for

integrating the program into City operations; identify specific staff responsibilities; set a realistic timeline for implementation; and develop a program budget outlining staffing and funding needs related to program implementation.

- 2.) The goals and objectives of the Sustainable City Program should be merged with goals and objectives outlined in the elements of the City's General Plan, Consolidated Plan, and Human Services Strategic Plans. This can be accomplished by meeting with staff from appropriate departments/divisions and with appropriate City Commissions to develop additional indicator targets based on the targets set in these various plans. This process will help to integrate the program into the City's planning process and daily operations, will begin the process of educating staff and the general public about the program and give them more of a stake in the program.
- 3.) The Sustainable City Program presents objectives both for City operations and for the entire community. To date there has been little or no community involvement in the program. City staff and the Task Force on the Environment should begin to investigate options and develop a plan for increasing community involvement in the program. One option for this is to create a Sustainable City Roundtable, with representatives from the Chamber of Commerce and the local business community, the School Board and School District, Santa Monica College, neighborhood organizations, local non-profit organizations, various City Commissions and City Council to gather public input, set community-wide program priorities, and oversee the implementation of the program.

Policy Areas Summaries

SOLID WASTE AND RECYCLING

Adopted Indicator

Using 1990 as a baseline, reduce the volume of landfilled solid waste by 25% by 1995 and 50% by the year 2000.

Progress Towards Goal

Santa Monica's 1990 baseline is 124,000 tons of solid waste. The target for 1995 was that amount less 25% or 93,000 tons. The year 2000 target is 62,000 tons. In 1995 Santa Monica landfilled 93,178 tons of solid waste, representing a 24.9% reduction below the 1990 baseline. Over the 5 year period, total waste generation in the city increased from 124,000 tons in 1990 to 126,571 tons in 1995. In order to achieve the 25% reduction goal, the city would have had to divert 26.6% of its waste in 1995.

Obstacles

• **Limited Participation of Commercial and Industrial Sector**

The Recycling Division has identified that the main obstacle to achieving the City's waste reduction goals is the current limited participation of the commercial and industrial sector in waste diversion efforts. The commercial and industrial sector is responsible for approximately 72% of the solid waste generated in Santa Monica but diverted from landfills only about 17% of that in 1995. By comparison, the residential sector achieved a 48% diversion rate for 1995. The Division began a free commercial recycling program in January 1995 that has increased commercial waste diversion and feels that continuation and expansion of this program will help to overcome this obstacle.

• **Scavenging**

Scavenging of recyclables from City bins has become a significant problem, particularly in the last year as prices for recyclable materials have increased. In 1994 the City collected 5881 tons of recyclables from drop off bins and curbside pickup while 4572 tons of recyclables were delivered by residents and scavengers to the buy-back facility. For the first 7 months of 1995, however, the City collected only 1799 tons while the buy-back center took in 8311 tons. Scavenging doesn't have an impact on the City's waste diversion goals because the scavenged materials do get recycled, however it means lost revenues for the City that would have been used to offset program costs. The Solid Waste Division has begun working with the Police Department to crack down on scavengers in the city.

• **Waste Generation by City Departments**

Because City departments have never been required to pay for waste disposal, they have had no incentive to integrate vigorous waste reduction measures and recycling into their operations. To overcome this obstacle, the Environmental and Public Works Management Department began charging all departments waste disposal fees for all refuse dumped at the City Yards as of July 1, 1996.

Recommendations

- 1.) Waste diversion by the commercial and industrial sector should be carefully tracked over the next year to determine if the Recycling Division's educational and outreach efforts have been effective at increasing diversion. If no significant improvement is attained, the Recycling Division should investigate additional educational and/or policy measures to encourage waste reduction in these sectors.

- 2.) Development of a curbside green waste collection program should be made a priority for FY 1996-97.
- 3.) Development of a backyard composting demonstration site should be made a priority for FY 1996-97.
- 4.) The Recycling and Environmental Programs Divisions should begin working with other City departments to help identify and implement additional waste reduction measures for City operations.

WATER

Adopted Indicator

Using 1990 as a baseline, reduce city-wide potable water usage by 20% by the year 2000.

Progress Towards Goals

Santa Monica's 1990 baseline is 14.3 million gallons per day (mgd). The 20% reduction target for the year 2000 is 11.4 mgd. From 1990 to 1991 city-wide water use dropped almost 22 percent, from 14.3 mgd to 11.2 mgd in response to the City-mandated 20 percent cutback in water use instituted because of the drought. Since then, city-wide water use has risen incrementally each year, following the repeal of the mandatory cutbacks at the end of the drought in 1992. Water use in 1995 averaged 12.3 mgd, representing a reduction of 14 percent from 1990 levels but a 7 percent increase since 1991.

Water use and wastewater flows have both significantly dropped since 1990, demonstrating the overall effectiveness of the City's water conservation programs and policies. However, a decrease in wastewater flows between 1993 and 1995 and the increase in overall water use over the same period indicates that the programs and policies targeting indoor water conservation (water that drains to the sewer system) have been more successful than those targeting outdoor uses (water that drains to stormdrains or evaporates). It is likely that increases in landscape irrigation and other outdoor water uses are primarily responsible for the recent increases in city-wide water use. The City's new water rate structure should help to reduce these outdoor uses.

Obstacles

• **Poor Commercial Participation in the Baysaver Toilet Retrofit Program**

While the program has exceeded its goal to replace 50 percent of all residential toilets in the city, it has fallen short of meeting its 25 percent target for commercial retrofits. This is likely due to the fact that water costs for commercial uses represent a smaller percentage of overhead costs than they do for residential uses, making toilet retrofits a low priority for commercial customers. The Environmental Programs Division is addressing this situation by targeting commercial users with its no-interest/low-interest water-efficiency loan program and with a new, comprehensive water-efficiency audit program.

• **Poor Compliance with the No Water Waste Ordinance**

Water Conservation inspectors have reported generally poor compliance with the City's No Water Waste Ordinance, particularly with the restrictions on landscape watering and hosing down of driveways and sidewalks. This is attributed to a lack of public awareness about the ordinance as well as insufficient enforcement due to a lack of inspectors.

Recommendations

- 1.) If the City is to achieve its 20 percent water-use reduction goal it needs to focus on reducing outdoor water-use. It is anticipated that the new conservation-based water rate structure will help to accomplish this. It is recommended that water-use be evaluated after the new rates have been in effect for one year to determine the effect the rates have had on water use. If no significant improvement is attained, the City should then investigate additional educational and/or policy measures to encourage reductions in outdoor water use.
- 2.) Additional efforts should be made to educate the public about the No Water Waste Ordinance and to investigate ways to improve enforcement of the ordinance.

ENERGY

Adopted Indicator

Using 1990 usage as a baseline, reduce citywide energy usage by 16% by the year 2000.

Progress Towards Goal

The 1990 baseline for citywide energy use of 4.0 million mBTUs and the 16% reduction target were found to be based on incorrect data. Correct energy use data has been compiled and indicates that there have been fluctuations on the order of 15% to 20% in citywide energy use between 1990 and 1995. The causes of these fluctuations are not presently understood, and therefore further analysis of Santa Monica's energy profile is required to determine whether the current 16 % energy efficiency goal by the year 2000 is measurable and appropriate, or if an alternative goal should be identified and adopted. It is not likely that the fluctuations in energy use can be attributed to the Sustainable City Program because the City has not yet developed or implemented a citywide energy efficiency plan, and the City's existing energy efficiency programs would not result in changes of the magnitude seen here.

Obstacles

It is anticipated that restructuring of the state's electrical utility industry beginning in 1998 will lead to significantly lower electricity prices. These reduced prices will tend to diminish or eliminate the monetary incentive for energy customers to conserve electricity, which will likely impair the City's efforts to reduce citywide energy use. In addition, the reduced efficiency incentives, coupled with the uncertainty about the ultimate effects of the restructuring process, will make it difficult for the City to accurately predict the effectiveness of future citywide energy efficiency initiatives.

Recommendations

- 1.) Environmental and Public Works Management staff should develop and implement a citywide Energy Efficiency Plan that includes an analysis of existing citywide energy use, a re-evaluation of the Sustainable City Program indicator target, a strategy for encouraging energy conservation by commercial and residential customers in Santa Monica, and an implementation timeline.
- 2.) Following completion of the greenhouse gas emission analysis for the city and development of an emission reduction plan, the emission reduction target adopted in the plan should be incorporated as an indicator for the Sustainable City Program.
- 3.) Should the City proceed with development of the Public Safety Facility at the Civic Center, it is recommended that the Total Energy Services approach be incorporated in the development of the facility, since this approach will provide a cost-effective method of financing the energy systems within the structure and an incentive-based contract for operation and maintenance services and procurement of energy supply.

PURCHASING

Adopted Indicator

Achieve a 50% average post-consumer recycled and/or tree-free content in all City office paper purchases by the year 2000.

Progress Towards Goals

It is difficult to determine an accurate single value for the percentage of post-consumer recycled content because the percentages vary with the type of paper product purchased, however, a weighted averaging of the collected data results in an average post-consumer recycled content of approximately 22% for FY 93-94 City office paper purchases. Due to the difficulty in tracking purchasing data, no figures are available for FY 94-95 or FY 95-96.

Although no formal policy exists, the Purchasing Division is currently buying paper with the highest percentage of post-consumer content available that “reasonably approximates” the price of comparable virgin products. Currently, white copy paper that meets these requirements contains 30% post-consumer material. Other categories of recycled paper products being bought by the City contain between 10% and 15% post-consumer material. With the current policy in place, meeting the Sustainable City Program indicator target for paper purchases entirely depends upon the availability of paper with 50% post-consumer or tree-free content that reasonably approximates the price of virgin paper in the year 2000.

Obstacles

• **Tracking and Record Keeping**

The City Finance Department’s computer system does not have the capability to access annual purchase amount and cost information for individual categories of goods or services. The only current way to obtain this information is to manually sort through hard copy purchase order records which is very labor intensive and time consuming. This makes it difficult to determine the progress on the recycled paper indicator and discourages the setting of any other purchasing-related indicators. The City is currently purchasing a variety of products containing recycled materials including motor oil, paint, trash can liners, and refuse carts but due to this situation the amounts and costs of these products cannot be easily tracked.

• **City Staff Awareness/Lack of Enforcement**

The Purchasing Task Group has determined that other than tracking capability, the biggest obstacle to the effective implementation of policies to promote the purchase of environmentally-preferable goods and services is lack of staff awareness, both about the City’s policies and product availability. Purchasing Division staff have reported that due to a lack of awareness about City purchasing policies and the lack of enforcement mechanisms, City staff often do not follow existing purchasing policies. This is particularly prevalent in purchases made with petty cash and QPOs because Purchasing Division staff don't see the paperwork until after the purchases have been made.

• **Implementation of the Recycled Products Procurement Policy**

This informal policy identifies important criteria to be considered in selecting products including the ability of a product and its packaging to be reused or recycled, and the volume and toxicity of waste a given product and its packaging generates due to its manufacture, use and disposal. These criteria are necessary and many others could be added to the list, however, Purchasing Division staff have neither the time nor the expertise to address them so they are typically overlooked. In addition, the end users requesting the products typically aren’t aware of the policy and of the recycled products available that can meet their needs. Because this policy has not been formalized, Purchasing staff are not in a position to enforce it.

Recommendations

- 1.) Development of tracking capability for City purchases should be made a high priority. The Purchasing Task Group should determine if the existing Financial Management System can be cost-effectively upgraded to include a commodity code system to track annual purchase amounts and cost information. If this is not feasible, it is recommended that a new system with tracking capability be purchased as soon as possible. Information Systems staff have indicated that funds for a consultant to specify a new system to replace the Financial Management System have been included in the FY 1996-97 budget and funds for the new system will be included in the FY 1997-98 budget. The Purchasing Task Group, as well as staff from Purchasing, Information Systems, Environmental Programs and various other user groups should be involved in the development of specifications for this system.
- 2.) The Purchasing Division should work on developing and expanding its in-house computer system to track QPOs using commodity codes.
- 3.) The Purchasing Task Group should continue to meet to determine ways to improve staff awareness and to improve existing purchasing policies. The group should determine the feasibility of: formalizing the currently informal Recycled Products Procurement Policy as an administrative instruction or through Council approval to provide Purchasing staff with a method of enforcement; revising the Purchasing Division's definition of the term "responsible bid" to include some level of environmental performance; and requiring suppliers to provide the City with annual summaries of the products supplied, with recycled or environmentally preferable products highlighted to help track purchases from outside vendors. The group should also identify and prioritize categories of goods and services for future development of sustainable purchasing criteria. Additional indicators should be developed based on the group's recommendations.
- 4.) Because attainment of the paper purchasing indicator target is limited by current City purchasing policies and the cost of recycled paper, the target should be reviewed following the adoption of recommendations from the Purchasing Task Group and then revised accordingly.

CONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT

Adopted Indicator

No indicator specifically related to construction and development was adopted as part of the 1994 Sustainable City Program.

Progress Towards Goals

Specific goals have not been set in the Sustainable City Program for construction and development projects. However, construction, development and long-range planning in the city likely have a significant affect on a majority of the program indicators including energy use, water use, volumes of landfilled solid waste, wastewater flow volumes, stormwater discharges, city-wide use of hazardous materials, amount of public open space, and the amount of affordable housing units. The City is currently working with a consultant team to formulate Sustainable Development Guidelines for private and municipal development projects in Santa Monica. These guidelines will incorporate Sustainable City Program indicators as targets and will tie recommended practices to them.

Obstacles

To date, little effort has been made to document the individual or cumulative environmental effects of new development projects as they relate to the Sustainable City Program indicators. Environmental Impact Reports prepared for larger development projects present estimates of projected environmental impacts but these do not specifically address the indicators and they are not measured or verified following

construction. This information is not essential but would be helpful when deciding where to direct future conservation and planning efforts.

It is likely that long range planning also has a significant affect on the resources highlighted by the indicators. However, to date, none of the General Plan elements have been developed with sustainability or the Sustainable City Program indicators in mind.

Recommendations

- 1.) The concept of sustainability should be introduced into the City's short- and long-range planning processes. All City boards, commissions, and staff dealing with construction and development projects should be educated about the Sustainable City Program and should work to incorporate it into their operations. One suggested method to incorporate the goals of the Sustainable City Program into the City's planning process is to use the Sustainable City Program indicators as threshold levels for the CEQA evaluation process.
- 2.) All future updates of planning documents should use the Sustainable City Program as a starting point to ensure that they are in line with the guiding principles, goals and objectives of the program and will help to achieve the indicator targets. Currently the Circulation Element, Open Space Element, and the Housing Element are undergoing comprehensive updates. An update of the Conservation Element is scheduled to begin in late 1996. Staff should investigate ways to best ensure that this occurs and should work with the Task Force on the Environment to provide input to the Planning Department.
- 3.) Following adoption of the Sustainable Development Guidelines, all City-sponsored construction and development projects should incorporate sustainability measures specified in the guidelines. Minimum standards for municipal development projects should be set and a mechanism should be developed to account for possible additional upfront costs that can be offset by operational cost savings.
- 4.) With regard to specific development projects, an investigation into the feasibility of obtaining and compiling performance data should be undertaken, possibly as a component of the Sustainable Development Guidelines, for the purpose of verifying that current programs are effective and to provide input for future policy decisions.

TRANSPORTATION

Adopted Indicators

- Using 1990 figures as a baseline, increase ridership on Santa Monica Municipal Bus Lines (including shuttles) by 10% by the year 2000.
- Achieve an Average Vehicle Ridership (AVR) of 1.5 for all employers in Santa Monica with over 50 employees by the year 2000.
- Convert 75% of the City vehicle fleet to vehicles using reduced-emission fuels by the year 2000.

Progress Towards Goals

• **Santa Monica Municipal Bus Line Ridership**

The 1990 baseline for this indicator is 19 million riders. The targeted 10% increase by the year 2000 is 20.9 million riders. Total ridership in 1995 was 17.875 million riders. This represents a decrease in ridership of 5.9% from the baseline.

• **City-wide Average Vehicle Ridership for Employers with >50 Employees**

Prior to the implementation of the City's Transportation Management Plan Ordinance in 1993, city-wide AVR was 1.29. In 1994, after one year of program implementation the figure had risen to 1.34. By July 1995, city-wide AVR had reached 1.37. Staff from the City's Transportation Management Office expect city-wide AVR to continue rising and believe the indicator goal will be attained, barring any changes in State legislation.

• **Fleet Vehicles**

In 1993, 10% of the City's fleet operated on reduced-emission fuel (REF)s. In 1995, 15% of the City's fleet had been converted and by the beginning of 1996 that number had risen to 21.7%, with 127 out of a total of 585 vehicles operating on REFs. Fleet Management staff indicate that approximately 70 to 80 gasoline or diesel-fueled fleet vehicles will be replaced with REF vehicles in FY 1996-97. With the implementation of the planned Fleet Management Program which began in July 1996 staff fully expect the City will reach the 75% indicator goal by the year 2000.

Obstacles

• **Bus Ridership**

Ridership on the SMMBL significantly decreased between 1991 and 1994 and is currently 5.9% below the 1990 baseline. Transportation Department staff attribute this decrease to effects of the economic recession. In FY1994 and FY1995 ridership began to increase as the economy began to improve. These recent fluctuations indicate that ridership is dependent on several variables, many of which are out of the City's control. These variables may complicate the City's efforts to achieve its indicator goal.

In an effort to improve service and increase ridership, the Transportation Department began an outreach program in March 1996. Transportation staff feel that this outreach effort, the development and implementation of service improvements, and increased marketing efforts will help to continue the current upward trend in ridership.

• **Proposed State Legislation Affecting the City's TMP Ordinance**

The City's Transportation Management Coordinator has indicated that several bills are pending in the State legislature which would prohibit Air Districts and local governments from imposing mandatory

requirements on California businesses for the purpose of reducing air pollution. If any of this pending legislation is signed into law the City may be required to repeal or significantly modify its Transportation Management Plan Ordinance which currently requires employers of more than 10 employees to submit annual emissions reduction plans. If this occurs it would significantly impair the City's efforts to meet the Sustainable City Program goal of city-wide AVR of 1.5 by the year 2000.

• **REF Vehicle Purchase and User Acceptance**

Since the implementation of the REF Policy for Vehicle Purchases, staff have encountered the following problems related to vehicle purchase and user acceptance:

- REF Vehicle Availability - Staff has found it difficult at times to find REF vehicles that meet the City's specifications and requirements, particularly for specialty vehicles and heavy equipment.
- REF Vehicle Performance - Particularly in the early stages of implementation of the REF vehicle purchasing policy, users reported performance problems such as poor acceleration and limited range from some of the REF vehicles. These were most often propane vehicles or vehicles that had been converted from gasoline or diesel use to REF, particularly large specialty vehicles. Performance of the more recently acquired vehicles and dedicated CNG vehicles is reported to be much more satisfactory.
- User Acceptance - Due to performance problems with some of the early vehicles, some users have developed a negative view of REF vehicles and don't wish to use them in the future.

These obstacles are primarily due to the newness of the REF technology and Santa Monica's position as a leader in the purchase and operation of REF vehicles. Staff reports that these obstacles are gradually being overcome as REF vehicle technology improves and more and better vehicles are becoming available.

Recommendations

1.) Bus Ridership

The Transportation Department's outreach program and Service Improvement Plan should be given high priority and support, as its purpose is to improve service and increase bus ridership. Because the City is behind schedule on this goal due to past ridership decreases, this indicator should be carefully monitored and future decreases should be analyzed to pinpoint the cause and identify changes necessary to reverse the trend.

2.) Transportation Management

City staff should investigate various avenues to oppose the pending State legislation that threatens to significantly impair the City's efforts to reach its city-wide AVR target. This might include passage of a motion by Council expressing the City's opposition to the legislation and support of lobbying efforts in Sacramento.

3.) Fleet Management Program

As this program is designed to ensure that the City meets its 75% REF vehicle goal, it should be given full support and implemented as a high priority. The program should be annually monitored to ensure that it meets its annual targets and remains on course.

4.) Bicycle Master Plan

In light of the fact that this plan represents a scaled back version of the original plan, every effort should be made to fully implement the plan's recommendations. In addition, the City should conduct an assessment to determine the city-wide change in bicycle ridership due to implementation of the Bicycle Master Plan.

HAZARDOUS MATERIALS

Adopted Indicators

- Using 1990 as a baseline, reduce the city-wide consumption of hazardous materials by 15% by the year 2000.
- Using 1993 figures as a baseline, remediate and close 75% of all known underground storage tank contamination sites by the year 2000.

Progress Towards Goals

• **City-wide Use of Hazardous Materials**

No reliable data on the city-wide use of hazardous materials currently exists, therefore a baseline figure for this indicator has not yet been determined. In addition, it is unlikely that the City will be able to obtain quantifiable data for this indicator in the foreseeable future, due to the difficulty in tracking purchases and measuring use.

• **Known Underground Storage Tank (UST) Sites Requiring Cleanup**

This indicator calls for a 75% reduction in the number of UST sites in the City requiring cleanup, from 25 in 1993 to 6 by the year 2000. The baseline of 25 refers to the sites that are under the regulatory jurisdiction of the City of Santa Monica. In 1995, the number of sites requiring cleanup was 18, a reduction of 28% from 1993. Of these 18 active sites, six are currently being remediated, and five are undergoing investigation to determine the extent of contamination and develop remediation plans. Site investigation has not yet begun at the seven other sites.

Obstacles

• **Tracking of City Hazardous Materials Purchases**

The City's financial management computer system currently does not have the capability to access annual purchase amount and cost information for individual categories of goods and services. As a consequence, staff is currently unable to track the purchase and use of hazardous materials within City operations. Staff are addressing the tracking issue and hope to develop tracking capability within the next year.

• **Variables Related to Contaminated Site Clean Up**

Attainment of the 75% reduction goal for contaminated sites requiring cleanup is somewhat outside of the City's control because of the relatively slow and variable pace of site remediation and because new underground storage tank leaks may occur at any time, increasing the number of sites requiring cleanup. However, new state regulations requiring the upgrade of all underground storage tank systems by December 1998 should greatly decrease the likelihood of future underground tank leaks in Santa Monica.

• **Inadequate Training of Janitorial Staff in the Use of Alternative Cleaning Products**

Staff have observed many janitors improperly applying alternative cleaning products, leading to product waste, janitor skepticism regarding the efficacy of the products, and in some cases, reversion back to the use of conventional toxic cleaning products. While all City janitors have received training on the proper use of the alternative products, refresher courses would be helpful in improving overall staff use of the products.

• **Inconsistent Availability of Alternative Cleaning Products in the City Warehouse**

All City Janitorial staff have been directed to obtain their cleaning products from the City warehouse, which stocks alternative cleaning products exclusively. However, staff have reported that the warehouse often does not have adequate stock on hand, causing the janitors to purchase conventional, toxic cleaning products from outside vendors. These availability problems have lead some janitors to avoid the warehouse altogether and purchase exclusively from outside vendors.

- **Lack of Participation in the Conditionally Exempt Small Quantity Generator (CESQG) Program**

Very few businesses have participated in the CESQG program since it began in 1994. For FY 1995-96, only 21 businesses participated in the program. It is likely that this is due to a general lack of awareness about the program and about the true costs of hazardous waste disposal.

- **Inadequate Training of Fire Department Inspectors**

Fire Department inspectors visit Santa Monica businesses that store and use hazardous materials to verify volumes and types of material stored as part of the Community Right to Know program as well to enforce fire code regulations pertaining to hazardous materials storage. Until recently, these inspectors have not had sufficient training or expertise to adequately conduct these inspections. The inspectors are now receiving detailed hazardous materials training in an effort to remedy this situation.

- **Lack of Enforcement of Ozone-Depleting Compound Ordinance**

Currently the Environmental Programs Division has one staff member who conducts hazardous materials - related inspections as part of the Consumer Awareness Ordinance. This staff person has not been trained to enforce the Ozone-Depleting Compound (ODC) Ordinance and is unable to commit sufficient time to conduct full ODC inspections.

Recommendations

1.) Hazardous Materials Indicators

Because the City has been unable to develop an accurate baseline figure for the indicator targeting a 15% decrease in city-wide hazardous materials use, it is recommended that this indicator be withdrawn and replaced with two indicators that target hazardous materials use in City operations only, which can be more easily measured. The following indicators are proposed: *(1) A 10% reduction in the amount of hazardous waste generated by City operations by the year 2000, using 1996 figures as a baseline* and *(2) A 10% reduction in the amount of hazardous materials purchased by the year 2000, using 1998 as a baseline.*

It is also recommended that an additional underground storage tank indicator be adopted that reads: *Prior to December 22, 1998, all publicly and privately owned underground storage tanks shall either be removed from the ground, upgraded or replaced with systems in compliance with the new federal UGT standards.*

2.) CESQG Program

To help increase awareness about this program among the Santa Monica business community, it is recommended that Environmental Programs Division staff work with the Industrial Waste Division and the Fire Department to encourage their inspectors to distribute program information during inspections of regulated businesses.

3.) Janitor Training

It is recommended that Environmental Programs Division staff investigate the possibility of providing the Janitorial staff with refresher courses on the proper use of the alternative cleaning products, either on an annual or biannual basis.

4.) Tracking of City Hazardous Materials Purchases

It is recommended that developing the capability of the City's financial management computer system to track hazardous materials purchases be made a priority for the coming year.

5.) Warehouse

It is recommended that the Maintenance Management Division, which oversees operation of the warehouse, investigate ways to improve inventory control and work with the Environmental Programs Division staff to educate warehouse staff about the types and uses of stocked cleaning products. Maintenance Management staff have indicated that a new computer system is currently being installed at the warehouse which should help to alleviate the inventory problems.

STORMWATER, WASTEWATER AND SANTA MONICA BAY

Adopted Indicators

- Using 1990 figures as a baseline, reduce the total volume of dry weather stormdrain discharges to the ocean by 60% by the year 2000.
- Using 1990 figures as a baseline, reduce city-wide wastewater flows by 15% by the year 2000.

Progress Towards Goals

• **Stormwater**

The 1990 baseline of 500,000 gallons per day (gpd) for this indicator is based on visual estimates and estimates calculated from pumping rates at the Pico-Kenter outfall and so the total discharge from all five Santa Monica stormdrains is not known to any degree of accuracy. In addition, dry weather flow rates from stormdrains are not static but fluctuate significantly due to variable rainfall amounts and groundwater levels, water main breaks, and other external factors. Therefore, although the dry weather diversion of the Pico-Kenter and Pier stormdrains has significantly reduced discharge to the Bay, it is not known by how much.

• **Wastewater**

The Wastewater indicator calls for a 15% reduction in wastewater flow, from 10.4 million gpd in 1990 to the target of 8.8 million gpd in 2000. The City surpassed this target with a 17% reduction to 8.6 million gpd in 1991 and has maintained or exceeded this level since then. The wastewater flows for 1994 averaged 8.3 million gpd and dropped to 8.2 million gpd for the first eight months of 1995. The reduced wastewater flows are likely due to reduction in city-wide water usage due to the City's various water conservation programs and policies.

Obstacles

• **Implementation and Enforcement of Urban Runoff Ordinance**

City Engineers began implementing this ordinance in April 1993. An analysis of the implementation and enforcement of the ordinance in 1995 revealed the following problems:

Enforcement - Currently there are no field inspectors monitoring projects under construction for compliance with the terms of the ordinance. And while Engineering plan checkers have been reviewing plans for new development projects to ensure that they comply with the required 20% runoff reduction, no field inspections have been performed to verify that the runoff reduction measures have actually been completed.

Runoff Calculations - Although a sample calculation for maximum allowable runoff is distributed to developers with the ordinance, to date all of the submittals received by the City have used different methods to calculate maximum allowable runoff for the sites, producing widely differing results. In an effort to eliminate this problem the City has developed a simplified and standardized calculation form.

Record Keeping - It has been difficult to determine the number of new developments that have been subject to the ordinance because the City's current record keeping and filing system doesn't accommodate this program. To solve this problem, the City has developed urban runoff worksheets which will be filed and used for tracking compliance and is developing a new database which includes information on Urban Runoff Mitigation Plans.

Recommendations

- 1.) The Dry Weather Stormdrain Discharge indicator should be revised because stormdrain flow rates vary significantly due to a variety of factors, and because the City currently has no accurate method to measure flow rates. It is recommended to revise this target to read: ***Achieve 100% diversion or treatment of dry weather runoff for all Santa Monica stormdrains from March through November by the year 2000.*** This target will require the City to divert or treat runoff from the Ashland Avenue stormdrain and increase by three months the time that the diversion pumps at Pico Kenter stormdrain are activated.
- 2.) City staff should continue to evaluate the implementation of the Urban Runoff Mitigation Ordinance and investigate ways to improve implementation, enforcement and compliance.

EDUCATION

Adopted Indicator

Create and implement a Sustainable Schools Program in the Santa Monica-Malibu School District by the year 2000.

Progress Towards Goals

To date, a proposal and program format for Sustainable Schools Program have been developed by City staff, with input from SMMUSD staff. The proposal is currently being review by the School Board.

Obstacles

• **Sustainable Schools Program Is Not a SMMUSD Priority**

Based on discussions with SMMUSD staff and School Board members, it is apparent that implementing the Sustainable Schools Program is currently not a high priority for the District. This is primarily due to the large number of other existing and proposed programs competing for staffing and funding. District personnel have also indicated that they are unwilling to commit District funds towards the program. A potential reason for this lack of commitment is that District staff were not adequately involved in the formulation of the program and they have not been fully made aware of the potential benefits of the program.

• **Funding for the Sustainable Schools Program**

The initial Sustainable Schools Program proposal included a budget of \$75,000 to \$95,000 per year for two years to be provided by the City to begin the program. After the first two years, the proposal calls for program staff to obtain outside funding from foundations and other sources to finance the program. Any operational cost savings resulting from the program would also provide a source of funds.

Funding for the first year of the program was included in the City's FY 1996-1997 budget request but it was turned down by City Council. In its place, Council provided \$250,000 to the District to fund one or more Council-specified items, one of them being the Sustainable Schools Program. District staff have prepared proposals to the School Board for each of the funding options specified by Council. The District's revised Sustainable Schools proposal budgets \$50,000 for one year only. The School Board is currently reviewing the proposals. Discussion of the Sustainable Schools proposal at a September 1996 School Board meeting indicated that the Board will not likely fund the program because they feel the revised program budget is too small to develop an effective program. If the proposal is turned down, additional funds would have to be identified in the City budget to fund the program if it is to be implemented during the 1996-1997 school year.

Recommendations

- 1.) If the Sustainable Schools Program is not funded by the School Board, it is recommended that City staff and Task Force members work with the District Administration and staff to revise the program proposal and identify funding for the program for next year. It is strongly recommended that input be obtained from District teachers, administrative staff and School Board members when revising the program proposal. Task Force members and City staff should also work to educate School Board members, City Council members and District staff about the potential environmental and economic benefits of the program.

- 2.) City staff and Task Force members should contact members of the faculty and administration at Santa Monica College to investigate the feasibility of instituting a comprehensive sustainability program at the college.

HOUSING

Adopted Indicators

Using 1990 figures as a baseline, provide an additional 750 deed-restricted affordable housing units in Santa Monica by the year 2000.

Progress Towards Goals

The 1990 baseline of 1172 affordable housing units presented in the 1994 Sustainable City Program document refers to the number of “deed-restricted, publicly assisted” affordable housing units in the City at that time. That baseline figure does not include the number of privately developed deed-restricted units because an inventory of those units had not yet been completed. As of October 1996, the number of publicly-assisted housing units in the City had risen to 1470, an increase of 298 since 1990. Housing Division staff estimate that there are an additional 700 privately developed deed-restricted units in the city.

Obstacles/Needs

Housing needs and obstacles are currently being comprehensively addressed in the update of the City’s Housing Element.

Recommendations

- 1.) The baseline and target for the Deed-Restricted Affordable Housing indicator should be updated upon completion of the City’s 1998-2003 Housing Element in Fall 1997. Staff from the Housing Division should be consulted when developing the new indicator target. This target should be consistent with recommendations in the updated Housing Element.
- 2.) The updated Housing Element should be reviewed when completed to determine if, based on its findings and recommendations, additional indicators for housing can be incorporated into the Sustainable City Program. The Housing Commission and City staff from the Resource Management and Planning and Community Development departments should be consulted during this process.

COMMUNITY AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Adopted Indicators

- Using 1990 figures as a baseline, increase the total amount of public open space in Santa Monica by 16 acres by the year 2000.
- Create three new community gardens in Santa Monica by the year 2000.
- Using 1990 figures as a baseline, increase the number of trees in public spaces by 350 by the year 2000.

Progress Towards Goals

Open Space

This indicator calls for an increase in public open space from 164 acres in 1990 to 180 acres by the year 2000. By 1995 the City's open space inventory had risen to 179.5 acres.

According to standards used by the Santa Monica Recreation and Parks Commission, 2.5 acres of open space should be provided for every 1000 City residents. With an estimated 1995 population of 89,194 residents, this standard currently requires approximately 223 acres of public open space in Santa Monica. Because the City has essentially met its current open space goal, it is recommended that the indicator target be revised to adopt this Recreation and Parks Commission standard. With a projected population of 90,777 residents by the year 2000, the revised target would be 227 acres of open space for the City at that time. The City is currently working to identify additional recreational and open space areas with the revision of the Open Space Element, development of the Recreation and Parks Master Plan, and a study of Airport Residual Lands.

Community Gardens

There are currently two community gardens in Santa Monica. The Sustainable City Program indicator for community gardens calls for the construction of three additional gardens by the year 2000. No additional community gardens have been constructed since the baseline was established in 1993.

Trees

The Sustainable City Program indicator for Trees in Public Spaces calls for an increase of 350 trees by the year 2000 from a baseline of 28,000 trees in 1990. This baseline is an estimate provided by the Parks and Sports Division. A detailed tree inventory has not yet been completed so progress towards this goal cannot be measured. The City is in the process of hiring a Community Forester and is currently developing a Community Forestry Program which will include a detailed inventory of City trees.

Obstacles/Needs

• Open Space

As part of the process to update the City's Open Space Element and develop a Recreation and Parks Master Plan for Santa Monica approximately 3000 residents participated in surveys to determine community open space needs and preferences. Survey results expressed the following community open space needs:

- Existing parks and facilities should be improved and renovated.
- Santa Monica residents desire additional parks and open space.

- There is a strong desire for additional playing fields, recreational facilities and bicycle paths.
- Residents support using public school facilities to expand parks and recreation opportunities for adults and youth.

The primary obstacle to meeting these needs is the lack of available public land in the city. The Recreation and Parks Master Plan currently being developed will address the identified community needs and investigate alternatives to overcome this obstacle.

• **Community Development**

Listed below is a summary of community development and social services needs as identified in the 1995 Consolidated Plan and by Community and Cultural Services Department staff.

- There is a need to strengthen the delivery of services to at-risk youth to address the issues of increased violence, teen pregnancy, poor academic performance, low self-esteem and suicide.
- Quality childcare at affordable rates and childcare centers that offer “non-traditional” hours of operation are needed in the city.
- Additional community facilities and services (especially transportation services) catering to the needs of the elderly residents are needed.
- Affordable and accessible health services, emergency room care, and specialized medical care are needed for the City’s low-income and homeless populations are greatly needed.
- Additional specialized medical care services including medical and social care for persons with HIV and AIDS, drug and alcohol recovery programs, and mental health care programs are needed for Santa Monica residents.
- There is a need to maintain a well-balanced continuum of care for homeless individuals and families to ensure adequate emergency, transitional, and permanent housing, employment and supportive services.
- Additional support services including independent living skills, computer technology, employment and housing are needed for persons with disabilities.
- Additional job training and employment services are needed to help enhance the local economy, reduce unemployment, and reduce the number of Santa Monica residents living below the poverty level.
- Additional legal support, conflict resolution, and counseling services are needed to assist low-income residents and victims of domestic violence.

The primary obstacle to meeting these needs is lack of available funding. Community and Cultural Services staff are currently addressing this obstacle by by seeking funding from federal, state and local sources to expand existing programs to meet these identified needs.

Recommendations

- 1.) The Public Open Space indicator should be revised to coincide with the Recreation and Parks Commission’s standard specifying 2.5 acres of open space be provided for every 1000 city residents. Given Santa Monica’s population projection of 90,777 residents in the year 2000, the revised indicator target will be 227 acres of public open space. If the City Council adopts an alternative target based on

recommendations presented in updated the Open Space Element (scheduled for completion in early 1997) this target should be reviewed and revised with input from the Task Force on the Environment, Community and Cultural Services staff, and the Recreation and Parks Commission.

- 2.) Efforts should be taken to identify space and funding for the construction of three additional community gardens. If an alternative target for community gardens is adopted by City Council based on recommendations in the updated Open Space Element, the Sustainable City Program target should be revised to coincide with the adopted target.
- 3.) The baseline and target of the Trees in Public Spaces indicator should be revised following completion of a detailed City tree inventory and development of the Community Forestry Program. The indicator should be based on accurate baseline conditions and the target should reflect the goals of the Community Forestry Program.
- 4.) The updated Open Space Element and Recreation and Parks Master Plan should be reviewed when completed to determine if, based on the findings and recommendations of those reports, additional indicators for open space can be incorporated into the Sustainable City Program. The Planning Commission, the Recreation and Parks Commission, and City staff from the Community and Cultural Services department should be consulted during this process.
- 5.) The Social Services Commission and staff from the Human Services Division should be consulted about including recommendations and objectives for community and social services presented in the Consolidated Plan as additional indicators for the Sustainable City Program.
- 6.) Staff should investigate the feasibility of instituting an economic development program designed to encourage the siting of "green" businesses in Santa Monica.

INTRODUCTION

INTRODUCTION

In September 1994, Santa Monica's City Council adopted the Santa Monica Sustainable City Program. This program was developed by the City's Task Force on the Environment and City staff as a way to create the basis for a more sustainable way of life - one that safeguards and enhances our resources, prevents harm to the natural environment and human health, and sustains and benefits the community and local economy - for the sake of current and future generations. This report assesses the City's progress in implementing the Sustainable City Program and meeting the program's goals.

Background

"Sustainability" is a word that is growing in use and popularity around the world. It is commonly defined as "the ability to meet current needs without compromising the ability of future generations to do the same". An underlying premise of sustainability is that the economy, the environment and the community are inextricably linked: Humanity's economic future is dependent on the integrity of the Earth's natural systems; a region's economy is dependent on the vitality and well-being of its workforce; and human health and quality of life are directly linked to environmental quality.

By definition, unsustainable practices cannot be maintained over the long-term. Practices such as the use of non-renewable resources and deficit spending are unsustainable because at some point the resource, be it trees, minerals, water or money, will be gone. Likewise, generation of pollution is not sustainable because toxins build up in the environment faster than nature can break them down. Unsustainable practices may provide short-term benefits but also tend to compound problems over time, passing the difficulties (but not the benefits) on to future generations. Sustainable practices, on the other hand, can provide ongoing economic and social benefits without degrading the environment, resulting in short-term and long-term benefits. Examples include the use of non-polluting renewable resources, the re-use of waste products from one process as a resource for another, or paying for growth and development with savings generated through operational efficiencies.

Because society has succeeded in postponing many of the consequences of unsustainable practices through the use of technology or other methods, we have removed these consequences from our immediate visibility. This has tended to allow those unsustainable practices that provide acceptable short-term benefits to perpetuate. Due to this situation, switching to more sustainable practices often requires fundamental changes to existing social and economic infrastructure and ways of thinking.

In 1992 the Task Force on the Environment began developing the Sustainable City Program in an effort to address this situation and to move Santa Monica towards sustainability. The underlying premise of the program is to address the root causes of problems rather than treat the symptoms of those problems, and to provide criteria for evaluating long-term rather than short-term impacts of decisions. With the help of local residents, through workshops, surveys, community meetings, and ongoing participation, the Task Force compiled a vision of sustainability for Santa Monica and developed a set of guiding principles and goals to help achieve that vision. The adopted program set internal and citywide goals in four main areas: Resource Conservation, Transportation, Pollution Prevention and Public Health Protection, and Community and Economic Development. Sixteen numerical "sustainability indicators" were developed as a means to measure progress towards meeting these goals.

Sustainable City Progress Report

This report is a progress report on the Sustainable City Program and is intended to provide the City Council and the general public with an overview of current and planned sustainability efforts in Santa Monica as well as an assessment of progress made by the City towards meeting the program goals over the past two years. The report includes an explanation and updated table of sustainability indicators which presents the

1990 baseline data, data for calendar years 1993 and 1995, and the targets for the year 2000 for the sixteen original indicators. The table also includes new and revised indicators that have been developed based on public input and Task Force and City staff recommendations.

The main body of the report presents a general discussion of program implementation as well as a detailed analysis of the City's efforts in addressing various policy areas related to sustainability. Eleven policy areas are addressed in four sections, corresponding to the four main Sustainable City Program areas. The Resource Conservation section includes chapters on Solid Waste and Recycling, Water, Energy, Purchasing, and Construction and Development. The section on Transportation contains one chapter that includes information on City fleet vehicles, transportation management programs, and public transportation. The section covering Pollution Prevention and Public Health Protection includes chapters on Stormwater, Wastewater and Santa Monica Bay, and Hazardous Materials. The final section covers Community and Economic Development and includes chapters on Education, Housing, and Community and Economic Development (which includes information on parks and open space, social services, and economic development).

Each chapter contains a discussion of the background, existing programs and policies, accomplishments, and progress towards goals relevant to the policy area being addressed. Specific City department programs are also highlighted in each chapter as appropriate. Unless otherwise noted, information provided in the chapters describes the current situation as of November 1996. Recognizing that there are competing interests that must be balanced in order for the goals to be reached, each chapter includes a discussion of obstacles that need to be addressed and resolved. Future plans developed to help achieve Sustainable City Program goals, and the recommendations of the Task Force on the Environment, are also discussed for each policy area.

Implementation of the Sustainable City Program is an ongoing and evolving process that is shaped by public input and participation. The City and the Task Force welcome your thoughts and comments about the direction of the program. Written comments should be sent to the Task Force on the Environment, care of the City of Santa Monica, Environmental Programs Division, 200 Santa Monica Pier, Santa Monica, CA 90401. Comments can also be faxed to the Task Force at (310) 393-1279. For additional copies of this report, copies of the 1994 Sustainable City Program document, or additional information, please contact the Environmental Programs Division at (310) 458-2227.

SUSTAINABILITY INDICATORS

SUSTAINABILITY INDICATORS

Indicators are numerical tools that are used to measure a variety of economic, social, environmental, and political trends. Examples of indicators include the Gross National Product (GNP), crime rates, the Dow Jones Industrial Average, population figures, and annual rainfall measurements. Evaluation of indicators over time allows the user to assess the progress, health or direction of the system being measured (e.g. the economy, an eco-system, or a sector of society).

Sustainability indicators for a community are used to give an overall indication of that community's economic, environmental and social conditions with respect to sustainability - taken as a whole they tell whether these systems can likely be maintained over the long term or if they are being degraded. Since we can not actually assess when a community has become truly "sustainable", sustainability indicators can not tell us how far we have to go but they can let us know if we are moving in the right direction.

The Task Force on the Environment and City staff, with input from local residents, initially developed sixteen sustainability indicators to measure the City's progress towards becoming more sustainable as a result of the Sustainable City Program. The indicators that were chosen had to meet the following criteria:

- The indicator reflects something fundamental to the long-term economic, environmental or social health of the community.
- The indicator is statistically measurable - either data exists or a practical method of data collection can be created.
- The indicator represents something that can be influenced by community or government actions.

The list developed is by no means exhaustive, nor does it cover every environmental, economic or social consideration in the city, but it does provide a starting point for evaluation of the program.

For each indicator a 1990 baseline was developed and a target for the year 2000 was set. In some cases indicator targets were chosen to reflect existing adopted or mandated goals, such as the target for landfilled solid waste which is mandated by state law. In other cases targets reflect established or informal City department goals. And others were chosen that simply appeared to the Task Force and City staff to be aggressive yet realistic and achievable.

The tables on the following pages include baseline and target information as well as data for calendar year 1993 and 1995 for each of the sixteen original indicators. A table of new and revised indicators is also included with proposed baseline and target data. Indicators were revised or new indicators were created in cases where measurement of the existing indicator was problematic or targets had been met. It is anticipated that as the program progresses, new indicators will be added to this list.

A general summary of Sustainable City Program progress as measured by the indicators is presented below:

- The City has made significant progress towards meeting the indicator targets for Water Usage, Landfilled Solid Waste, City Fleet Vehicles Using Reduced-Emission Fuels, Wastewater Flows, Average Vehicle Ridership of Employers with over 50 Employees, Dry Weather Stormdrain Discharges to the Ocean*, Deed-Restricted Affordable Housing Units, and Public Open Space.
- Little or no progress has been made towards meeting the indicator targets for Energy Usage, Ridership on Santa Monica Municipal Bus Lines, Community Gardens, and Implementation of a Sustainable Schools Program.

- Progress cannot be adequately measured, or outside variables affect the City's ability to meet, the indicator targets for Postconsumer Recycled Content of City Paper Purchases, Trees in Public Spaces, Use of Hazardous Materials city-wide, and Known Underground Storage Tanks Sites Requiring Cleanup.

Please refer to the indicator footnotes and to the policy area sections of this report for more detailed information on the indicators and the programs and policies that influence them.

* As measured by the revised stormwater indicator.

**SANTA MONICA SUSTAINABLE CITY PROGRAM
SUMMARY OF INDICATORS, BASELINE DATA AND TARGETS**

RESOURCE CONSERVATION

Sustainability Indicator	1990 Baseline	1993	1995	2000 Target
Landfilled Solid Waste (citywide) (tons per year) ¹	124,000	105,400	93,178	62,000
Water Usage (citywide) ² (million gallons per day)	14.3	12.0	12.3	11.4
Energy Usage (citywide) ³ (million mBTUs per year)	6.45	5.10 (1994 data)	5.63	pending
Average Postconsumer Recycled/Tree-Free Content of City Office Paper Purchases ⁴	unknown	22% (FY 93-94)	unknown	50%

¹ Target is mandated by state law and represents a 50% reduction from the 1990 baseline. The 1990 baseline figure set by the state represents the pre-diversion tonnage of solid waste generated in Santa Monica. The amount of landfilled solid waste generated in Santa Monica in 1990 was 107,000 tons.

² Target represents a 20% reduction in citywide potable water use from the 1990 baseline. This was felt to be aggressive yet achievable based on results of existing water conservation programs and anticipated impacts of planned programs.

³ Refers to overall energy usage (electricity and natural gas) in Santa Monica from all non-mobile sources. Original baseline and target for this indicator were based on incorrect data. A new target is currently being developed.

⁴ Target reflects what was thought by The Task Force on the Environment and City staff to be aggressive yet achievable. It will likely be revised based on findings and recommendations of the Purchasing Task Group. For more information please refer to the "Purchasing" section of this report.

TRANSPORTATION

¹ This indicator target, which is mandated by state law, represents a 50% reduction from the 1990 baseline. The 1990 baseline figure set by the state represents the pre-diversion tonnage of solid waste generated in Santa Monica. The amount of landfilled solid waste generated in Santa Monica in 1990 was 107,000 tons. The 1995 figure represents a 24.9% reduction below the 1990 baseline.

² The target for this indicator represents a 20% reduction in citywide potable water use from the 1990 baseline.

³ This indicator refers to overall energy usage (electricity and natural gas) in Santa Monica from all non-mobile sources. The indicator target represents a 16% reduction from the 1990 baseline.

⁴ The target for this indicator will likely be revised based on recommendations of the Purchasing Task Group. For more information please refer to the "Purchasing" section of this report. The 22% figure for FY 1993-94 does not include purchases made using petty cash or quick purchase orders.

Sustainability Indicator	1990 Baseline	1993	1995	2000 Target
Annual Ridership on Santa Monica Municipal Bus Line (including shuttles) ⁵	19.0 million	18.0 million	17.8 million	20.9 million
Average Vehicle Ridership (AVR) of Santa Monica Employers with over 50 Employees ⁶	unknown	1.29	1.37	1.50
% of City Fleet Vehicles Using Reduced-Emission Fuels ⁷	unknown	10%	15%	75%

5 Target represents a 10% increase in bus ridership and reflects Transportation Dept. goals.

6 Target reflects Council-adopted ordinance requirements. No data is presented for 1990 because the City's Transportation Management Ordinance was not in place at that time.

7 Target based on preliminary analysis of the overall potential within the City fleet. As of September 1996, 21.7% of City Fleet Vehicles operated on reduced-emission fuels.

POLLUTION PREVENTION AND PUBLIC HEALTH PROTECTION

Sustainability Indicator	1990 Baseline	1993	1995	2000 Target
Reduction in Citywide Use of Hazardous Materials ⁸	unknown	unknown	unknown	15%
Known Underground Storage Tank Sites Requiring Cleanup ⁹	unknown	25	18	6
Dry Weather Stormdrain Discharges to the Ocean ¹⁰ (gallons per day)	500,000*	350,000*	unknown	200,000
Wastewater Flows (citywide) ¹¹ (million gallons per day)	10.4	8.5	8.2 (thru 8/95)	8.8

*Estimated

⁵ The target for this indicator represents a 10% increase in bus ridership from the 1990 baseline.

⁶ No data is presented for 1990 because the City's Transportation Management Ordinance was not in place at that time. The indicator target reflects Council-adopted ordinance requirements.

⁷ As of September 1996, 21.7% of City Fleet Vehicles operated on reduced-emission fuels.

⁸ Due to the difficulty in obtaining accurate baseline data for this indicator, the indicator is being withdrawn and replaced with two new indicators that track City purchases of hazardous materials and generation of hazardous waste by City operations (Please refer to the list of "New and Revised Indicators").

⁹ An additional indicator is being added pertaining to underground storage tanks in Santa Monica. Please refer to the list of "New and Revised Indicators"

¹⁰ This indicator is being revised (Please refer to the list of "New and Revised Indicators) because stormwater flow rates vary significantly due to a variety of factors, and because the City currently has no accurate method to measure flow rates.

¹¹ This indicator target represents a 15% reduction in city-wide wastewater flows relative to the 1990 baseline. This target was surpassed in 1991 and current flow rates are more than 20% below the baseline figure.

8 Due to the difficulty in obtaining accurate baseline data, this indicator is being withdrawn and replaced with two new indicators that track City purchases of hazardous materials and generation of hazardous waste by City operations (see list of “New and Revised Indicators”).

9 Target based on recommendations of Environmental Programs Division staff.

10 This indicator is being revised (see list of “New and Revised Indicators”) because outside variables affect stormwater flow rates, and because the City currently has no accurate method to measure flow rates.

11 Target represents a 15% reduction in city-wide wastewater flows relative to the 1990 baseline. This is consistent with the 20% reduction target for water usage (The two targets differ because approximately 25% of total water use is for exterior purposes and does not flow to the sewer).

COMMUNITY AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Sustainability Indicator	1990 Baseline	1993	1995	2000 Target
Create and Implement Sustainable Schools Program at SMMUSD	N/A	N/A	Proposal Developed	Full Implementation
Deed-Restricted Affordable Housing Units ¹²	1172	1313	1470	1922
Public Open Space (acres) ¹³	164	164.8	179.5	180
Number of Community Gardens ¹⁴	2	2	2	5
Trees in Public Spaces ¹⁵	28,000*	28,000*	28,000*	28,350

*Estimated

12 Target based on Council-adopted affordable housing targets. Data shown includes only publicly-assisted affordable housing units. Following update of the City’s Housing Element a revised target will likely be set to reflect the total of public and private units.

13 Original target has been revised upward to reflect Recreation and Parks Commission standards (see list of “New and Revised Indicators” and footnote #20).

¹² These figures include only publicly assisted affordable housing units within the City. Following completion of an inventory of privately developed affordable housing units, this indicator target will be revised to reflect the total of public and private units. City staff estimate that there are an additional 700 privately developed units in the city.

¹³ These figures include City-owned park space, public open space and recreational traffic medians over one acre, and dedicated public open space on a private development. These figures do not include the 209 acre Santa Monica State Beach. The indicator target has been revised to reflect the standard used by the Santa Monica Recreation and Parks Commission that 2.5 acres of open space be provided for every 1000 residents (Please refer to the list of “New and Revised Indicators”).

¹⁴ The target for this indicator is being reviewed as part of the Open Space Element/Parks and Recreation Master Plan process and may be revised upon review and final approval of those documents.

¹⁵ The baseline and target for this indicator will be reviewed and may be revised as part of the Open Space Element update and may be further revised following completion of a detailed public tree inventory and the development of a Community Forestry Plan to be initiated in 1997.

¹⁴ Target is being reviewed as part of the Open Space Element/Parks and Recreation Master Plan process and may be revised upon review and final approval of those documents.

¹⁵ The baseline and target are being reviewed and may be revised as part of the Open Space Element update and may be further revised following completion of a detailed public tree inventory and the development of a Community Forestry Plan to be initiated in 1997.

NEW AND REVISED INDICATORS

Sustainability Indicator	Proposed Baseline	Proposed Target
Hazardous Waste Generated by City Operations ¹⁶	Use 1996 data as baseline	10% reduction by the year 2000
City Purchases of Hazardous Materials ¹⁷	Develop baseline by 1998	10% reduction by the year 2000
Achieve 100% compliance with Federal UST Standards for all Underground Storage Tanks (citywide) ¹⁸	N/A	Achieve by December 1998
Achieve 100% Diversion or Treatment of Dry Weather Stormwater Runoff for All Santa Monica Stormdrains from March through November ¹⁹	N/A	Achieve by the year 2000
Public Open Space (acres) ²⁰	164 (1990 baseline)	227

¹⁶ The baseline for this indicator will be calculated in early 1997 after all data for hazardous waste generated in 1996 is compiled. The target is based on Environmental Programs Division staff recommendations.

¹⁷ The baseline for this indicator will be calculated once the City develops the capability to track product purchases, likely in late 1997 or early 1998. The target is based on Environmental Programs Division staff recommendations.

¹⁸ Target is mandated by federal law. As of October 1996, there were 175 existing underground storage tanks in Santa Monica. Of those, 106 were in compliance with federal standards.

¹⁶ The baseline for this indicator will be calculated in early 1997 after all data for hazardous waste generated in 1996 is compiled.

¹⁷ The baseline for this indicator will be calculated once the City develops the capability to track product purchases, likely in late 1997 or early 1998.

¹⁸ As of October 1996, there were 175 existing underground storage tanks in Santa Monica. Of those, 106 were in compliance with federal standards.

¹⁹ Currently, dry weather runoff from the Pico-Kenter and Pier storm drains is being diverted to Hyperion Sewage Treatment Plant between June and November. To meet this indicator target, the City must also divert runoff from the Ashland Avenue storm drain and begin low-flow diversion at all three outfalls three months earlier each year. Diversion of the dry weather runoff from the Montana Avenue and Wilshire Boulevard outfalls is not required because these outfalls typically do not discharge runoff to the ocean during dry weather periods.

²⁰ The target for this indicator uses the Recreation and Parks Commission standard of 2.5 acres of open space per 1000 residents. The projected population in Santa Monica in the year 2000 is 90,777. This new indicator target will be revised if the City Council adopts an alternative target based on recommendations presented in the updated Open Space Element which is scheduled for completion in early 1997.

- ¹⁹ Revised target is based on recommendations by the Task Force on the Environment. Currently, dry weather runoff from the Pico-Kenter and Pier storm drains is being diverted to Hyperion Sewage Treatment Plant between June and November. To meet this indicator target, the City must also divert runoff from the Ashland Avenue storm drain and begin low-flow diversion at all three outfalls three months earlier each year. Diversion of the dry weather runoff from the Montana Avenue and Wilshire Boulevard outfalls is not required because these outfalls typically do not discharge runoff to the ocean during dry weather periods.
- ²⁰ Revised target uses the Recreation and Parks Commission standard of 2.5 acres of open space per 1000 residents. The projected population in Santa Monica in the year 2000 is 90,777. This new target may be revised if the City Council adopts an alternative target based on recommendations presented in the updated Open Space Element which is scheduled for completion in early 1997.

PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION

PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION

Background

Primary responsibility for coordination and implementation of the Sustainable City Program (SCP) lies with the Environmental Programs Division (EPD) of the City's Department of Environmental and Public Works Management, under the guidance of the Task Force on the Environment. EPD staff provide day-to-day administration of the SCP, prepare and disseminate public information, respond to public inquiries, work with staff from other City departments to guide implementation of the various SCP component programs and policies, and provide progress reports at monthly meetings of the Task Force. Responsibility for implementation of the component programs and policies of the SCP is spread among staff throughout the City as described in the following policy area chapters.

During the development of the SCP an implementation strategy was created by City staff and the Task Force to guide the review process, adoption, and incorporation of the program into City operations. This strategy is summarized below :

1. Define Program

- a. Disseminate proposed Sustainable City Program to the City Council and to all appropriate City Boards and Commissions.
- b. Begin compilation of a "State of the Environment" report for the City which will serve as an on-going instrument for measuring accomplishments.
- c. Develop preliminary checklist similar to an Initial Study checklist to be utilized for evaluating major City decisions. The checklist would include environmental and socio-economic considerations for each action or policy. The checklist would encourage decisions that are future-oriented, consistent with the Sustainable City Vision and interconnected with other City programs.
- d. Formulate criteria and establish benchmarks for measuring progress toward achievement of established goals.

2. Raise Community Awareness and Initiate Community Networking Process

- a. Conduct public hearings/community workshops on the Sustainable City Program to solicit public input and support, and to assist neighborhood groups in identifying and prioritizing their specific areas of concern.
- b. Meet with neighborhood groups, Chamber of Commerce, School District, Santa Monica College, and other community representatives to solicit input and support.
- c. Prepare and distribute public information materials on Santa Monica's Sustainable City program.
- d. Utilize City Council study sessions and public hearings to communicate the program concepts.

3. Integrate with City Policies and Programs

- a. Adopt Sustainable City Program as a guiding vision for the City. The vision should be clearly and simply stated and serve to unify people throughout City government and in the community toward a common task.
- b. Where appropriate, incorporate the Sustainable City Program into the City's General Plan Elements.
- c. Adopt the checklist as a tool for implementing actions and policies in accordance with the Sustainable City Program. Identify and implement a method for incorporating the checklist into the decision-making process, including defining the types of decisions to which it would apply.
- d. Establish an Interdepartmental Working Group to coordinate integration of the Sustainable City Program with City operations, activities and policies, and raise the awareness of City staff.

4. Coordinate Implementation of Program

- a. Monitor and evaluate the application of the checklist to the City's decision-making processes and modify as necessary.
- b. Measure specific indicators of progress toward achievement of goals and provide annual status report to City Council.
- c. Communicate Sustainable City Program successes to other local governments and to state and federal government representatives.
- d. Pursue non-City financial support for Sustainable City programs, and develop medium-term and long-term financing strategies for the Sustainable City Program through a combination of existing and new fees and charges based on equitable cost-sharing by the community. These financing strategies will incorporate a cost-effectiveness analysis of proposed programs which includes the consideration of environmental benefits and costs.

5. Support On-Going Community Dialogue on Sustainability

- a. Disseminate information about Santa Monica's Sustainable City Program through existing media (newspaper articles, CityTV, Seascope, PEN, utility bill inserts, direct mail brochures, and school and community group presentations). Develop new public information media for presentation and discussion of the Sustainable City Program (Santa Monica "Greenbook", curriculum for schools, Sustainable City Education Center, etc.).
- b. Sponsor community events/celebrations to raise awareness of the Sustainable City Program.
- c. Participate in regional/statewide networking activities.
- d. Assess feasibility of establishing a Sustainable City Roundtable, comprised of Task Force on the Environment members and representatives from the Chamber of Commerce Environmental affairs Committee, the Housing Commission, Neighborhood Support Center, local environmental groups, and other appropriate individuals and groups to meet periodically and discuss/evaluate the City's progress toward its adopted program goals.

Progress Towards Goals

All of the tasks under headings 1 and 2 of the implementation strategy were completed or addressed prior to City Council adoption of the program in 1994 as part of the program development and public review process. The "State of the Environment" report mentioned in item 1b was renamed the "Sustainable City Progress Report". Several attempts were made by staff and the Task Force to develop the checklist described in item 1c, however due to the number and complexity of City decisions that such a checklist would be required to address, a workable solution was not reached. In its place, staff is working on developing more specialized checklists targeting specific areas of City operations (such as the Sustainable Development Guidelines, described in the "Construction and Development" section of this report) and sustainable policies (such as the Vehicle Management Program, described in the "Transportation" section of this report) to guide City purchasing practices and operations. More information on sustainable policies and guidelines can be found under the headings "Existing Programs and Policies" and "Plans for the Future" in each of the policy area sections of this report.

Task 3d of the implementation strategy was completed with the establishment of an interdepartmental Sustainable City Working Group in September 1995. The group includes representatives from all City departments and meets regularly to help coordinate the integration of the SCP into City operations. In August 1996, three subcommittees of the Working Group were created to address the issues of Sustainable Development, Purchasing, and Education of City Staff about sustainability, which were identified by the Working Group as priorities. These groups meet regularly and provide quarterly reports on their findings and recommendations to the full Working Group. One of the primary accomplishments of the Working Group to date has been the incorporation of budget objectives into the City's FY 1996-97 budget aimed at meeting the goals of the SCP. Following a Working Group brainstorming and discussion process, three interdepartmental budget objectives were adopted: 1. To create and implement a set of Sustainable Development Guidelines; 2. To expand the purchase of environmentally preferable and sustainable goods and services; and 3. To develop a comprehensive Community Forestry Program. Additional departmental

sustainability budget objectives were adopted as a result of this process by the Environmental and Public Works Management Department, Transportation Department, Community and Cultural Services Department, Finance Department, Fire Department, and the City Manager's Office.

Obstacles

Many of the remaining tasks listed under headings 3, 4, and 5 of the implementation strategy have not yet been addressed. Specifically, these include incorporation of the SCP into the City's planning process and General Plan Elements, development of financing strategies utilizing cost-effectiveness analyses for SCP programs, development of new public outreach materials and events to promote the SCP, and development of a Sustainable City Roundtable as a way to raise local awareness and broaden participation in the program. This has occurred primarily because implementation of the SCP since its adoption has proceeded on a piecemeal basis. Although an implementation strategy was developed for the program, staff responsibility for carrying out the tasks has never been adequately defined, an implementation timeline has not been developed, and adequate staffing and funding necessary to properly implement the program have not been identified. As a result, although various component programs and policies have been instituted, promotion and integration of the Sustainable City Program as a whole has been neglected. The main consequences of this are that many City staff are currently not aware of the program and/or do not see it as a high priority and that there is very little community awareness of, or involvement in the program.

Recommendations

- 1.) An updated implementation plan should be developed for the Sustainable City Program. This plan should: include specific action plans for meeting the Sustainable City indicator targets and for integrating the program into City operations; identify specific staff responsibilities; set a realistic timeline for implementation; and develop a program budget outlining staffing and funding needs related to program implementation.
- 2.) The goals and objectives of the Sustainable City Program should be merged with goals and objectives outlined in the elements of the City's General Plan, Consolidated Plan, and Human Services Strategic Plans. This can be accomplished by meeting with staff from appropriate departments/divisions and with appropriate City Commissions to develop additional indicator targets based on the targets set in these various plans. This process will help to integrate the program into the City's planning process and daily operations, will begin the process of educating staff and the general public about the program and give them more of a stake in the program.
- 3.) The Sustainable City Program presents objectives both for City operations and for the entire community. To date there has been little or no community involvement in the program. City staff and the Task Force on the Environment should begin to investigate options and develop a plan for increasing community involvement in the program. One option for this is to create a Sustainable City Roundtable, with representatives from the Chamber of Commerce and the local business community, the School Board and School District, Santa Monica College, neighborhood organizations, local non-profit organizations, various City Commissions and City Council to gather public input, set community-wide program priorities, and oversee the implementation of the program.

POLICY AREAS

SOLID WASTE AND RECYCLING

Solid Waste and Sustainability

Every day U.S. residents throw away about 4.3 pounds of "trash" per person. Annually, the country generates approximately 200 million tons of solid waste and this number is steadily increasing. Over 75% of this waste is buried in landfills or incinerated. Only about 22% is collected for recycling. Analysis of the waste stream indicates that the majority of what is thrown away doesn't need to be. Over 70% of landfilled waste consists of valuable materials such as glass, metal and paper which could be reused or recycled, reducing the demand on virgin sources of these materials.

Our current patterns of waste generation and disposal contribute significantly to environmental, economic and public health problems. The U.S. EPA estimates that half of the landfills operating today will be closed by the year 2000, either because they will be full or because they are suspected or known to be leaking toxic materials into local water systems. And although waste incineration is sometimes used as a means to generate energy, it can also release toxins into the air and create toxic ash that may require disposal in hazardous waste landfills.

In addition to these concerns, cities are finding that they are running out of places to put their trash. The outlying areas that have traditionally been dumping grounds for cities have grown in population and dimension to the point that they have become part of the city itself. Residents near landfills typically mount stiff opposition to any plans for expansion, and options for exporting solid waste are dwindling as fewer and fewer states are willing to receive it. The costs for waste disposal and for cleaning up the pollution it generates are on the rise and are significantly impacting city and county budgets.

Waste reduction and recycling provide a sustainable solution to the problems associated with solid waste disposal. In addition to reducing the costs and impacts due to landfilling and incineration, recycling helps to reduce the demand for natural resources, conserve energy, and create local jobs in the community. For these reasons, people around the country are taking another look at what they call "trash" and recognizing that it is more valuable than they used to think.

In 1990 the State of California passed AB 939 which mandates cities and counties to reduce, below a 1990 baseline, the amount of solid waste they send to landfills 25% by 1995 and 50% by the year 2000. The City of Santa Monica has adopted these targets as goals for its Sustainable City Program and is working on many levels to achieve them.

Background: Solid Waste and Recycling in Santa Monica

The Solid Waste Management Division of the City's Environmental and Public Works Management Department collects all residential solid waste and approximately 50% of the waste generated by commercial and industrial operations within Santa Monica. The remainder of the commercial and industrial waste is collected by private waste haulers. Waste collected by the City is taken to a city-owned Refuse Transfer Station located at 2401 Delaware Street. From there it is loaded into larger trucks and transported to the Puente Hills Landfill in Whittier. Private haulers dispose of waste they collect in Santa Monica at several landfills located throughout the Los Angeles area.

In 1995, 93,178 tons of landfilled solid waste was generated in Santa Monica. On average, 72% is generated by commercial and industrial operations and 28% is generated by residential customers.

The City began its recycling program in 1982 with curbside collection services for residential customers. City recycling services now include expanded curbside pickup of newspaper, glass, metal containers, plastics, mixed paper, and used motor oil and filters; operation and maintenance of 100 drop-off recycling zones throughout the city; and oversight of a buy-back and drop-off recycling center operated by a private company on City property. The City collects all of the residential recyclables and collects approximately 14% of the recyclable material generated by the commercial sector (The commercial waste is collected by

American Waste under a contract with the City). The remaining 86% of commercial recyclables are collected by private recyclers. Current City programs and policies related to recycling are outlined below.

Existing Recycling and Waste Diversion Programs and Policies

• Curbside Recycling

The curbside recycling program operated by the City serves 7500 single-family homes and 5000 low-density multi-family homes. Residents are provided with recycling containers to collect the following materials:

- newspaper
- glass bottles and jars; tin and aluminum containers; and plastic bottles and bags (numbers 1 through 5)
- mixed waste paper (cardboard, phone books, magazines, junk mail, office paper, brown bags)
- used motor oil and filters

The program began in January 1982. Collection of cardboard began in 1992. Collection of mixed paper began in 1993.

• Drop-Off Recycling Zones

One hundred drop-off recycling zones operated by the City serve 34,000 high-density multi-family units. The zones consist of groupings of four two-cubic yard metal recycling bins placed on public property throughout the city. All of the materials collected by the curbside recycling program are accepted at the zones except for used motor oil and filters. The program began in January 1982.

• Recycling Center

A buy-back and drop-off recycling center is operated on City property under a lease agreement with the Allan Company. All of the materials collected by the curbside recycling program as well as high-grade scrap metals are accepted at the center. The recycling center was opened in January 1982.

• Scrap Metal Recycling

Since 1984 a program has been in place to identify and divert scrap metal generated by City operations as well as metal salvaged from the City's transfer station. The metal is taken to an offsite facility for recycling.

• Concrete and Asphalt Recycling

A concrete and asphalt recycling facility is operated on City property under a lease agreement with Blue Diamond Materials. This facility, which crushes concrete and asphalt for reuse as road base, began operation in January 1983. The facility recycles between 70,000 and 100,000 tons of material annually. More than 39,000 porcelain toilets replaced as part of the City's Bay Saver retrofit program (please refer to the "Water" section of this report for more information) have been recycled at the facility since 1990 (Note: These figures are not included in the City's annual waste generation or diversion figures reported to the State as required by AB 939).

• Christmas Tree Recycling

Christmas trees are collected annually at four City parks and are shredded for reuse as mulch. Approximately sixty tons of Christmas trees are recycled annually. This program began in December 1989.

• Green Waste Diversion

Green waste from city parks and private landscapers is accepted at the City's waste transfer station. The material is taken to the Puente Hills Landfill for shredding and is used as landfill cover. This program began in December 1989.

• Mini Recycling Zones

Mini recycling zones are available for apartment buildings with 10 or more units. Each mini zone consists of three 68 gallon recycling carts placed on private property for the collection of newspaper, glass, cans and plastic, and mixed paper. There are currently 150 locations being served. This program began in August 1991.

- **Composting**

City sponsored backyard composting workshops are held periodically and compost bins are sold to residents throughout the year at below-retail prices. More than 1500 composting bins have been sold to Santa Monica residents as part of this program. The program began in January 1992.

- **Volume-Based Billing**

A volume-based billing system is used for all refuse accounts subscribing to City service in an effort to encourage reduction in waste generation. Single-family residents choose standardized refuse carts of 40, 68 or 95 gallons. Multi-family residents use carts or two cubic yard dumpsters. The users are charged proportionally higher rates for the larger receptacles. The program began in April 1992.

- **Commercial Mixed Paper Recycling**

A mixed paper recycling program, operated under contract with American Waste Industries, is offered free to Santa Monica businesses. The level of services offered varies depending on the company's needs and the amount of recyclables they generate. This program began in January 1995.

- **Tire Recycling**

Automotive and truck tires are accepted for recycling at the City's waste transfer station. Tires are taken to a cement manufacturing plant, shredded and used as fuel for the cement kiln. This program began in March 1995.

- **School Recycling Program**

This program provides for collection of mixed waste paper at all public and private schools in Santa Monica. This program began in October 1995.

- **Administrative Instruction Pertaining to Office Paper**

In November 1995 the City adopted several policies pertaining to office paper in the form of an administrative instruction to all City employees. These policies were instituted to help reduce the amount of waste generated in daily City operations. These policies provide purchasing specifications for office paper products; require that waste reduction specifications be included in all requests for submittals from outside contractors; and require that all City employees incorporate waste reduction measures into their operations and recycle mixed waste paper.

In addition to the listed programs and policies, the Solid Waste Management Division has produced several public information brochures to educate and encourage residents to reduce waste and recycle. The Division is also a member of the Westside Cities Waste Management Committee and regularly participates in cooperative public education campaigns, shares waste reduction program information with other cities, and lobbies in support of waste management legislation that will benefit Santa Monica. Santa Monica recently hosted a Buy-Recycled Workshop for Businesses which was sponsored by the Committee.

Accomplishments

Solid Waste Generation and Diversion (tons)

	<u>1990</u>	<u>1995</u>
Solid Waste Generated - Total	124,000	126,571
• Landfilled	106,838	93,178
• Diverted	17,162	33,393
• % of Yearly Total Diverted	13.8%	26.4%

1995 Diversion (tons)

Residential Recycling Program	3,383
Commercial Recycling Program	2,169
Green Waste Diversion	8,155
Backyard Composting	300
Miscellaneous City Recycling	271
Recycling Center	13,915
<u>Private Recycling</u>	<u>5,200</u>
Total	33,393

Recycling Expenditures and Revenues

Expenditures

1995 Recycling Budget \$ [953,904]

Revenues

Lease Agreements		
Allan Co. Recycling Center		\$43,600
Blue Diamond Crushing		\$72,000
Recyclable Materials		
Allan Co. and Smurfit (residential)	\$113,136	
Miscellaneous		\$6,121
Avoided Disposal Costs		
20,026 tons ¹ @ \$29.80/ton ²		\$596,775
1,500 tons ³ @ \$7.87/ton ⁴		<u>\$11,805</u>
Total Revenues		\$758,349

Notes

1 This is an estimate of the solid waste diverted by City operations. It does not include waste diverted due to recycling by private recycling companies operating within the city. A breakdown is provided below. The figure for the Recycling Center represents 80% of the total 14,600 tons delivered to the Center and is an estimate of the tonnage generated within Santa Monica.

residential recycling	3,383 tons	
commercial recycling	2,169 tons	
backyard composting	300 tons	
miscellaneous recycling	259 tons	(12 tons of recycled tires not included in Recycling Center
Recycling Center	<u>13,915 tons</u>	avoided costs)
Total	20,026 tons	

2 Includes \$16.67/ton disposal fee at the landfill and \$13.13/ton labor and equipment costs.

3 Green waste diverted. This figure is for green waste coming from City operations only . The remainder (6655 tons) is estimated to come from landscapers who would otherwise haul this material themselves to disposal locations. The City realizes disposal savings only on material hauled by the City

4 The \$7.87/ton figure is the difference between the tip fee of \$16.67/ton for solid waste and the tip fee of \$8.80 for clean green waste.

City Department Highlights

The City's Recycling Division has placed recycling containers for mixed paper, cans, glass, and plastics in all City Department offices. Used batteries are also collected for proper disposal. The City has administrative waste reduction policies in place that require all employees recycle office paper, make double-sided copies, and comply with other waste reduction measures such as reducing the use of fax cover sheets. These policies also require that all requests for submittals from outside contractors specify that submittals should be printed on recycled or tree free paper, all copies should be double sided, all report covers should

be recyclable and that unnecessary attachments should be avoided to reduce waste. Several City Departments have identified additional waste reduction measures that they have incorporated into their daily operations. Some of these efforts are described below.

Police Department

The Police Department has recently updated its equipment for processing and cataloging data which has significantly reduced waste generation. Some examples are listed below:

- Optical Imaging System - Eliminates the need to make multiple photocopies of crime reports. All reports are now stored digitally and copies are only made when absolutely necessary. Conserves paper, toner, and microfilm.
- Computer-Aided Dispatch - Eliminates the need for call cards and officer logs.
- "Livescan" Fingerprint Imaging - Digitized fingerprinting system has helped to reduce paper consumption and waste.
- Increased Computer Use - Reduces the need for transcribing reports from cassette tapes. A new voice recognition system is budgeted for next year which will eliminate the need to transcribe reports, saving even more paper and cassette tapes.
- Laser Toner Cartridge Recycling - The Department recycles all of its toner cartridges.
- Digital Photographic Processing - This is still in the works. It will reduce the need for non-recyclable Polaroid film packs and reduce chemical waste produced by standard film processing.

Library

The City's libraries have instituted a policy to limit printing of hard copy reports by preparing on-line reports whenever possible.

Transportation Department

The Transportation Department, which operates the Santa Monica Municipal Bus Lines and shuttles, has reduced its waste generation through the following efforts:

- Elimination of the use of envelopes when mailing the quarterly bus excursion information by redesigning the form so that, when folded, it can be addressed and mailed without an envelope. This change was the result of an employee suggestion.
- Recycle all aluminum, cast iron and steel parts removed from the buses.
- Recycle all bus and vehicle batteries.

Engineering Division

The Engineering Division of the Environmental and Public Works Management Department has incorporated waste reduction into its projects as well as its daily operations.

- Use of Recycled Materials for Trench Backfill and Pavement Construction - The City used 7,750 tons of asphalt rubber in paving work last year, which is equivalent to recycling 25,000 tires. Approximately 90% of damaged pavement is recycled when paved areas are repaired. All base material used on City projects consists of recycled asphalt or concrete.
- A centralized database for records eliminates the need for hard copy distribution when the records are updated.
- An 11"x17" printer is used to make check plots of ongoing projects, reducing the time and materials required for full-sized plots.
- Division staff use individual reusable coffee mugs.

Street Maintenance

The Street Maintenance Division of the Environmental and Public Works Management Department has plans to incorporate the following two waste reduction measures into their operations this year.

- Alternative Backfill for Water Line Trenches - Currently, open trenches are temporarily backfilled with cold mix asphalt to allow traffic to drive over them. When repairs are completed, the cold mix is removed and landfilled, and the trench is filled with a permanent hot mix asphalt. The Street Maintenance Division is now testing an alternative backfill material which will replace the cold mix but can be left in place permanently with only a thin hot mix cap. The Division estimates that using this

new method will eliminate the need for landfilling 600 tons of cold mix annually, saving about \$6000. This method will also save the City approximately \$40,000 annually in costs to excavate and replace cold mix with hot mix.

- Sidewalk Repair - Currently, when tree roots break concrete sidewalks, the concrete is sawcut and removed and new concrete is poured. The Division is investigating brick pavers for use around street trees. These can be removed to work on problem roots and replaced. They will provide several benefits by reducing concrete waste, saving time and money, and reducing storm water runoff by allowing water to percolate into the soil around the trees.

Progress Towards Goals

In 1990 the State of California adopted AB 939 which mandates cities and counties to reduce, below a 1990 baseline, the amount of solid waste they send to landfills 25% by 1995 and 50% by the year 2000. As stated above, these are the targets that Santa Monica adopted as an indicator for solid waste as part of the Sustainable City Program.

The baseline set by the State for AB 939 is equal to the pre-diversion tonnage of solid waste generated in a municipality in 1990. This allows the municipality to include waste diversion efforts that were in place in 1990 to contribute towards the AB 939 targets. Santa Monica's 1990 baseline is 124,000 tons of solid waste. The target for 1995 was that amount less 25% or 93,000 tons. In 1995 Santa Monica landfilled 93,178 tons of solid waste, representing a 24.9% reduction below the 1990 baseline. Over the 5 year period, total waste generation in the city increased from 124,000 tons in 1990 to 126,571 tons in 1995. In order to achieve the 25% reduction goal, the city would have had to divert 26.6% of its waste in 1995.

The annual tonnage figures for landfilled solid waste included in this report are derived from the measured tonnage of landfilled solid waste passing through the City's transfer station plus estimates provided to the City by private waste haulers of the tonnage they transported to landfills that was generated in Santa Monica. The figures the California Integrated Waste Management Board (CIWMB) will use to measure compliance with AB 939 are collected by the Los Angeles County Department of Public Works. The County surveys waste haulers as they enter landfills to determine the point(s) of origin of the waste they are delivering. The figures are collected for a one week period each quarter and extrapolated to provide quarterly tonnage figures for each municipality. For the first two quarters of 1995, the figures calculated by the County and reported to the CIWMB for waste generated in Santa Monica were approximately double those calculated by the City. The City feels that the County's figures are in error and has lodged formal complaints with the CIWMB and the Los Angeles County Department of Public Works. This issue has not yet been resolved.

Obstacles

• Limited Participation of Commercial and Industrial Sector

The Recycling Division has identified that the main obstacle to achieving the City's waste reduction goals is the current limited participation of the commercial and industrial sector in waste diversion efforts. The commercial and industrial sector is responsible for generating approximately 72% of the solid waste in Santa Monica but diverted from landfills only about 17% of that in 1995. By comparison, the residential sector achieved a 48% diversion rate for 1995. The Division began a free commercial recycling program in January 1995 that has increased commercial waste diversion and feels that continuation and expansion of this program will help to overcome this obstacle.

Staff has found that one of the main reasons for the lack of participation is that some businesses either can't be bothered or are unwilling to take the time to recycle. An example is Kinko's Copy Center on Wilshire Boulevard. They have been approached several times and asked to participate in the program and the City has provided them with a two-cubic yard mixed waste paper recycling bin on their property.

Approximately 95% of Kinko's waste is mixed paper and it has been explained to them that by recycling they can significantly reduce their waste disposal costs, yet their recycling bin sits unused. Letters to Kinko's corporate offices have done nothing to help the situation. It is clear in cases like this that free services and education aren't enough.

- **Scavenging**

Scavenging of recyclables from City bins has become a significant problem, particularly in the last year as prices for recyclable materials have increased. In 1994 the City collected 5881 tons of recyclables from drop off bins and curbside pickup while 4572 tons of recyclables were delivered by residents and scavengers to the buy-back facility. For the first 7 months of 1995, however, the City collected only 1799 tons while the buy-back center took in 8311 tons. Scavenging doesn't have an impact on the City's waste diversion goals because the scavenged materials do get recycled, however it means lost revenues for the City that would have been used to offset program costs. The Solid Waste Division has begun working with the Police Department to crack down on scavengers in the city.

- **Waste Generation by City Departments**

Because City departments have never been required to pay for waste disposal, they have had no incentive to integrate vigorous waste reduction measures and recycling into their operations. To overcome this obstacle, the Environmental and Public Works Management Department began charging all departments waste disposal fees for all refuse dumped at the City Yards as of July 1, 1996.

Plans for the Future

Efforts planned for the coming year to increase waste diversion in the city include the following:

- **Commercial Recycling**

The Division plans to step-up its education and outreach efforts in FY 1996-97 to encourage more local businesses to recycle mixed paper.

- **Curbside Green Waste Collection**

The general feeling among waste managers throughout the state is that achieving the 25% waste diversion goal by 1995 is relatively easy, but it will be a much more difficult task to achieve an additional 25% reduction by 2000. As the cost vs. benefits for increasing the diversion rates for paper, metal, glass and plastic are nearing the point of diminishing returns, municipalities will have to look to other areas to achieve additional diversion. Green waste is the obvious choice. It makes up a significant portion of the solid waste stream yet there are few mechanisms in place for its diversion.

The Solid Waste Management Division has identified that approximately 30% of the solid waste generated by single family residential customers is green waste. The Division hopes to begin separate curbside pickup of green waste in 1997 for these residential customers.

- **Backyard Composting Demonstration Site**

A permanent Backyard Composting Demonstration Site is planned to help educate local residents about the benefits of composting. Increased residential composting will help to reduce the amount of green waste and food waste reaching landfills. A potential location for the site is at the Farmers Market site at the corner of Pico and Cloverfield Boulevards. City staff have also been participating in discussions with the Westside Cities Waste Management Committee about the possibility of opening a regional composting facility on the Westside sometime in the future.

- **Construction and Demolition Waste Recycling Ordinance**

In an effort to divert the solid waste generated by construction, development and building renovation in Santa Monica, the City is investigating the viability of instituting a Construction and Demolition Waste Recycling Ordinance, in conjunction with proposed Sustainable Development Guidelines (please refer to the "Construction and Development" section of this report) planned for completion in 1997. This

ordinance will likely require building contractors to prepare a waste minimization and recycling plan prior to construction or demolition to identify wastes that can be recycled. This will help to divert wood, steel, bricks and other building materials from landfills. These types of materials currently comprise about 40% of all landfilled solid waste.

Recommendations

- 1.) Waste diversion by the commercial and industrial sector should be carefully tracked over the next year to determine if the Recycling Division's educational and outreach efforts have been effective at increasing diversion. If no significant improvement is attained, the Recycling Division should investigate additional educational and/or policy measures to encourage waste reduction in these sectors.
- 2.) Development of a curbside green waste collection program should be made a priority for FY 1996-97.
- 3.) Development of a backyard composting demonstration site should be made a priority for FY 1996-97.
- 4.) The Recycling Division and Environmental Programs should begin working with other City departments to help identify and implement additional waste reduction measures for City operations.

WATER

Background

The City of Santa Monica operates its own water utility which provides drinking water to local residents and businesses. City-wide water use in Santa Monica currently averages about 12 million gallons per day. Of this, approximately 24% is consumed by single family units, 44% by multi-family units, and 23% by commercial users. The remaining 9 % is divided between industrial, institutional and irrigation uses.

The water provided is a blend of imported water and local well water. The relative amounts from these two sources vary annually. Over the last few years the City has gradually increased its reliance on local groundwater and decreased its purchase of imported water. During 1994 and 1995 the City pumped 65% of its water supply from local groundwater aquifers and purchased the balance from the Metropolitan Water District of Southern California (MWD), a water wholesaler that imports water to the region from the State Water Project and the Colorado River*.

The City maintains four reservoirs (Arcadia, Mt. Olivette, Riviera, and San Vicente) with a combined capacity of 40 million gallons for the storage of imported water. The groundwater and imported water are blended and treated at the City's Arcadia Water Treatment Facility to remove minerals before delivery through the City's water system. The water supply is continually monitored by chemists at the treatment plant to insure that it meets and exceeds State and Federal Health standards.

The Department of Environmental and Public Works Management provides oversight for the City's water utility. The Department's Utilities Division is responsible for operation and maintenance of the water treatment, storage and distribution systems and for water billing. The Environmental Programs Division oversees all water conservation programs.

(Please note: Water conservation programs which focus on achieving permanent water savings often result in reduced wastewater flows as well. The City links the cost of wastewater service to the amount of water consumed; therefore, water conservation programs also result in both water and wastewater cost savings for the City and for Santa Monica ratepayers. A detailed discussion of wastewater is presented in the "Stormwater, Wastewater and Santa Monica Bay" section of this report, however, due to this connection, wastewater is also addressed in appropriate parts of this section.)

Existing Water Conservation Programs

• Residential Water-Use Surveys

In 1989 the City began offering on site water-use surveys to all Santa Monica residents to identify current consumption patterns and recommend measures they can take at their homes that will result in water conservation and cost savings. As

* In March 1996 the City began shutting down several of its groundwater wells following the discovery of MTBE, a gasoline additive, in the water. To make up for the loss of this well water the City has increased its purchase of water from MWD. As of July 1996 approximately 78% of the City's water was being supplied by MWD with the remaining 22% coming from groundwater sources not affected by MTBE. This supply level is likely to continue for the foreseeable future until the source of the MTBE contamination is identified and the problem is remediated.

part of this program residents receive free showerheads, faucet aerators, garden hose nozzles, and information about the City's resource efficiency programs.

- **Commercial and Industrial Water-Use Surveys**

Water-use surveys are offered to all Santa Monica businesses and institutions to identify resource efficiency measures and cost savings opportunities they can incorporate into their operations. As part of this program businesses receive information about financial incentives available to implement measures recommended following the surveys. This program began in 1991.

- **School Programs**

The City provides Santa Monica/Malibu Unified School District schools and private schools in Santa Monica with several water conservation education programs for grades K-12. These include Small Change Theatre, In Concert with the Environment, and a poster contest for 4th graders. Additional information on these programs can be found in the "Education" section of this report.

- **Demonstration Sustainable Gardens**

In 1988 the City installed demonstration sustainable gardens at City Hall and the Civic Auditorium. This involved replacing existing landscaping with drought-tolerant plants and the installation of water-conserving irrigation systems and educational signage.

- **Sustainable Landscape Workshops and Garden Tours**

In 1991 the City began sponsoring annual Sustainable Landscape workshops and bi-monthly tours of local sustainably-designed residential gardens. The workshops and tours are directed at residents and landscape professionals to promote the use of sustainable practices in the design and maintenance of landscaped areas. To date approximately 1150 people have participated in the workshops and tours.

- **Sustainable Landscape Guidelines**

In 1994 the City developed voluntary Sustainable Landscape Guidelines for single-family residential, multi-family residential and non-residential zones. The guidelines provide information on: planning and garden design; appropriate plant selection; water-efficient irrigation system design; sustainable landscape maintenance tips; and information about City regulations related to landscaping, water-use and runoff.

- **California Irrigation Management Information System (CIMIS)**

In 1994 Santa Monica entered into an agreement with MWD to install a California Irrigation Management Information System (CIMIS) weather station in the city. The station is located above the City's Mt. Olivette reservoir and measures evapotranspiration rates and other data for use by City staff, local landscapers and residents in developing water budget irrigation schedules.

- **Bay Saver Toilet Retrofit Program**

In an effort to encourage local residents and businesses to replace inefficient toilets with water-saving ultra-low flow toilets (ULFTs), the City implemented the Bay Saver Toilet Retrofit Program in 1989. Participants in the program can choose to receive a \$75 rebate when they purchase and install a City-approved ULFT, or to pay \$35 for installation of a ULFT provided by the City. In addition to the toilets, the City provides free low-flow faucet aerators and showerheads. The program is available to all Santa Monica residents and businesses.

- **Public Facility Toilet Retrofit Program**

Between 1991 and 1992 the City replaced over 1200 institutional plumbing fixtures in all City facilities, the Santa Monica/Malibu Unified School District, Santa Monica College, and in the offices of City-subsidized nonprofit organizations. Funded by water demand mitigation fees placed on new development (see below), these retrofits have resulted in reduced operating costs for each public agency.

- **Water Efficiency Revolving Loan Program**

In July 1996 the Environmental Programs Division established a water efficiency revolving loan fund which provides no-interest loans to institutional, commercial and residential water customers to pay for plumbing fixture retrofits, irrigation system upgrades and other cost-effective water efficiency measures. Parts and labor for the retrofits are provided by the City as part of the loan agreement. The loans are designed to be repaid to the City over a 2 to 3 year period depending on the installed measure's payback analysis. This program is intended to reach out to businesses that often do not have the resources to invest in water efficiency, and to institutions that have low cash reserves.

Existing Water Conservation Policies

- **No Water Waste Ordinance**

This ordinance was adopted by City Council in 1988 to promote water conservation and to reduce runoff to the stormdrain system. The ordinance prohibits the following wasteful water-use practices by residents and businesses: Lawns or landscapes cannot be watered between the hours of 10am and 4pm.; sidewalks, driveways, patios, alleys, or parking areas cannot be hosed down; water shall not run off lawns or landscapes onto streets, alleys or gutters at any time; fountains, ponds, lakes, or displays must use a recycling system or sea water; swimming pools shall not be filled or emptied unless it is a first filling of a new pool or it can be certified that necessary leak repair work is being performed; all water leaks from exterior or interior pipes, or plumbing fixtures must be repaired immediately; no one shall waste water by allowing it to flow without reasonable use; no washing of vehicles of any kind except with a hand held bucket or hose equipped with a shut-off nozzle; restaurants shall serve water only upon request and must post a sign on each table indicating this restriction. The ordinance is enforced by City inspectors through the issuance of citations and fines to violators. Flagrant violations may result in a \$20 or 20% surcharge to be placed on a violator's water bill. Continued violations may constitute an infraction punishable by a fine of up to \$100. In response to California's 7-year drought an amendment to the ordinance mandating a city-wide 20% reduction in water use was instituted in 1991. This mandatory reduction was lifted in 1992 when the drought was officially declared over.

- **Plumbing Code**

Since 1988 the Santa Monica plumbing code has required low flush fixtures in all new construction and certain categories of remodels.

- **Water-Conserving Landscape Regulations**

In 1988 water-conserving landscape regulations were added to the City's Municipal Code. These regulations address the specification and operation of irrigation systems, require low-volume irrigation systems with automatic controllers, and set maximum allowable limits for turf areas for all new development within the city.

- **Water-Demand Mitigation Fee**

In 1991 City Council adopted an ordinance creating a water-demand mitigation fee which is designed to pay for the cost of fully mitigating the water demand impacts of new development in Santa Monica. The fee is based on estimated water demand factors for the proposed development and is paid for by the developer. Initially the fee was equal to twice the cost determined to mitigate the water demand impacts. After the drought was declared over in 1992 the fee was reduced by half.

- **Wastewater Mitigation for Large Development Projects**

The City has recently been requiring developers of very large projects to install onsite wastewater treatment plants in an effort to reduce or eliminate additional flows generated by the development project to the sewer system. These requirements are negotiated with the developer on a site specific basis and are included in the development agreement for the project.

- **Retrofit-Upon-Sale Ordinance**

This ordinance, adopted in 1993, requires installation of ultra-low flush toilets and urinals, low flow showerheads, and shut-off valves for reverse osmosis water filtration systems in all residential and commercial properties in Santa Monica which are sold or transferred. A certificate of compliance is issued by the City and must be included in the escrow process before the transaction can be completed.

- **Water and Wastewater Rate Structure**

In May 1996 City Council approved a revised Water and Wastewater rate structure that encourages the efficient use of water by altering the level of fixed and variable charges. The structure was developed following completion of a rate study by a consultant that included an extensive public input process.

Accomplishments

- **City-wide Water Use and Wastewater Generation**

**Average Daily Water Use (City-wide)
(million gallons per day)**

<u>Year</u>	<u>Volume</u>	<u>% Reduction*</u>
1990	14.3	-
1991	11.2	21.8
1992	11.8	17.5
1993	12.0	16.1
1994	12.2	14.7
1995	12.3	14.0

* Relative to 1990

**Average Wastewater Volumes to Hyperion Treatment Plant
(million gallons per day)**

<u>Year</u>	<u>Volume</u>	<u>% Reduction*</u>
1990	10.4	-
1991	8.6	17
1992	8.2	21
1993	8.5	18
1994	8.3	20
1995	8.2	21

* Relative to 1990

• Baysaver Toilet Retrofit Program

The goal of the program is to replace 50% of all residential toilets and 25% of all commercial toilets in the city with ULFTs. As of July 1996, over 41,000 (53%) residential toilets and 1,567 (9.5%) commercial toilets have been replaced. This is responsible for a permanent reduction of approximately 1.9 million gallons per day in water use and wastewater generation.

The Baysaver Program has allowed the City to reduce the purchase of imported water from the Metropolitan Water District, reduce its wastewater treatment costs, and avoid additional treatment capacity costs from the City of Los Angeles' Hyperion Wastewater Treatment Facility. Costs for the program have totaled \$5.4 million. Net savings from the program are estimated to exceed \$9.5 million in avoided sewage treatment capacity purchases from the City of Los Angeles and avoided purchase of imported water from MWD. Approximately one-half of the program costs have been paid through the Metropolitan Water District's Conservation Credits Program (at a rate of \$154 per acre foot saved.) The balance of the program costs have been funded through combination of Bay Saver Fees (a monthly amount charged to all residential households who have not yet retrofitted their toilet fixtures) and water and wastewater revenues.

Progress Towards Goals

• Water

The Sustainable City Program indicator for Water calls for a 20 percent reduction in water use from 14.3 million gallons per day (mgd) in 1990 to 11.4 mgd by the year 2000. From 1990 to 1991 city-wide water use dropped almost 22 percent, from 14.3 mgd to 11.2 mgd in response to the City-mandated 20 percent

cutback in water use instituted because of the drought. Since then, city-wide water use has risen incrementally each year, following the repeal of the mandatory cutbacks at the end of the drought in 1992. Water use in 1995 averaged 12.3 mgd, representing a reduction of 14 percent from 1990 levels but a 7 percent increase since 1991.

- **Wastewater**

The Wastewater indicator calls for a 15 percent reduction in wastewater flow, from 10.4 million gpd in 1990 to the target of 8.8 million gpd in 2000. The City surpassed this target with a 17 percent reduction to 8.6 million gpd in 1991 and has maintained or exceeded this level since then. The wastewater flows rose slightly in 1993 before dropping again in 1994 and 1995. Wastewater flows averaged 8.2 mgd in 1995, a 21 percent reduction since 1990.

Water use and wastewater flows have both significantly dropped since 1990, demonstrating the overall effectiveness of the City's water conservation programs and policies. However, the decrease in wastewater flows between 1993 and 1995 and the increase in overall water use over the same period indicates that the programs and policies targeting indoor water conservation (water that drains to the sewer system) have been more successful than those targeting outdoor uses (water that drains to stormdrains or evaporates). It is likely that increases in landscape irrigation and other outdoor water uses are primarily responsible for the recent increases in city-wide water use. The new water rate structure should help to reduce these outdoor uses.

Obstacles

- **Poor Commercial Participation in the Baysaver Toilet Retrofit Program**

While the program has exceeded its goal to replace 50 percent of all residential toilets in the city, it has fallen short of meeting its 25 percent target for commercial retrofits. This is likely due to the fact that water costs for commercial uses represent a smaller percentage of overhead costs than they do for residential uses, making toilet retrofits a low priority for commercial customers. The Environmental Programs Division is addressing this situation by targeting commercial users with its no-interest/low-interest water-efficiency loan program and with a new, comprehensive water-efficiency audit program (see below).

- **Poor Compliance with the No Water Waste Ordinance**

Water Conservation inspectors have reported generally poor compliance with the City's No Water Waste Ordinance, particularly with the restrictions on landscape watering and hosing down of driveways and sidewalks. This is attributed to a lack of public awareness of the ordinance as well as insufficient enforcement due to a lack of inspectors.

Plans for the Future

- **Commercial/Industrial/Institutional (CII) Audit Program**

This new program will target the city's largest commercial, industrial and institutional water users. The City will offer free detailed water-use audits to these customers for the purpose of identifying potential water and cost savings through operational changes and retrofits with water-efficient equipment. No-interest/low-interest loans to fund equipment retrofits will be offered as an incentive. A majority of the audits will be conducted by a certified water-use analyst on the City staff. In the case of very large facilities, an outside consultant will conduct a formal water management study.

- **Integrated Central Irrigation Controller Partnership**

In 1995 the Environmental Programs Division established a partnership with the City's Parks Division, Santa Monica/Malibu Unified School District, Woodlawn Cemetery and Santa Monica College in an effort to reduce landscape irrigation water use. As part of this program 28 major sites covering 133 acres of landscaping will be linked through a computerized irrigation management system intended to maximize water efficiency while maintaining landscape quality. The program is projected to save 75 acre feet of water per year. To date, irrigation system audits and upgrades to field equipment have been completed at all of the sites in preparation for the installation of the central control computer and the beginning of comprehensive personnel training. The central controller will be purchased in the Fall of 1996 and should be on-line by early 1997.

Recommendations

- 1.) If the City is to achieve its 20 percent water-use reduction goal it needs to focus on reducing outdoor water-use. It is anticipated that the new conservation-based water rate structure will help to accomplish this. It is recommended that water-use be evaluated after the new rates have been in effect for one year to determine the effect the rates have had on water use. If no significant improvement is attained, the City should then investigate additional educational and/or policy measures to encourage reductions in outdoor water use.
- 2.) Additional efforts should be made to educate the public about the No Water Waste Ordinance and to investigate ways to improve enforcement of the ordinance.

ENERGY

Background

Electricity and natural gas are the primary sources of energy* used in Santa Monica. Southern California Edison and The Gas Company provide electricity and natural gas, respectively, to Santa Monica customers under long-term franchise agreements with the City. Edison generates electricity primarily from a combination of petroleum-based products (coal, natural gas, and oil) supplemented by hydroelectric, nuclear, and renewable resources such as wind and solar power. The Gas Company pumps natural gas to Santa Monica from an underground storage field located in Playa del Rey. In 1994, Santa Monica residents, businesses, and institutions spent approximately \$98 million for energy, of this approximately \$80 million was for 728 million kilowatt hours of electricity and \$18 million was for 2,548 million cubic feet of natural gas. In that year energy purchases for City facilities totaled approximately \$2.3 million.

Energy programs and policies for the City are coordinated by staff in the Environmental Programs Division of the Environmental and Public Works Management Department. The City initiated its energy efficiency efforts in 1983 with a residential audit and weatherization program known as the Energy Fitness Program. More than 8,300 Santa Monica households were retrofitted with energy-saving devices by energy auditors going door-to-door through residential neighborhoods. The program was funded by Edison and the Gas Company as part of the federally-mandated National Energy Conservation Policy Act of 1978.

In 1993, the City began development of a long-term energy efficiency strategy for Santa Monica as part of the Sustainable City Program. City staff and an outside consultant conducted a preliminary analysis of the energy efficiency potential of the residential, commercial, institutional, and industrial sectors of Santa Monica which led to the establishment of a 16 percent reduction in citywide energy use by the year 2000 as an indicator target for the Sustainable City Program. The goals of the City's energy efficiency strategy are outlined below:

- Optimize cost-effective energy efficiency investments in all sectors of the community.
- Ensure energy supply reliability and price stability.
- Reduce the environmental and public health impacts created by energy generation and consumption both globally and locally.
- Increase the use of renewable resources.
- Ensure equitable distribution of the costs and benefits created by the restructuring of the electric utilities in California.
- Use the Total Energy Services approach to gain greater control of the city's energy future and retain more financial investment within the community.

Existing Programs and Policies

• ENVEST Energy Efficiency Retrofits of City Facilities

ENVEST is a subsidiary of Southern California Edison dedicated to providing energy efficiency services to Edison customers and is funded predominantly by Edison shareholders. In March 1995, the City negotiated a \$1.6 million lease-purchase agreement with Edison for the purchase and installation of energy efficient equipment (primarily lighting, heating and cooling system upgrades, and energy control systems for buildings) for City facilities. Cost savings realized through reduced energy consumption is being used to offset the cost to pay back ENVEST's initial capital investment. The payback period for this program is 12 years. Once the investment is paid back, all savings will accrue to the City. All of the equipment

* Discussion about "energy" in this section refers to energy use from all non-mobile sources. Energy used in vehicles and for transportation purposes is not included. Discussion of transportation-related programs and policies can be found in the "Transportation" section of this report.

installed has a useful life far longer than the 12 year payback period for the investment. Phase I of this program was recently completed and involved the installation of energy efficient equipment in City Hall, the Police Station, the Civic Auditorium, the Main Library, the Fairview and Ocean Park Branch Libraries, and the six City-owned parking structures. City staff and ENVEST are currently working out the details of the second phase of this project which will complete the retrofit of the remaining City facilities during 1997.

- **ICLEI Cities for Climate Protection Program**

Santa Monica became a member of the International Council for Local Environmental Initiatives' (ICLEI) Cities for Climate Protection Program in 1995. This program promotes actions by local governments throughout the world to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. By joining the campaign, the City has committed to conduct a citywide greenhouse gas emissions analysis, establish a greenhouse gas reduction goal, and develop and implement a plan to achieve that goal. The emissions reduction plan will include energy efficiency programs aimed at transportation, buildings, resource management, and land use. ICLEI is providing free assistance to the City for the emissions analysis and development and implementation of the emissions reduction plan. City staff began compiling data for the city-wide emissions analysis this year and plans to develop the emissions reduction target and plan in 1997.

- **Environmental Protection Agency's Green Lights Program**

Santa Monica signed a Memorandum of Understanding with the EPA's Green Lights Program in 1994 that states the City's intention to audit and retrofit City facilities with energy efficient lighting systems provided the planned retrofits prove cost-effective. Under this voluntary program, the EPA is providing information on energy efficient lighting technology, information about financing options, and public recognition opportunities. The City has committed to retrofit at least 90 percent of the square footage at City facilities found to be cost-effective within 5 years. City staff reports annually to the EPA on its progress completing the retrofits. All of the City facilities retrofitted with energy efficient lighting through the ENVEST project also qualify for credit under the Green Lights Program.

- **Aspen Accord**

In 1993, the City joined the California Energy Coalition, a nonprofit organization dedicated to assisting cities and businesses with implementation of energy efficiency solutions. The Coalition facilitated an accord signed by representatives from Southern California Edison, The Gas Company, the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC), the U.S. cities of Santa Monica, Irvine, and Aspen, and the Swedish cities of Nacka and Gothenberg. The accord commits these agencies to form partnerships dedicated to developing and implementing a Total Energy Services approach for the integration of energy demand management and energy procurement. The restructuring of the electric utilities industry taking place in California and Sweden has provided members of the Aspen Accord with opportunities to benefit from other accord members' experiences with deregulation and implementation of innovative approaches to energy management.

Accomplishments

- **ENVEST Energy Efficiency Retrofits of City Facilities**

City facilities retrofitted with energy efficient lighting and improvements to existing heating and cooling systems include City Hall and the Police Department, the Civic Auditorium, Main Library, Fairview and Ocean Park branch libraries, and the six downtown parking structures. The retrofits at these sites will save a total of 1.8 million kilowatt hours of electricity per year and will provide an estimated \$193,463 in annual energy cost savings to the City after the initial ENVEST investment is repaid. The City also benefits from this project by avoiding the capital investment needed to make costly infrastructure improvements to these facilities.

Over 10 years, the energy efficiency measures installed at these sites will reduce greenhouse gas emissions (carbon dioxide) by 11,090 tons. According to Edison, electricity accounts for the generation of

about 8,000 pounds of carbon dioxide per household per year in Southern California. The ENVEST project will therefore save the greenhouse gas emissions equivalent of 277 Santa Monica households.

• **Green Lights Program**

To date, the City has upgraded 52% of the square footage covered under this program with energy efficient lighting. Lighting retrofits are the most cost-effective method of saving energy and have the fastest rate of return on investment. All of the sites retrofitted with energy efficient lighting systems under the ENVEST program qualify for achieved savings under the Green Lights Program. Under the ENVEST program, all six downtown parking garages were retrofitted with efficient lighting systems at a cost of \$198,750. Reduced electricity consumption at those sites (558,775 kilowatt hours per year) will save the City over \$60,000 per year. Lighting retrofits at City Hall and the Police Department have been completed at a cost of \$39,975 and are expected to save over \$14,000 per year and reduce electricity consumption over 130,500 kilowatt hours per year.

Progress Towards Goal

The Sustainable City Program indicator target for energy calls for a 16% reduction in citywide energy use from the 1990 baseline of 4.0 million mBTUs by the year 2000. The baseline figure and the 16% reduction target are based on a preliminary analysis, conducted in 1994 by an outside consultant, of citywide energy use and the energy efficiency potential of the residential, commercial, institutional, and industrial sectors of Santa Monica. The figures presented in that analysis were subsequently determined to be incorrect. Corrected figures for citywide energy use for the years 1990, 1991, 1994 and 1995 have since been obtained from energy providers and are presented in the table below.

CITYWIDE ENERGY USE IN SANTA MONICA
(all units in million mBTUs)

1990

	Residential	Commercial	Industrial	Other	Total
Electricity	0.64	1.50	0.18	0.13	2.45
Natural Gas	1.89	1.97	0.14	N/A	4.00
Total	2.53	3.47	0.32	0.13	6.45

1991

	Residential	Commercial	Industrial	Other	Total
Electricity	0.63	1.48	0.17	0.11	2.39
Natural Gas	1.94	1.20	0.13	N/A	3.27
Total	2.57	2.68	0.30	0.11	5.66

1994

	Residential	Commercial	Industrial	Other	Total
Electricity	0.64	1.53	0.17	0.14	2.48
Natural Gas	1.81	0.76	0.05	N/A	2.62
Total	2.45	2.29	0.22	0.14	5.10

1995

	Residential	Commercial	Industrial	Other	Total
Electricity	0.63	1.59	0.18	0.13	2.53
Natural Gas	1.80	1.26	0.04	N/A	3.10
Total	2.43	2.85	0.22	0.13	5.63

Note: Data for 1990 and 1991 were obtained from the City's Master Environmental Assessment (MEA) published in 1993. Data for 1994 were obtained from the 1996 MEA. Data for 1995 were obtained from Southern California Edison and The Gas Company by City staff. All data presented the MEA reports were obtained from Edison and The Gas Company by consultants working for the City. Figures for energy use have been converted to million MBTUs from kilowatt hours (KWH), and figures for natural gas use have been converted from millions of cubic feet (MCF).

As the figures above indicate, there have been fluctuations on the order of 15% to 20% in citywide energy use between 1990 and 1995. The causes of these fluctuations are not presently understood, and therefore further analysis of Santa Monica's energy profile is required to determine whether the current 16 % energy efficiency goal by the year 2000 is measurable and appropriate, or if an alternative goal should be identified and adopted. It is not likely that the fluctuations in energy use can be attributed to the Sustainable City Program because the City has not yet developed or implemented a citywide energy efficiency plan, and the City's existing energy efficiency programs would not result in changes of the magnitude seen here. It is more likely that the fluctuations in energy use reflect changing economic conditions experienced in the region during that period.

Obstacles

In September 1996 California passed legislation to restructure the investor-owned electrical utilities in the state. As part of the restructuring process, retail competition for the sale of electric power will be phased in over 5 years beginning in 1998. This will allow large energy users to purchase electricity on the free market from suppliers located throughout the country at significantly lower rates than are currently available. Lower energy prices will tend to diminish or eliminate the monetary incentive for energy customers to reduce their usage by becoming more efficient. This situation will likely impair the City's efforts to reduce citywide energy use.

Other concerns about the impact of restructuring on smaller consumers such as residents and small businesses will also need to be addressed as the deregulation process unfolds. City staff are actively monitoring the restructuring process and are meeting with energy industry experts to evaluate potential options for Santa Monica's energy future.

Plans for the Future

• Total Energy Services

Total Energy Services (TES) is an approach to providing energy services for existing buildings and new development which places full responsibility for energy supply and demand services on one energy utility or energy services provider. This includes the design, construction, operation, and maintenance of all energy systems within a facility, including the heating, cooling, refrigeration, and lighting systems as well as the procurement of energy supply. The City has completed a TES master plan for the proposed redevelopment of the Civic Center and will be initially focusing on incorporating a TES approach into the design and construction of the proposed Public Safety Facility.

The electric utility restructuring process currently underway in California is designed to stimulate competition among energy suppliers. TES will allow the City to purchase energy at a low cost by

contracting with energy suppliers for heating, lighting, cooling, and other energy-related services. TES will provide the City with the opportunity to achieve significant efficiency and cost savings while achieving its sustainability goal of energy independence.

- **Traffic Signals**

The City's Parking and Traffic Engineering Department plans to retrofit all of the city's red traffic signals with energy efficient liquid emitting diode lights in 1997. The total cost will be \$500,000-\$600,000 with a payback within 3 years. Current models of energy efficient lights do not provide the same amount of lumens for green and yellow lights.

- **ENVEST Phase II**

The City is reviewing a proposal for the second phase of the ENVEST project which will retrofit the remaining City Facilities with energy efficient lighting, upgrade existing heating and cooling systems, and install direct digital building control systems into larger buildings. Work is expected to be completed in 1997.

Recommendations

- 1.) Develop Citywide Energy Efficiency Plan and Revise Indicator Target**

Environmental and Public Works Management staff should develop and implement a citywide energy efficiency plan that includes an analysis of existing citywide energy use, a re-evaluation of the Sustainable City Program indicator target, a strategy for facilitating the adoption of energy efficiency measures by commercial, institutional and residential customers in Santa Monica, and an implementation timeline.

- 2.) Adopt a Greenhouse Gas Reduction Target as a Sustainable City Program Indicator**

Following completion of the greenhouse gas emission analysis for the city and development of an emission reduction plan, the emission reduction target adopted in the plan should be incorporated as an indicator for the Sustainable City Program.

- 3.) Implement Total Energy Services Approach for Proposed Public Safety Facility**

Should the City proceed with development of the Public Safety Facility at the Civic Center, it is recommended that the Total Energy Services approach be incorporated in the development of the facility, since this approach will provide a cost-effective method of financing the energy systems within the structure and an incentive-based contract for operation and maintenance services and procurement of energy supply.

PURCHASING

Background

City Purchasing Process

Procurement of goods and services in the City is processed by the Purchasing Division of the Finance Department. The division is staffed by a Purchasing Agent and two Buyers. The City has in place four main purchasing procedures that differ depending on the cost of the goods or services purchased. These procedures are described below.

- **Request For Warrant (\$0 - \$100)**

These are prepared by City staff to obtain reimbursements for purchases made with petty cash or out-of-pocket expenditures. They must be approved by an authorized person in the department/division of origin and are forwarded to the Accounts Payable division of the Finance Department for payment after the purchase has been made. Requests For Warrants are not monitored or reviewed by Purchasing Division staff.

- **Quick Purchase Order (\$0 - \$1000)**

These are prepared by the department or division making the purchase request, approved by an authorized person from the department/division of origin, and forwarded to Accounts Payable for payment. The vendor named in the QPO must submit an invoice to the City following delivery of the specified goods or services to receive payment. No bids are required for QPOs (vendor is chosen directly by the dept./division making the purchase request) and they are typically not reviewed by Purchasing Division staff unless a problem with the order arises.

- **Informal Bid Process (\$1001 - \$24,999)**

Department/division staff must complete a requisition form, attach specifications for the goods or services required, and forward it to the Purchasing Division. Purchasing Division buyers then contact vendors by telephone, fax or mail to obtain a minimum of three bids* to supply the required item. During this process a request for bid is posted in the Finance office and bidding is open to any vendor wishing to place a bid. The contract is typically awarded to the vendor with the "lowest and most responsible" bid which meets the bid specifications. Following award of the contract, a purchase order is prepared and transmitted to Accounts Payable for the vendor to bill against. (*whenever possible)

- **Formal Sealed Bid Process (\$25,000 and over)**

Department/division staff must complete a requisition form, attach specifications for the goods or services required, and forward it to the Purchasing Division. A bid request is prepared and forwarded to the City Attorney and City Manager for approval. The buyers then post the bid request in the Finance office, advertise the bid request for 2 days in the local newspaper, and contact vendors directly to invite them to submit sealed bids. Following receipt of the bids, Purchasing staff prepare a staff report to City Council transmitting their award recommendation. The recommendation must be approved by Council before the contract can be awarded. The contract is typically awarded to the vendor with the "lowest and most responsible" bid which meets the bid specifications. Professional services contracts are handled by the user department in accordance with set guidelines because the decisions usually require special knowledge or expertise. In these cases, the department/division in need of the services issues a request for qualifications or request for proposal, organizes and conducts the bid review process, and obtains the required approval from the City Manager (for contracts up to \$50,000) or from City Council (contracts over \$50,000).

Record Keeping

The Finance Department's computer system, the Financial Management System (FMS), was installed in 1989 and includes a general ledger and modules for accounts payable, purchasing, and warehouse inventory. The purchasing module allows the staff person making a purchase request to create a requisition on-line and

transmit it via modem to other staff for approvals and to the Purchasing and Accounts Payable divisions for processing. The system assigns a number to each requisition for tracking purposes and the requisitions are directly converted into purchase orders after bid awards are obtained. The system allows staff to track purchase orders, eliminates the need for requisition forms, and simplifies the process by which vendors are paid. One drawback of this existing system is that it only records the vendor name and how much the vendor was paid. The system does not compile data on the number and cost of individual goods or services purchased.

Hard copies of all purchase orders, QPOs and requests for warrants are kept on file by the Accounts Payable Division. Duplicate copies of purchase orders and QPOs are also on file with the Purchasing Division. These records are filed according to the department or division where they originated. These records are not maintained on computer so the City currently has no way to access annual purchase amount and cost information for individual categories of goods or services, other than by manually sorting through hard copy records from each department. Purchasing Division staff have indicated that they are developing a computer system to record and track QPOs that will be independent of FMS. This system is scheduled to be online by late 1996.

Recycled Products Working Group

The Recycled Products Working Group (RPWG) was formed in Fall 1991 to facilitate an increase in the number and types of recycled products purchased by the City by: monitoring the evolving products market to identify newly available recycled products; coordinating the testing of new recycled products; increasing the awareness of line staff about the availability of recycled products; and facilitating the writing of specifications for the purchase of recycled products. The RPWG included staff members from the following departments and divisions: Transportation, Finance, Land Use and Transportation Management, Recycling, Parks and Sports, City Clerk, Fire, Police, Information Systems, and Rent Control. The group met monthly over a 1 to 2 year period to discuss newly available recycled products, to hear presentations from recycled product vendors, and to obtain and share information about products currently being used or considered for use. The group eventually disbanded in 1993 due to a waning interest level among the members and poor attendance. No purchasing specifications were produced by the group.

Purchasing Task Group

This group was established as a subcommittee of the Sustainable City Working Group in August 1996 to: review and identify ways to strengthen existing purchasing policies to encourage or specify the purchase of environmentally preferable/sustainable goods and services; to identify ways to educate City staff about the City's purchasing policies; and to identify ways to track purchases and enforce the City's purchasing policies. The Task Group includes staff members from the Environmental Programs Division, Solid Waste Division, Purchasing Division, Police Department, Fire Department, City Clerk, Information Systems Division, and the Community and Cultural Services Division.

Purchasing Categories

A chart categorizing the goods and services that are purchased by the City was developed by staff based on a review of FY 1993-94 purchase order records for all departments. A copy of this chart is included at the end of this section as Attachment A. The chart provides a comprehensive overview of City purchasing and can be used to identify categories that have been addressed by purchasing policies or ordinances and highlight categories that need to be addressed in the future.

Existing Programs and Policies

• Recycled Products Procurement Policy (informal)

City staff developed this policy in 1991 to complement the City's recycling program. This is an informal policy that has not been adopted by the City Manager or by Council. The policy states the following:

- Whenever practicable*, products should be purchased which contain in order of preference:
 - 1.) the highest percentage of post-consumer recovered material available in the marketplace;

- 2.) the highest percentage of pre-consumer recovered material available in the marketplace; and
- 3.) paper products should at a minimum meet the State of California's definition of "recycled paper products" (at least 10% post-consumer recovered material and at least 50% total recovered material)

* "Whenever practicable" means a) the recycled products can perform the function intended at least as well as a product produced from only virgin material, and b) the cost of the recycled product reasonably approximates the cost of the product produced from only virgin materials.

- In addition to the recovered material content of a product, other important criteria considered in selecting products are:
 - 1.) the ability of a product and its packaging to be reused, reconditioned for use, or recycled through existing recycling collection programs; and
 - 2.) the volume and toxicity of waste and by-products a given product and its packaging generate in their manufacture, use, recycling and disposal.
- Equipment purchased or rented by the City are to be compatible, whenever practicable, with the use of recycled-content products (e.g. photocopy machines).
- Product specifications and requisitions for products must conform to the following guidelines:
 - 1.) specifications and requisitions shall not require the exclusive use of products made from virgin materials, nor specifically exclude the use of recycled-content products;
 - 2.) performance standards must be reasonable and related to function, and shall not be designed to exclude the purchase of recycled-content products;
 - 3.) to the extent such information is known, City staff shall identify in the purchase requisition products available with recycled content and vendors from whom such products are available; and
 - 4.) the Purchasing Agent has the authority to specify a minimum recycled-content standard in bid solicitations.

Product lines where recycled products have been substituted for virgin products in City purchases include: white bond photocopier paper, stationary supplies, janitorial paper products, aggregate for street resurfacing, plastic semi-automated refuse carts, motor oil, paint, automobile tires, green-bar computer paper, business cards, envelopes, letterhead paper, laser printer cartridges, and trash can liners.

• **Recycled Paper Purchasing Cooperative**

In the early 1990s the Purchasing Division formed a cooperative buying group for the purchase of recycled paper in order to reduce the price by making large bulk purchases. Members of the co-op included the City of Manhattan Beach, Santa Monica College and the Santa Monica-Malibu Unified School District. This arrangement was effective at reducing the City's cost for recycled paper to a level closely approximating the cost for virgin paper. Since 1995, however, due to the fluctuation of paper prices, the City has been buying its paper on the open market because it is more economical since paper suppliers could no longer guarantee a fixed cost for supplying paper to the co-op.

• **Administrative Instruction Pertaining to Office Paper**

In November 1995 the City adopted several policies pertaining to office paper in the form of an administrative instruction to all City employees. These policies were instituted to increase the purchase and use of recycled and tree-free paper products and help reduce the amount of waste generated in daily City operations. These policies specify that all writing pads, file folders, report covers, note pads, and envelopes not acquired from the City warehouse or through the purchasing division shall be recycled and/or tree-free products; require that all requests for outside printing specify the use of recycled or tree-free paper and vegetable-based printing inks; require that recycled paper and waste reduction specifications be included in all requests for submittals from outside contractors; and require that all City employees incorporate waste reduction measures into their operations and recycle mixed paper.

- **US Conference of Mayors/CALPIRG Buy Recycled Campaign**

In September 1995, City Council adopted a resolution pledging Santa Monica's support for the US Conference of Mayors/California Public Interest Research Group (CALPIRG) Buy Recycled Campaign. In supporting the campaign, the City pledges to 1) purchase recycled printing and writing paper containing at least 20% post-consumer recycled material; 2) purchase recycled printing and writing paper containing at least 30% post-consumer recycled material beginning in 1998; and 3) purchase rerefined motor oil and retread tires for City fleet vehicles where operationally feasible.

- **Janitorial Products Purchasing Criteria**

These criteria were developed as the first phase of the City's Toxics Use Reduction Program. This program began in 1993 and included a pilot testing phase to evaluate the effectiveness of various less-toxic or non-toxic alternative custodial products. City custodians were enlisted to test the products and provide feedback. The results of the pilot contributed to the development of bid specifications for the evaluation of bids from custodial product vendors. The specifications include environmental and public health criteria as well as performance and cost criteria. Products passing an initial set of pass/fail criteria are ranked in three categories: human health, environmental health, and corporate environmental responsiveness. Evaluation criteria for these categories include, among others, the presence of toxic ingredients, biodegradability, use of non-renewable resources in deriving the product, the amount, type, and recyclability of packaging, and documentation of cruelty-free product testing.

Implementation of the program has resulted in:

- Replacement of toxic products throughout the City with less or non-toxic alternatives in 15 of 17 cleaning product categories.
 - The elimination of approximately 3200 pounds of hazardous materials in products purchased annually.
 - A cost savings of approximately 5% resulting from the purchase of more concentrated products that have lower packaging and shipping costs; lower cost per application of the alternative products; and better, less wasteful use of products due to improved custodial training.
 - A proven and effective set of procurement specifications that can be adapted for use in future TUR efforts.
 - Increased morale of the custodians, who recognize the City's concern for their health and working conditions and who appreciate the opportunity to participate in making decisions about their work.
- Additional information about this policy can be found in the "Hazardous Materials" section of this report.

- **Tropical Rainforest Wood Purchasing Ban**

In 1990, City Council adopted into the City's Municipal Code a ban on the purchase or use by the City of any tropical hardwood product. The ban also prohibits the use of tropical hardwood products at City-sponsored events and requires suppliers of wood products to the City to ensure that neither the contents or packaging of the products they deliver contains tropical wood. This ban was enacted as an effort to reduce the demand for tropical wood to help slow the destruction of tropical rainforests.

- **Ozone-Depleting Chemical Purchasing Regulations**

In January 1991, City Council adopted into the City's Municipal Code several regulations related to the city-wide purchase and use of ozone-depleting compounds (ODCs). These regulations include a ban on the manufacture, sale or distribution of products using ODCs; a ban on the use of ODCs in building construction; mandatory recycling of ODCs used as coolants in mobile refrigerant/air conditioning systems; a restriction on the sale of ODCs used as coolants in refrigeration/air conditioning systems; a restriction on the release of halon from fire suppression systems; and mandatory recycling of halon from portable fire extinguishing systems. These regulations were adopted as an effort to reduce the impact ODCs have on human health and the environment locally and globally. Additional information about this policy can be found in the "Hazardous Materials" section of this report.

- **Reduced-Emission Fuel Policy for City Vehicle Purchases**

In December 1993, City Council adopted a policy to purchase reduced-emission fuel (REF) vehicles for the City fleet whenever possible in accordance with an operational review which determined which fleet vehicles would be suitable for REF use as well as the appropriate REF types to use. The policy also calls for annual updates of the operational analysis to ensure that the recommended fuel types are consistent with current technology. This policy was implemented in an effort to help the City reduce its use of non-renewable resources and improve local and regional air quality. For more detailed information on this policy please refer to the "Transportation" section of this report.

• Print Shop Purchasing Policy (informal)

The City's print shop has an informal policy to exclusively purchase and use recycled paper and vegetable-based printing inks, unless a printing request is submitted that cannot be completed using those products. Vegetable-based inks utilize vegetable oils as the pigment carrying medium. They are much less toxic than the petroleum-based inks they replace, producing about one twentieth the amount of volatile organic compounds, and can be cleaned up using less toxic cleaning products. They are also more amenable to recycling as they are easier to break down in the de-inking process than petroleum-based products. Print shop staff estimate that 99% of all printing jobs are completed using recycled paper and vegetable-based inks.

Progress Towards Goals

Recycled Paper Indicator

The only sustainability indicator directly related to purchasing is the Post-Consumer Recycled/Tree-Free Content of City Paper Product Purchases (The indicators for alternative fuel vehicles and citywide use of hazardous materials are affected by purchasing policies but these are more appropriately addressed in the "Transportation" and "Hazardous Materials" sections of this report). To achieve this indicator target, by the year 2000 all office paper products purchased by the City must contain an average of 50% post-consumer recycled or tree-free material. In 1995 staff reviewed all purchase orders for office paper from FY 1993-94 to determine the City's progress on this indicator.

The figures below summarize the City's purchases of copy paper (white and colored), report cover stock, carbonless form stock, computer paper, letterhead, and envelopes for FY 93 - 94 (a complete breakdown of the types, costs and amounts of paper products purchased is included at the end of this section as Attachment B). This represents all office paper purchased through the Purchasing Division and the Print Shop. Paper purchased by various City departments out of petty cash or using QPO's is not included in these figures because the amount and types of paper purchased cannot currently be tracked. Also not included is paper used in printing jobs completed outside the City's print shop because similarly there is no mechanism in place to determine the type and amount of paper used in these jobs.

City Office Paper Purchases (FY 1993-94)

- Total paper purchased** **6,441,820 sheets**
- Total cost of paper purchases** **\$54,022.30**
- Percent of total that is not recycled** **4.9% (312,500 sheets)**
- Paper purchases by type:**
 - White copy paper (50% total recycled content, 25% to 30% post-consumer).....**65%**
 - Computer paper (50% total, 10% post).....**6.9%**

- City letterhead (25% cotton, 60% pre, 15% post).....	3.8%
- Miscellaneous recycled paper and envelopes (50% total, 10% to 20% post).....	19.4%
- Miscellaneous virgin paper.....	4.9%
TOTAL.....	100%

It is difficult to determine an accurate single value for the percentage of post-consumer recycled content because the percentages vary with the type of paper product purchased, however, a weighted averaging of the data listed above results in an average post-consumer recycled content of approximately 22% for FY 93-94 City office paper purchases (excluding those made with petty cash or QPOs).

Although no formal policy exists, the Purchasing Division is currently buying paper with the highest percentage of post-consumer content available that “reasonably approximates” the price of comparable virgin products. Currently, white copy paper that meets these requirements contains 30% post-consumer material. Other categories of recycled paper products being bought by the City contain between 10% and 15% post-consumer material. With the current policy in place, meeting the Sustainable City Program indicator target for paper purchases entirely depends upon the availability of paper with 50% post-consumer or tree-free content that reasonably approximates the price of virgin paper in the year 2000.

Note: Because the Finance Department does not currently maintain computerized records of purchases that can be sorted by product type or that specify the amounts and types of products purchased, the data presented above and in Attachment B had to be compiled by a staff person who spent 1 week sorting through purchase order records by hand. A computerized system would greatly simplify this process and allow for quicker and more precise tracking of progress on this indicator.

Obstacles

• Tracking and Record Keeping

As stated above, the Finance Department’s computer system does not have the capability to access annual purchase amount and cost information for individual categories of goods or services. The only current way to obtain this information is to manually sort through hard copy purchase order records which is very labor intensive and time consuming. This makes it difficult to determine the progress on the recycled paper indicator and discourages the setting of any other purchasing-related indicators. The City is currently purchasing a variety of products containing recycled materials including motor oil, paint, trash can liners, and refuse carts but due to this situation the amounts and costs of these products cannot be easily tracked. Similarly, it is known that many departments are specifying tree-free paper or paper with high levels of post-consumer recycled material in outside printing jobs but because no tracking mechanism exists this data is not credited as progress towards meeting the paper indicator target.

• City Staff Awareness/Lack of Enforcement

The Purchasing Task Group has determined that other than tracking capability, the biggest obstacle to the effective implementation of policies to promote the purchase of environmentally-preferable goods and services is lack of staff awareness, both about the City’s policies and product availability. Purchasing Division staff have reported that due to a lack of awareness about City purchasing policies and the lack of enforcement mechanisms, City staff often do not follow existing purchasing policies. This is particularly prevalent in purchases made with petty cash and QPOs because Purchasing Division staff don't see the paperwork until after the purchases have been made.

• Implementation of the Recycled Products Procurement Policy

This informal policy identifies important criteria to be considered in selecting products including the ability of a product and its packaging to be reused or recycled, and the volume and toxicity of waste a given product and its packaging generates due to its manufacture, use and disposal. These criteria are necessary and many others could be added to the list, however, Purchasing Division staff have neither the time nor the expertise to address them so they are typically overlooked. In addition, the end users requesting the products typically aren't aware of the policy and of the recycled products available that can meet their needs. Because this policy has not been formally adopted by the City, Purchasing staff are not in a position to enforce it. The Recycled Products Working Group was formed in part to help implement this policy but later disbanded without establishing a permanent implementation strategy.

Plans for the Future

• Vehicle Replacement Policy

Under the lead of the Environmental and Public Works Management Department, City staff have drafted a vehicle replacement policy in an effort to upgrade the City's aging fleet, reduce costs, provide accountability for fleet costs, improve fleet maintenance services, and to help reach the alternative-fueled vehicle target specified in the Sustainable City Program. The policy was approved by City Council in June 1996 and is included in the City's fiscal year 1996-97 budget. The policy institutes a program that establishes a replacement schedule for all fleet vehicles (excludes Transportation Department, Police Department, Harbor Division and Fire Department vehicles) based on the remaining useful life, maintenance history and use of the vehicle. Prior to the development of this policy, no uniform vehicle replacement policy existed at the City. The replacement program specified in this policy schedules and funds regular replacement of all vehicles, provides information on vehicle replacement and operating costs to departments, and ensures the attainment of the Sustainable City Program goal of 75% of the fleet powered by alternative fuels by the year 2000. The vehicle replacement policy is discussed in more detail in the "Transportation" section of this report.

• Update of Cleaning Products Purchasing Criteria

Environmental Programs Division staff have found the purchasing criteria to be highly effective, however, due to their complexity and comprehensive nature they create a lengthy evaluation process. To remedy this situation, staff plan to revise the criteria in an effort to simplify the evaluation process while retaining strict standards. Staff estimate that the revised standards will be in place by the end of 1996.

Recommendations

- 1.) Development of tracking capability for City purchases should be made a high priority. The Purchasing Task Group should determine if the existing Financial Management System can be cost-effectively upgraded to include a commodity code system to track annual purchase amounts and cost information. If this is not feasible, it is recommended that a new system with tracking capability be purchased as soon as possible. Information Systems staff have indicated that funds to hire a consultant to specify a new system to replace the Financial Management System have been included in the FY 1996-97 budget and funds for the new system will be included in the FY 1997-98 budget. The Purchasing Task Group, as well as staff from Purchasing, Information Systems, Environmental Programs and various other user groups should be involved in the development of specifications for this system.
- 2.) The Purchasing Division should work on developing and expanding its in-house computer system to track QPOs using commodity codes.
- 3.) The Purchasing Task Group should continue to meet to determine ways to improve staff awareness and to improve existing purchasing policies. The group should determine the feasibility of: formalizing the currently informal Recycled Products Procurement Policy as an administrative instruction or through Council approval to provide Purchasing staff with a method of enforcement; revising the Purchasing

Division's definition of the term "responsible bid" to include some level of environmental performance; and requiring suppliers to provide the City with annual summaries of the products supplied, with recycled or environmentally preferable products highlighted to help track purchases from outside vendors. The group should also identify and prioritize categories of goods and services for future development of sustainable purchasing criteria. Additional indicators should be developed based on the group's recommendations.

- 4.) Because attainment of the paper purchasing indicator target is limited by current City purchasing policy and the cost of recycled paper, the target should be reviewed following the adoption of recommendations from the Purchasing Task Group and then revised accordingly.

CONSTRUCTION AND DEVELOPMENT

Background

Oversight of construction and development activities as well as long-range planning for Santa Monica is provided by the City's Department of Planning and Community Development (PCD). The City's long-range planning, development and growth policies are set forth in the General Plan, which contains the following 7 elements: Land Use, Circulation, Open Space, Conservation, Housing, Safety, and Noise. For certain regions of the city, Specific Plans have been developed which specify development and growth policies for each region. The Specific Plans and the Elements of the General Plan are described in more detail later in this section.

Plans for all proposed construction and development projects in Santa Monica must be first submitted to the PCD's Building and Safety Division for review. Building and Safety plan checkers verify that proposed projects comply with the Uniform Building Code, the City Municipal Code, State Title 24 requirements, and the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) requirements. Depending on the scope and nature of the project, the plans may be forwarded to the Planning and Zoning Division for further review prior to issuance of building permits. The PCD's Planning and Zoning Division is responsible for interpreting the Zoning Ordinance (see below) as well as processing development and subdivision applications, forwarding plans to the appropriate commissions or boards for review, assuring project compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), conducting design review of proposed buildings and provide staffing assistance to the Planning Commission, the Architectural Review Board, the Landmarks Commission and the Zoning Administrator. These commissions and boards make determinations on a variety of planning and development issues and are briefly described below:

Planning Commission - A seven member panel appointed by City Council to four year terms. The Commission meets twice monthly to review requests for development permits, conditional use permits, appeals to Zoning Administrator decisions, and planning policy matters. The Commission conducts public hearings on most of its agenda items. Within each zoning district there is a specific square footage threshold for development review. The Planning Commission reviews projects exceeding these thresholds as well as projects that require conditional use permits. Planning Commission decisions can be appealed to the City Council.

Architectural Review Board - A seven member panel appointed by City Council to four year terms. The ARB is required to include at least two registered professional architects as well as persons with expertise in conservation, recreation, design, landscaping, the arts, urban planning, cultural-historical preservation, and ecological and environmental sciences. The board meets twice monthly to review the exterior design of all buildings (except single family residences), signs and landscaping. The board was formed to ensure that new development upholds the appearance of the community and reviews proposed projects to ensure that they are compatible with the neighborhood and in compliance with landscaping and sign requirements. ARB decisions can be appealed to the City Council.

Landmarks Commission - A seven member panel appointed by City Council. Commission members include a registered architect, a local historian, an architectural historian, and a California-licensed real estate agent. The commission meets monthly and is charged with the task of designating buildings in the city as historic landmarks, designating historic districts and updating the city's historic resources inventory. Landmarks Commission decisions can be appealed to the City Council.

Zoning Administrator - The Zoning Administrator is a PCD staff member and has the authority to rule on various zoning matters such as administrative approvals, temporary use permits, performance standards permits, variances, use permits, and reduced parking permits. Discretionary Zoning Administrator decisions can be appealed to the Planning Commission.

Municipal construction and development projects are overseen by the Engineering Division of the Department of Environmental and Public Works Management. All municipal projects are subject to the same plan check process and requirements as private development.

Existing Planning and Permitting Documents

These documents set forth guidelines for long-range planning, development and growth in Santa Monica.

• General Plan

State planning law requires that each city and county in California have a General Plan which addresses all aspects of future growth, development, and conservation and contains the following seven “elements”: Land Use, Circulation, Housing, Conservation, Noise, Open Space, and Safety. Santa Monica’s General Plan provides broad, long-range goals and objectives, policies, and standards for all future development within the city. The primary implementation mechanism of the General Plan policies is the Zoning Ordinance (see below) which translates the generalized nature of the policies outlined in the various elements into specific development standards. The General Plan Elements are typically prepared by outside consultants with oversight by PCD staff and input from the Planning Commission, City staff and members of the community. All elements receive final review and approval from the City Council. Brief descriptions of the Elements of Santa Monica’s General Plan are provided below.

• Land Use Element

The Land Use Element was originally adopted by Council in 1958 and was updated in 1984 and amended in 1987. It addresses: the proposed general distribution and location of housing, business, industry, open space, education, public buildings and grounds, and other categories of land use; policy standards of population density and building use intensity; and contains specific development standards outlining the appropriate development densities and intensities for all land use districts.

• Circulation Element

The Circulation Element was originally adopted by Council in 1958, was updated in 1984 and amended in 1987, and is currently undergoing another comprehensive update which is scheduled for completion in early 1997. It includes major circulation plan goals, policies and programs, and provides supporting information on the street classification system, neighborhood traffic control plan, public transportation plan, non-motorized transportation plan, and parking plan. For additional information on the Circulation Element please refer to the “Transportation” section of this report.

• Open Space Element

The Open Space Element was originally adopted in 1973 and is currently undergoing a comprehensive update which is scheduled for completion in early 1997. The stated objective of the existing Element is to define and identify those open space uses important to the community and to provide a program assuring their preservation. The Element includes an open space inventory, analysis, and map, and a policy program addressing preservation measures. The updated Open Space Element will include a vision statement outlining the comprehensive open space, community parks and recreation system in Santa Monica; an inventory of open space resources; a community user profile; long-range goals, objectives and policies; and a list of funding and implementation strategies. For additional information on the Open Space Element, please refer to the “Community and Economic Development” section of this report.

• Housing Element

The most recent version of the Housing Element was adopted in 1993 and is currently undergoing a comprehensive update which is scheduled for completion in early 1997. It profiles the demographic composition of the city, and outlines the goals, policies and programs which the city will undertake to ensure that the housing needs of existing residents and those expected to move into the community over the next five years are met. For additional information on the Housing Element, please refer to the “Housing” section of this report.

- **Conservation Element**

Santa Monica's Conservation Element was adopted in 1975. It is scheduled to be updated beginning in late 1996 or early 1997. The Element contains a list of conservation goals and objectives developed by a citizens advisory committee; an evaluation of Santa Monica's natural resources including "beach", "water", "land", and "air" resources; and a listing of policy statements and programs addressing the stated goals and objectives.

- **Noise Element**

The Noise Element was originally adopted in 1975 and a comprehensive update was completed and adopted in 1992. It contains an analysis and quantification of noise levels and the extent of noise exposure in the community, and establishes policies and programs to minimize the exposure of community residents to excessive noise.

- **Safety Element**

The most recent update of the Safety Element was adopted in 1995. The Element's basic objective is to "reduce death, injuries, property damage, and economic and social impact from hazards". It provides: an assessment of natural and human-related hazards in the city; a framework to introduce safety considerations into the land use planning process; and policies to help identify and reduce hazards in existing development, strengthen hazard preparedness planning, and post-disaster reconstruction.

- **Specific Plans**

Specific Plans have been prepared for three regions of the city requiring detailed regulations, conditions, and guidelines not provided for in the General Plan. These include the Civic Center, the Bayside District, and the Hospital Area and are described below.

- **Civic Center Specific Plan**

The Civic Center Specific Plan (CCSP) is a long-range master plan that sets forth standards for the redevelopment of Santa Monica's Civic Center area, a 45 acre site bounded by Fourth Street, Pico Boulevard, Ocean Avenue and Colorado Avenue that includes City Hall, the County Courthouse, the Civic Auditorium and the RAND Corporation property. The CCSP, which was unanimously approved by City Council and approved by voters on the June 1994 ballot, was developed by a design consultant with oversight from the City Council and the Santa Monica's Planning Commission. A central requirement of the CCSP is that development of the site be consistent with the intent, goals and policies of the Sustainable City Program.

- **Bayside District Specific Plan**

The original version of this document was called the Third Street Mall Specific Plan and was adopted in 1986 to provide a "framework of strategies to revitalize Santa Monica's downtown pedestrian mall and surrounding peripheral areas". An updated plan was adopted in January 1996 to provide a "framework for maintaining the area's character while allowing for continued revitalization". The plan establishes the regulations, programs and legislation related to development in the Bayside District, which is the area bounded by Wilshire Boulevard, Broadway, the east side of Fourth Street, and the west side of Second Street. The Bayside District Specific Plan contains a requirement that new development within the Bayside District shall in no way hinder the achievement of the goals and objectives of the Santa Monica Sustainable City Program and shall comply with the City's Sustainable Development Guidelines (see below) currently being formulated.

- **Hospital Area Specific Plan**

The Hospital Area Specific Plan was originally adopted in 1988 and was revised in 1993 to incorporate an amendment filed by St. John's Hospital to reflect a zone change. The plan establishes development standards appropriate for development in the hospital area given existing land uses, the unique concerns of each hospital, and the expressed concerns of neighbors surrounding the area of each

hospital. The hospital specific plan area is located near the center of the city and is approximately bounded by Wilshire Boulevard, Euclid Avenue, Broadway Avenue, and Chelsea Avenue.

- **Zoning Ordinance**

The City's Zoning Ordinance provides a set of guidelines and development standards for achieving the goals and objectives set forth in the General Plan. Included in this document are permitted uses, project design and development standards, parking requirements, application requirements, hearing procedures and other information regarding land use and development in the City.

- **Master Environmental Assessment**

The Master Environmental Assessment (MEA) is a planning document that was originally developed in 1992 to provide a baseline for environmental impact reports (EIRs) prepared for development projects in Santa Monica. Prior to the development of the MEA, EIRs presented to the City typically contained significantly different and inconsistent baseline assumptions. All consultants preparing EIRs for the City are now required to use the baseline data set forth in the MEA. Since 1992 the MEA has been updated twice, with the most recent edition having been approved by City Council in April 1996.

The MEA describes the existing environmental, infrastructure and fiscal conditions of the City and provides an analysis of future development projects in the City for each condition. The most recent MEA edition lists a total of 26 non-residential development projects totaling approximately 1.68 million square feet that are planned, approved or under construction in Santa Monica. Approximately 72% of the total square footage is office related, with the remaining 28% primarily entertainment and restaurant space and a small amount of service-oriented usage. A total of 660 additional dwelling units, 175 hotel rooms and 12 bed and breakfast rooms are proposed.

Existing Sustainable Development Policies

Listed below are policies that were instituted to help reduce the environmental impacts of development projects and help the City achieve its sustainability goals.

- **Urban Runoff Pollution Control Ordinance**

This ordinance was adopted by City Council in 1992 and requires specific best management practices designed to keep hazardous materials and sediments out of the stormdrain system and reduce the volume of runoff from existing developments, new developments and projects under construction. The ordinance requires developers to incorporate design elements that reduce runoff by 20% for all new development projects in Santa Monica. In addition, building contractors are required to follow certain good housekeeping rules to reduce runoff from sites under construction. For more details please refer to the "Stormwater, Wastewater and Santa Monica Bay" section of this report.

- **Water Demand Mitigation Fee**

Adopted in 1991, this fee applies to all non-residential development which affects or alters any plumbing fixture; all single family development which is defined as a substantial remodel and increases the square footage of the principal building by more than 50%; and all multi-family development which is defined as a substantial remodel and which increases the number of dwelling units on the property. Initially the fee was charged in an amount sufficient to mitigate twice the estimated daily water consumption rate projected for the development. When the drought was officially declared over in 1992 the fee was reduced by half. The collected revenues fund the City's water conservation programs. For more details please refer to the "Water" section of this report.

Existing Sustainable Development Programs and Projects

Listed below are recent efforts by the City to demonstrate and promote sustainable design, planning and construction methods.

- **Construction and Demolition Waste Recycling Guidebook**

In an effort to encourage local building contractors to begin recycling construction and demolition waste, the City published and distributed this guide to all building contractors licensed to work in Santa Monica. The guide provides techniques on how to minimize construction site waste and provides listings of companies that reuse or recycle building materials and demolition wastes located in Santa Monica and throughout the Los Angeles area.

- **Civic Center Sustainable Design Charette**

This event, a design workshop which took place in October 1995, was organized by the American Institute of Architects (AIA) Committee on the Environment and the Eco-Cities Council to generate ideas for integrating sustainable design principles for Santa Monica's proposed Civic Center redevelopment. The event was one of eighteen sustainable design charettes organized by the AIA which took place throughout the country in October. Sustainable design experts including architects, landscape architects, planners, biologists, engineers and others from throughout the United States and Canada participated in the charette. A summary of ideas and recommendations from the charette is scheduled to be completed in early 1997.

- **Parking Structure #5 Demonstration Project**

Many sustainable design and construction elements are being incorporated into this remodel of the parking structure's lobby and public restrooms. These include recycled rubber flooring, recycled plastic restroom partitions, recycled plastic counter tops, recycled metal hand railings, a Syndecrete concrete wall incorporating recycled materials as aggregate, energy efficient light fixtures, and water conserving plumbing fixtures. Various educational elements will be incorporated into this demonstration project to inform the public about its sustainable elements. The design phase has been completed and construction began in mid-1996. The Engineering Division of the City's Environmental and Public Works Management Department is providing oversight for this project.

- **Remodel of Water Division offices at the City Yards**

Another project being overseen by the Engineering Division, this remodel will also incorporate many sustainable elements including: carpets made from recycled plastics, recycled plastic restroom partitions, recycled content fiberglass insulation, ceramic tiles made with recycled glass, water-based carpet adhesives, and non-VOC paints. All lumber used will be from certified sustainable tree farms. The project has been designed to exceed State Title 24 energy efficiency requirements by 20% and will incorporate energy efficient lighting fixtures and tinting on all windows. Roof drainage will be directed towards planters to reduce runoff from the site. Educational information about the project will be displayed at the public counter. The design phase of this project has been completed and construction began in March 1996.

Progress Towards Goals

Specific goals have not been set in the Sustainable City Program for construction and development projects. However, construction, development and long-range planning in the city likely have a significant affect on a majority of the program indicators including energy use, water use, volumes of landfilled solid waste, wastewater flow volumes, stormwater discharges, city-wide use of hazardous materials, amount of public open space, and the amount of affordable housing units.

Obstacles

To date, little effort has been made to document the individual or cumulative environmental effects of new development projects as they relate to the indicators*. Environmental Impact Reports prepared for larger

* One effort that has been completed is an analysis of the Urban Runoff Pollution Control Ordinance that was prepared in 1995. The analysis indicated that seven sites that had filed urban runoff

development projects present estimates of projected environmental impacts but these do not specifically address the indicators and they are not measured or verified following construction. This information is not essential but would be helpful when deciding where to direct future conservation and planning efforts.

It is likely that long range planning also has a significant affect on the resources highlighted by the indicators. However, to date, none of the General Plan Elements have been developed with sustainability or the Sustainable City Program indicators in mind.

Plans for the Future

• Sustainable Development Guidelines

The City is in the process of developing a set of guidelines that encourage environmentally preferable design and construction methods for buildings and other construction projects in Santa Monica. The guidelines will apply to all types of municipal and private development projects. A sustainable design consultant is currently working with City staff and a community stakeholder group to formulate the guidelines. The format for the guidelines has not been finalized, but they will likely include some mandatory provisions (i.e. a Construction and Demolition Waste Recycling Ordinance) as well as voluntary guidelines with an incentive system to encourage their use by developers. A draft of the guidelines is scheduled to be completed by November 1996. Beginning in early 1997 the guidelines consultant team will facilitate several public meetings with designers, contractors, developers, financial institutions, and members of the public to ensure that the guidelines are practical and meet the needs of the community.

• Emergency Services Facility

This facility is planned as the first phase of the Civic Center redevelopment. It will serve as the headquarters for the City's Police and Fire Departments and will house an Emergency Operations Center for the coordination of emergency management and response. The Environmental and Public Works Management Department is developing a Total Energy Services (TES) approach to be incorporated in the design and construction of the facility. This approach involves contracting with an energy utility to design, build out and operate the facility's energy plant, including heating, refrigeration, air conditioning and lighting for the facility. Preliminary analysis indicates that this approach can reduce the City's up-front design and construction costs by about \$5 million and reduce annual energy costs by at least 20%. Planned incorporation of energy efficient equipment and design will serve to further reduce operational costs. It is also planned to incorporate other sustainable design and construction elements into the facility. This project will proceed pending voter approval of a bond measure on the November 1996 ballot.

Recommendations

- 1.) The concept of sustainability should be introduced into the City's short- and long-range planning processes. All City boards, commissions, and staff dealing with construction and development projects should be educated about the Sustainable City Program and should work to incorporate it into their operations. One suggested method to incorporate the goals of the Sustainable City Program into the City's planning process is to use the Sustainable City Program indicators as threshold levels in the CEQA evaluation process.

mitigation plans achieved a 24% reduction in runoff. A problem with the analysis is that it was based on data provided in the plans which hasn't been verified in the field. However, this analysis was helpful in that it pointed out some problems with implementation and enforcement of the ordinance which may have been otherwise overlooked. For more information please refer to the "Stormwater, Wastewater and Santa Monica Bay" section of this report.

- 2.) All future updates of planning documents should use the Sustainable City Program as a starting point to ensure that they are in line with the guiding principles, goals and objectives of the program and will help to achieve the indicator targets. Currently the Circulation Element, Open Space Element, and the Housing Element are undergoing comprehensive updates. An update of the Conservation Element is scheduled to begin in late 1996. Staff should investigate the ways to best ensure that this occurs and should work with the Task Force on the Environment to provide input to the Planning Department.
- 3.) Following adoption of the Sustainable Development Guidelines, all City-sponsored construction and development projects should incorporate sustainability measures specified in the guidelines. Minimum standards for municipal development projects should be set and a mechanism should be developed to account for possible additional upfront costs that can be offset by operational cost savings.
- 4.) With regard to specific development projects, an investigation into the feasibility of obtaining and compiling performance data should be undertaken, possibly as a component of the Sustainable Development Guidelines, for the purpose of verifying that current programs are effective and to provide input for future policy decisions.

TRANSPORTATION

Background

The subject of transportation involves not only the number and types of vehicles and other transportation modes we have but also how we use (or don't use) them, and the infrastructure and programs available to help us get from place to place. Accordingly, this section addresses City fleet and bus operations as well as city-wide transportation and circulation infrastructure, programs and policies. Background on these elements of transportation in Santa Monica is presented below.

• City Vehicles

The City of Santa Monica owns and operates a total of 962 vehicles. Oversight and maintenance of these vehicles is provided by either the Environmental and Public Works Management Department's Fleet Management Division, the Transportation Department, the Police Department, or the Fire Department, depending on the vehicle type and use as described below:

• Fleet Management Division - 585* vehicles

Fleet Management provides maintenance and oversight for what is referred to as the City Fleet, which consists of vehicles used by City office staff, maintenance crews, and public works operations. The fleet includes passenger cars, light trucks and vans, heavy equipment, and specialty vehicles such as fork lifts, refuse trucks, street sweepers, and riding lawnmowers. *Please note: This figure includes 40 Police vehicles (13 motorcycles and 27 parking enforcement scooters) which are maintained by the Fleet Management Division. These vehicles have been included in the calculation of the Sustainable City Program indicator for percentage of fleet vehicles using reduced-emission fuels.

• Transportation Department - 173 vehicles

The Transportation Department operates the Santa Monica Municipal Bus Lines (also known as the "Big Blue Bus") and provides oversight and maintenance for all vehicles related to this operation. Its fleet includes 159 buses and 14 miscellaneous vehicles including passenger cars, light trucks and heavy equipment.

• Police Department - 161 vehicles**

The Police Department oversees the operation of all police vehicles. These include marked and unmarked patrol cars, undercover vehicles, motorcycles, and parking enforcement scooters. Vehicle maintenance is provided by outside service contractors and by the Fleet Management Division. **Please note: The Police Department operates a total of 201 vehicles, however 40 of these vehicles (13 motorcycles and 27 parking enforcement scooters) are counted as City Fleet vehicles because they are maintained by the Fleet Management Division (see above).

• Fire Department - 43 vehicles

The Fire Department oversees the operation of all fire suppression, emergency response, and related support vehicles. These include passenger cars, light trucks, vans, pumper trucks, ambulances, and hazardous materials and rescue vehicles. Vehicle maintenance is provided by an in-house (Fire Department) mechanic and by outside service contractors.

• Transportation Services

The City's Transportation Department operates the Santa Monica Municipal Bus Lines (SMMBL) which provides low-cost bus service throughout Santa Monica and the surrounding area. The SMMBL operates 135 buses along 12 routes, four of which run entirely outside the city limits, providing service over a 40 square mile area. In addition, in FY 1995 and FY 1996, SMMBL operated The Lincoln Commuter (TLC) under contract with the Westchester/LAX Transportation Management Association, providing service between Santa Monica and El Segundo using three 25-passenger CNG-powered vehicles provided by the Southern California Gas Company. The department also provides shuttle service between the

Santa Monica Airport parking lot and Santa Monica College, and manages the Tide Shuttle service, a free shuttle serving Third Street Promenade, the Civic Center, the Pier and Main Street.

Additional bus service in Santa Monica is provided by the Los Angeles Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA). MTA buses operate along 9 routes within the city.

- **Transportation Planning and Policy Development**

Transportation planning and policy development is handled by the City's Department of Planning and Community Development (PCD). The PCD's Policy and Planning Analysis and Traffic Engineering divisions are responsible for studying parking and traffic characteristics throughout the City and developing plans and recommendations to improve pedestrian, bicycle and motor vehicle flow and safety. These divisions work with residents and neighborhood organizations to: mitigate parking and traffic problems; develop and implement an annual capital improvements program; and coordinate efforts between the City and other local and regional transportation agencies. The Traffic Engineering Division's Transportation Management Office is responsible for implementing the City's Transportation Management Plan and oversees the implementation of city-wide transportation management and ridesharing programs (see below).

- **Public Parking and Traffic Operations**

The City owns 6 public parking structures and 24 surface lots located throughout the city. The parking structures are operated by Ampco Parking under contract with the City. Of the 24 surface lots, 15 are beach lots that are operated under contract by Five Star Parking. Contract administration and operation of the remaining lots are overseen by the City's Parking Authority, a Division of the Planning and Community Development Department. In addition to the lots and structures, the City provides metered public parking along most major and secondary streets throughout the city. Installation and maintenance of all parking and traffic control devices is the responsibility of the PCD's Traffic Operations Division. This includes all traffic signals, parking structures, parking meters, pavement delineation, left turn channelization, curb zones, crosswalks, stop signs, street name signs and all other traffic control devices.

Existing Transportation Planning Documents

- **Circulation Element**

The Circulation Element is one of seven elements of the City's General Plan and was originally adopted by Council in 1958 (for more information on the General Plan please refer to the "Construction and Development" section of this report). The Circulation Element was updated in 1984 and amended in 1987, and is currently undergoing a comprehensive update which is scheduled for completion in early 1997. It includes major circulation plan goals, policies and programs, and provides supporting information on the street classification system, neighborhood traffic control plan, public transportation plan, non-motorized transportation plan, and parking plan. Notable objectives and policies related to sustainability that are expressed in the existing (1987) Circulation Element include the following:

Objectives

- Provide a balanced circulation program which serves future land use needs consistent with minimizing and mitigating negative environmental effects.
- Encourage an improved public transit system capable of accommodating ten percent or more of all trips generated in the City by the year 2000.
- Protect and encourage non-motorized transportation especially bicycle routes and pedestrian trails, consistent with the goals of the Land Use Element.
- All new development should accommodate project-generated parking consistent with encouraging alternative transportation systems management programs.

Policies

- The City shall encourage overall land use patterns which reduce vehicle miles traveled and number of trips.
- The City shall support the implementation of short- and long-range transportation measures for reducing air pollution from transportation sources.
- The city shall encourage transportation alternatives to reduce the use of fossil fuels.
- The City shall support transportation alternatives which reduce the use of land for parking.

• **Bicycle Master Plan**

The Bicycle Master Plan, adopted by City Council in 1995, was developed in response to recommendations made in the Circulation Element to facilitate an increase in bicycle use in Santa Monica for the purpose of easing traffic congestion and reducing air pollution. The plan recommends several measures to facilitate cycling, including bicycle facility improvements, education and awareness programs, and miscellaneous improvements. The recommended facility improvements include new bicycle routes, bicycle parking, and the creation of bicycle links with public transit. The recommended educational elements consist of a formal bicycle safety education program as well as an active public awareness program to promote bicycling and bicycle safety. Recommended miscellaneous improvements include street maintenance, traffic signal improvements, removal or paving of abandoned rail line crossings, additional street lighting, and the addition of wheel gutters along stairways to the beach.

The initial draft of the Bicycle Master Plan was released in November 1991. It was reviewed by the Task Force on the Environment, the Planning Commission and City Council and underwent an extensive public review process. As a result of this process the draft plan was revised and scaled down in response to concerns raised by the public and by Council members.

The plan is currently being implemented under the direction of the Department of Planning and Community Development. Implementation of the plan recommendations is proceeding based on the availability of funding. The majority of the funding for the project has come from Los Angeles County Proposition C funds and State Proposition 116 funds. To date, the City has completed the addition of Class II bike lanes along 7th Street, 11th Street, 17th Street and Broadway, as well as construction of new bicycle parking facilities at commercial and destination sites. This constitutes the majority of facility improvements recommended in the plan. Additional measures are planned to be implemented as funding becomes available.

Existing Transportation Policies

• **Reduced-Emissions Fuels Policy for City Vehicle Purchases**

In December 1993 the City Council adopted a Reduced-Emissions Fuels (REF) Policy for City vehicle purchases which recommends that the City purchase REF vehicles whenever possible in accordance with the findings of an operational review conducted by staff. In addition it directs staff to conduct an annual operational analysis to ensure that recommended fuel types are consistent with current technology. This policy was introduced as a way to help the City achieve its goal of having at least 75% of the City's fleet vehicles powered by REFs by the year 2000.

The policy was developed following an operational review that included an analysis of REF types and an evaluation of the applicability of REF vehicles to particular City functions. The review concluded that the primary preferred fuel type for City vehicles should be compressed natural gas (CNG) based on fuel availability, vehicle availability, emission characteristics and environmental impacts. The review recommended that public safety, emergency response and specialty vehicles be excluded from consideration due to cost and performance concerns. Accordingly, the vehicle purchasing policy only applies to Fleet vehicles and does not include Police, Fire or Transportation Department vehicles.

Shortly after this policy was instituted, operational, maintenance and user acceptance problems were encountered with some converted REF vehicles (vehicles originally designed to run on gasoline or diesel converted to run on REFs). To address this problem, the policy was modified in 1995 to specify the purchase of only OEM (original equipment manufactured) REF vehicles.

Since the adoption of the REF Vehicle Purchasing Policy, the City has increased its purchase of REF vehicles, but not at a pace that will meet the City's 75% goal by the year 2000. Because of this, the policy was recently replaced by a completely revised policy known as the Vehicle Management Program (additional information on this new policy can be found below under the heading "Plans for the Future"). Implementation of the Vehicle Management Program began in July 1996.

- **Transportation Management Plan Ordinance**

In November 1991 City Council adopted the Transportation Management Plan (TMP) Ordinance which required employers of 10 or more employees to file an annual employee commute trip reduction plan with the City to reduce home-to-worksites trips to an average of 1.5 persons per vehicle. The purpose of the TMP Ordinance is to reduce traffic congestion in the evening peak period, as set out in the Circulation Element of the General Plan, and to coincide with the Federal Clean Air Act and South Coast Air Quality Management District (SCAQMD)'s regulations on employers in the Los Angeles air basin to reduce air pollution. The TMP Ordinance encourages employers and developers to promote work-related transit use, ridesharing (carpooling/vanpooling), walking and bicycling to reduce morning and evening peak period trips to and from worksites in Santa Monica.

Implementation of the ordinance began in December 1993 when large employers (100 or more employees) were notified to begin submitting an annual plan and paying an employee impact fee. In December 1994, medium-sized employers (50 to 99 employees) were notified to begin compliance at the same level as large employers. In December 1995 the City began notifying small employers (10 to 49 employees) to comply with the ordinance at a lesser level by submitting plans detailing how information on alternative travel modes is provided to employees.

In January 1996 a State law was enacted prohibiting local governments from requiring employers to implement trip reduction programs. The law allows trip reduction plans to be submitted at the option of the regulated employer as one of several means to comply with air quality regulations. In response to the State law, the City adopted a revised TMP Ordinance which replaced the mandatory requirement for submittal of a trip reduction plan for large and medium-sized employers with a menu of options for employer emission reduction programs. The revised ordinance still requires employers to submit a plan, but allows the employers more flexibility in meeting their emission reduction goal. The requirements for small employers remain unchanged under this revised ordinance.

- **Transportation-Related Development Requirements**

The City's Zoning Ordinance contains standard transportation-related requirements for new developments such as off-street parking, and bicycle, carpool and vanpool requirements. For large developments within the city additional site-specific requirements are often included in the development agreements. These requirements were developed to provide parking in proportion to the needs generated by the various types of land use and to reduce traffic congestion and hazards related to the new development.

Existing Transportation Programs and Projects

- **City Employee Commute Reduction Program**

This program was developed and is implemented by the City's Transportation Management Office to comply with SCAQMD regulations which require all worksites with over 100 employees in the District to implement a commuter reduction plan. The goal set in the City's plan is to maintain an average vehicle ridership (AVR) of 1.5 at all City worksites with over 100 employees. These include the Civic Center, the Transportation Yards, the City Yards, and the Main Library. AVR is a measurement of vehicle occupancy indicating the average number of persons traveling in a measured number of vehicles. Increased vehicle occupancy leads to reductions in traffic congestion and vehicle air emissions. The AVR for City employees has risen from 1.13 in 1990 to 1.68 in 1995 as a result of the Commute Reduction Program (for additional AVR data please see "Accomplishments" below). Following are descriptions of the various components of the program:

- **Commuter Cash Club** - This program was introduced in August 1990 and is implemented at an annual cost to the City of approximately \$40,000. The Commuter Cash Club encourages carpooling and the use of alternative transportation modes by paying employees a minimum of \$1 per day for each day that they don't drive alone to work. Credit is given for one-way commutes in carpools or by alternative modes, and bonus days and weeks for extra money further reward participants and draw new participants into the program. Approximately 350 City employees currently participate in this program.
- **Compressed Work Week Schedules** - This program began in August 1990. Approximately 660 City employees are on a variety of compressed work week schedules, which act to reduce the total number of weekly commuting trips made by employees. City hall employees are on a fixed 9/80 schedule whereby City Hall is closed every other Friday. Police Department employees are on either 9/80 (non-sworn employees) or 4/40 (sworn employees) schedules. In addition, many employees at the Pier, City Yards, the Airport, and other outside facilities operate on 9/80 or 4/40 schedules.
- **Bus Token Reimbursement Program** - This program began in 1990 and provides reimbursement to City employees who commute to work on SMMBL buses. The program operates at an approximate annual cost of \$10,000 per year and serves approximately 50 employees. In January 1993, the City combined this program with MTA's new token program, Transitchek, and now provides tokens or Transitcheks (for use on MTA buses and Metrolink) on a monthly reimbursement basis as a tax-free transit subsidy.
- **City Vehicle Carpooling and Vanpooling Program** - Introduced in 1990, this program provides City fleet vehicles for carpools to employees who meet minimum criteria (at least three people, at least four days per week). Drivers and passengers are required to keep daily attendance and mileage logs which are turned in to the Transportation Management Coordinator monthly. Approximately 60 employees participate in this program, with an additional 30 employees participating in the Fire Department's vanpool program. The costs for this program are absorbed by the participating departments.
- **Preferential Carpool Parking** - As part of the restriping of the employee parking lot at the Civic Center in March 1993, ten preferential carpool spaces were designated nearest the buildings. In April 1993 five more spaces were added in response to demand. The City plans to continue adding spaces as they are needed. Each space is assigned to a specific carpool and permits are re-issued quarterly.
- **Pilot Telecommuting Program** - Introduced in 1993, this program provides for the identification, training and monitoring of employees to telecommute from home one or more days per week on a regular basis to reduce commuting trips. Currently ten employees are participating in this program.
- **Carpool Matching Service** - The City maintains a connection to a regional ridesharing database as a service to City employees. Ridesharing matchlists are provided to employees anytime upon request.
- **Guaranteed Ride Home Program** - This program guarantees a ride home in the event of an emergency to any City employee who rideshares. The Transportation Management Office will arrange for transportation for the employee by any mode deemed timely and cost-effective, including the use of City fleet vehicles, rides with other City employees, rental cars, or taxi cabs.

- **Quarterly Employee Transportation Newsletter** - The Transportation Management Office produces a quarterly ridesharing/transportation newsletter to market the City’s commuter incentives, to make employees aware of the elements of the City’s rideshare plan, and to educate employees about air pollution, alternative transportation modes and related topics.

- **Sustainable Transportation Projects**

Several sustainable transportation projects are currently underway in Santa Monica. Below is a description of the first such project to have been completed. Descriptions of additional projects that are planned or are currently under construction are described later in this section under the heading “Plans for the Future”.

Photovoltaic Electric Vehicle Charging Station - A demonstration 2.1 kW photovoltaic charging station for electric vehicles was completed in January 1996 and is located adjacent to City Hall in the south parking lot. The station is electrically integrated with the City Hall building and can accommodate up to seven electric vehicles simultaneously. Two of the seven charging ports are open for public use free of charge. The remaining five ports are intended for charging electric vehicles owned by the City. Integral to the station is an extensive public educational display presenting information about electric vehicles, solar power and alternative transportation systems.

The operation of this facility during its 30 year design life will result in the elimination of 2700 lbs of carbon monoxide, 340 lbs of nitrous oxides, 480 lbs of sulfur oxides and 425 lbs of non-methane organic gases. In addition, more than 330,000 lbs of carbon dioxide, a greenhouse gas will also be eliminated.

Accomplishments

- **City Employee Commute Reduction Program**

This program has been responsible for significant increases in the AVR of City employees since its inception in 1990. Listed below is a breakdown of AVR for the four largest (>100 employees) City sites:

	Average Vehicle Ridership (AVR)	
	<u>1990</u>	<u>1995</u>
Civic Center	1.16	1.89
Transportation Yards	1.10	1.46
City Yards	1.14	1.60
<u>Main Library</u>	<u>(1.50)*</u>	<u>1.77</u>
City Average	1.13	1.68**

*This data is from 1993, the year the Library was added to the program.

**For comparison, the Southern California regional average is 1.28 AVR.

- **Emission Reductions due to City Employee Commute Reduction Program**

Between 1990 and 1995, the Commute Reduction Program has been responsible for an annual reduction of 1.25 million vehicle miles traveled by City employees. This reduction has directly contributed to the elimination of approximately 1600 tons of vehicle generated air pollutants over the five year period.

- **SCAQMD Clean Air Award**

In 1991 the City was one of ten recipients of SCAQMD's Clean Air Award. The City received the award based upon its implementation of innovative and effective transportation management programs under the direction of the Transportation Management Office.

• **California Energy Commission Emissions Reduction Pilot Program**

This year Santa Monica was chosen to participate in a research and development project sponsored by the California Energy Commission (CEC) to test the emission reduction benefits of CNG vehicles. As part of the project, CEC is paying for the conversion of three of the City's refuse packer trucks from diesel to CNG. CEC will then monitor the emissions of the vehicles and compare them to those from similar gasoline and diesel-powered vehicles. The trucks are scheduled to be retrofitted in June and July 1996.

Progress Towards Goals

• **Fleet Vehicles**

The Sustainable City Program indicator target for Fleet Vehicles calls for 75% of the City's fleet to operate on REFs by the year 2000. As noted above, this indicator applies to City Fleet vehicles (as described in the "Background" section), including Police motorcycles and parking enforcement scooters. All other City vehicles operated by the Police, Fire and Transportation Departments are not included in the calculation of this indicator.

In 1993, 10% of the City's fleet operated on REFs. By the end of 1995 that figure had risen to 15%. Today, 21.7% of City fleet vehicles operate on REFs. Current figures for the fleet are provided below.

Total number of Fleet Vehicles:	585
Number of REF Vehicles in Fleet:	127

Fleet REF Breakdown

Propane	60
CNG	56
Electric	9
Bi-fuel	2

Additional Non-Fleet REF Vehicles:	13
------------------------------------	----

Non-Fleet REF Breakdown

Police	4
Fire	4
Transpo.	5

Fleet Management staff indicate that approximately 70 to 80 gasoline or diesel-fueled fleet vehicles will be replaced with REF vehicles in FY 1996-97. With the implementation of the planned Fleet Management Program which began in July 1996 (see below under "Plans for the Future") staff fully expect the City will reach the 75% indicator goal by the year 2000.

• **City-wide Average Vehicle Ridership for Employers with >50 Employees**

The Sustainable City Program target for this indicator is a city-wide AVR of 1.5 for all employers in Santa Monica with 50 or more employees. Prior to the implementation of the City's Transportation Management Plan Ordinance in 1993, city-wide AVR was 1.29. In 1994, after one year of program implementation the figure had risen to 1.34. By July 1995, city-wide AVR had reached 1.37. Due to a revision of the City's TMP Ordinance, the City has not yet received 1996 data from local businesses affected by the ordinance.

However, staff from the City's Transportation Management Office expect city-wide AVR to continue rising and believe the indicator goal will be attained, barring any change in State legislation (please refer to "Obstacles" below).

• **Santa Monica Municipal Bus Line Ridership**

The Sustainable City Program indicator for annual ridership on the Santa Monica Municipal Bus Line (including the Tide shuttles) calls for an increase of 10% from the 1990 baseline of 19 million riders to a target of 20.9 million in the year 2000. As of 1995, there has been a decrease in ridership of 5.9% from the baseline. Annual ridership figures are listed below:

	<u>SMMBL Buses</u>	<u>Tide</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>% Change*</u>
1990	18,997,803	0	18,997,803	--
1991	19,472,820	0	19,472,820	+2.5%
1992	18,762,519	0	18,762,519	-1.2%
1993	18,005,720	1,432	18,007,152	-5.2%
1994	17,602,352	21,968	17,624,320	-7.2%
1995	17,770,370	105,390	17,875,760	-5.9%

* Relative to 1990 baseline

The Transportation Department attributes the decrease in bus ridership between 1991 and 1994 to the effects of the economic recession. Bus ridership increased 1.4% between 1994 and 1995 and Transportation Department staff report that for the first three quarters of FY1996 ridership has increased approximately 4% over the same period in 1995. In addition, ridership on the Tide Shuttle is likely to significantly increase over 1995 totals due to an increase to year-round service and the promotion of the new electric shuttle vehicles. Transportation Department staff expects these trends to continue for the foreseeable future.

Obstacles

• **REF Vehicle Purchase and User Acceptance**

Since the implementation of the REF Policy for Vehicle Purchases, staff have encountered the following problems related to vehicle purchase and user acceptance:

- REF Vehicle Availability - Staff has found it difficult at times to find REF vehicles that meet the City's specifications and requirements, particularly for specialty vehicles and heavy equipment. Some of these vehicles are only available as retrofit conversions to REF use. A ban by the California Air Resources Board on conversion kits for 1995 and newer vehicles has made it more difficult in some cases for the City to obtain REF vehicles to suit its needs.
- REF Vehicle Performance - Particularly in the early stages of implementation of the REF vehicle purchasing policy, users reported performance problems such as poor acceleration and limited range from some of the REF vehicles. These were most often propane vehicles or vehicles that had been converted from gasoline or diesel use to REF, particularly large specialty vehicles. Performance of the more recently acquired vehicles and dedicated CNG vehicles is reported to be much more satisfactory.

- User Acceptance - Due to performance problems with some of the early vehicles, some users have developed a negative view of REF vehicles and have indicated they do not wish to use them in the future.

These obstacles are primarily due to the newness of the REF technology and Santa Monica's position as a leader in the purchase and operation of REF vehicles. Staff reports that these obstacles are gradually being overcome as REF vehicle technology improves and more and better vehicles are becoming available.

- **Proposed State Legislation Affecting the City's TMP Ordinance**

The City's Transportation Management Coordinator has indicated that several bills are pending in the State legislature which would prohibit Air Districts and local governments from imposing mandatory requirements on California businesses for the purpose of reducing air pollution. If any of this pending legislation is signed into law the City may be required to repeal or significantly modify its Transportation Management Plan Ordinance which currently requires employers of more than 10 employees to submit annual emissions reduction plans. If this occurs it would significantly impair the City's efforts to meet the Sustainable City Program goal of city-wide AVR of 1.5 by the year 2000.

- **Bus Ridership**

Ridership on the SMMBL significantly decreased between 1991 and 1994 and was 5.9% below the 1990 baseline at the end of 1995. Transportation Department staff attribute this decrease to effects of the economic recession. In FY1994 and FY1995 ridership began to increase as the economy began to improve. These recent fluctuations indicate that ridership is dependent on several variables, many of which are out of the City's control. These variables may complicate the City's efforts to achieve its indicator goal.

In an effort to improve service and increase ridership, the Transportation Department began an outreach program in March 1996. Phase I of the program involved a series of community meetings held throughout the service area to solicit comments, concerns and suggested improvements about the bus service from bus riders and the community at large. Phase II, which is scheduled to begin shortly, will consist of a similar outreach effort to the business community. Following completion of Phase II, focus groups will be convened to help refine the input received and develop a multi-year Service Improvement Plan for the Big Blue Bus. Transportation staff feel that this outreach effort, the development and implementation of service improvements, and increased marketing efforts will help to continue the current upward trend in ridership.

Plans for the Future

- **Vehicle Management Program**

This program involves a complete update and revision of the City's REF Policy for Vehicle Purchases. The revision was initiated because the City was not on target to reach its 75% goal for REF fleet vehicles and because the City did not have a systematic policy for the purchase, maintenance and retirement of vehicles, which has led to an aging fleet which is expensive to maintain.

Under the lead of the Environmental and Public Works Management Department, City staff have drafted the Vehicle Management Program in an effort to upgrade the City's aging fleet, reduce costs, provide accountability for fleet costs, improve fleet maintenance services, and, as stated above, to help attain the alternative-fueled vehicle target specified in the Sustainable City Program. The policy will institute a program that establishes a replacement schedule for all fleet vehicles and non-emergency Fire Department

vehicles (excludes Police, Transportation, and emergency Fire Department vehicles) based on the remaining useful life, maintenance history and use of the vehicle. The replacement program specified in this policy will schedule and fund regular replacement of all vehicles, provide information on vehicle replacement and operating costs to departments, and attain the Sustainable City Program goal of 75% of the fleet powered by REFs by the year 2000. The policy was approved by City Council in June 1996 as part of the City's fiscal year 1996-97 budget. Implementation of the program began in July 1996.

- **Installation of CNG Fueling Stations at City Hall and the City Yards**

The Fleet Management Division is currently preparing a grant proposal for submittal to SCAQMD to fund the construction of CNG fueling stations at the City Yards and at City Hall. The proposal calls for the installation of 30 slow- and fast-fill pumps at the City Yards and 10 slow-fill "fuel makers" at City Hall. The City currently refuels its CNG vehicles offsite at a Southern California Gas Company facility. Staff hopes to complete the installation by mid-1997, subject to funding.

- **Electric Car Charging Points in City Parking Structures**

Staff is currently investigating the feasibility of installing electric vehicle charging points in City parking structures that will be available free of charge for public use. The City will likely seek grant funding in the coming year to cover the installation costs.

- **Santa Monica SMART Corridor Extension Project**

Santa Monica recently received funding from the Los Angeles Metropolitan Transportation Authority to design and construct a SMART Corridor system along the Santa Monica Freeway within the city limits. This involves the integration of the Santa Monica Freeway and surface street management and controls to improve traffic flow in the event of traffic accidents and during heavy congestion periods and to reduce emissions from vehicles along the freeway corridor. The project will extend the existing Los Angeles SMART Corridor through Santa Monica and will involve the installation of electronic remote traffic control and monitoring systems along the freeway and adjacent roadways and the installation of a traffic management center at City Hall. The project is currently in the bid stage and construction work is expected to be completed by December 1996. The entire system is expected to be on-line by December 1997.

- **Streetscape Improvements**

Several streetscape improvement projects are planned throughout the city to encourage more pedestrian use and improve pedestrian safety. The projects, which are currently in various stages of planning, call for improvements to landscaping, transit stops, street furniture, and lighting, and include sidewalk widening and public art along Main Street, Montana Avenue, Pico Boulevard, and throughout the Downtown area. Project timelines have not yet been developed as these projects are subject to approval by Council and availability of funding. An additional streetscape improvement project involving the planting of street trees along Ocean Park Boulevard is planned and will be funded by grant money obtained by the Ocean Park Community Organization.

- **Electric Tide Shuttles**

The Transportation Department is purchasing three electric shuttle buses to replace the two existing Tide shuttle buses. The department took delivery of the vehicles in October 1996 and plans to put them into service before the end of this year. Efforts are planned to educate the public and promote the fact that the buses are zero emission vehicles.

Recommendations

1.) Fleet Management Program

As this program is designed to ensure that the City meets its 75% REF vehicle goal, it should be given full support and implemented as a high priority. The program should be annually monitored to ensure that it meets its annual targets and remains on course.

2.) Transportation Management

City staff should investigate various avenues to oppose the pending State legislation that threatens to significantly impair the City's efforts to reach its city-wide AVR target. This might include passage of a motion by Council expressing the City's opposition to the legislation and support of lobbying efforts in Sacramento.

3.) Bus Ridership

The Transportation Department's outreach program and Service Improvement Plan should be given high priority and support, as its purpose is to improve service and increase bus ridership. Because the City is behind schedule on this goal due to past ridership decreases, this indicator should be carefully monitored and future decreases should be analyzed to pinpoint the cause and identify changes necessary to reverse the trend.

4.) Bicycle Master Plan

In light of the fact that this plan represents a scaled back version of the original plan, every effort should be made to fully implement the plan's recommendations. In addition, the City should conduct an assessment to determine the city-wide change in bicycle ridership due to implementation of the Bicycle Master Plan.

HAZARDOUS MATERIALS

Background

Regulatory oversight, policy development and program administration related to hazardous materials in Santa Monica is conducted by the City's Department of Environmental and Public Works Management (EPWM) and the Fire Department. EPWM's Environmental Programs Division is responsible for implementation and enforcement of the City's Underground Storage Tank Ordinance, Consumer Awareness Ordinance, and Ozone-Depleting Compound Ordinance; oversight and enforcement of California State Title 23 Underground Storage Tank Regulations; operation of the City's Household and Small Business Hazardous Waste Collection Facility; oversight of the assessment and remediation of soil and groundwater contamination sites in Santa Monica; hazardous materials emergency response support to the Fire Department; and program and policy development related to toxics-use reduction and pollution prevention. The Industrial Waste Section of EPWM's Utilities Division implements the Industrial Pretreatment Program, which specifies discharge levels for pollutants entering the wastewater system. The Fire Department's Suppression and Rescue Division coordinates emergency response to hazardous materials spills, fires and releases and oversees the City's Hazardous Materials Emergency Response Team. The Fire Department's Fire Prevention Division maintains records of business and industrial hazardous material inventories and hazardous materials release response plans as part of the state Community Right to Know Act, issues underground storage tank installation and closure permits, and conducts inspections to ensure tanks are in compliance with related Fire Code regulations.

Existing Hazardous Materials Programs

• Residential Household Hazardous Waste Collection

In 1988 the City opened a permanent collection facility for household hazardous waste (HHW) at the City Yards. This replaced annual HHW round-ups that began in 1984. The facility accepts HHW such as paint, cleaning products and pesticides at no charge to Santa Monica residents. Funding for operation of the facility and waste disposal comes from monthly City refuse fees. Residents of Beverly Hills, West Hollywood and Culver City are permitted to use the facility as part of a voucher program paid for by those cities. Reusable products collected by the facility (such as paint) are diverted, via a waste exchange program, to community organizations and other groups for reuse. The remainder of materials collected are either recycled, treated, or properly disposed of. For fiscal year 1994-1995, 15% of the collected HHW (by weight) was reclaimed through the waste exchange, 51% was recycled, and 36% was treated and disposed of, either by land filling or incineration.

• Conditionally Exempt Small Quantity Generator (CESQG) program

Begun in January 1994, this program allows commercial generators in Santa Monica, Beverly Hills, West Hollywood and Culver City to deposit their hazardous waste at the HHW Collection Facility at prices equal to the City's cost for disposal or recycling. Prior to the initiation of this program small quantity generators had to hire commercial waste haulers, at a much greater expense, for disposal of even the smallest amounts of hazardous waste. To be eligible for the program, businesses must generate less than 220 pounds (approximately 27 gallons) of hazardous waste, or less than 2.2 pounds of acutely hazardous waste per month. Program participants are granted a waiver by the City from state and federal regulations restricting the amount of waste transported at one time, allowing them to legally deliver the waste to the facility. For FY 1995-96, twenty one businesses participated in this program.

• Toxics-Use Reduction Program

The Toxics-Use Reduction (TUR) Program is an ongoing program initiated in 1993 to identify and reduce the amounts of toxic products used in all areas of City operations. Custodial cleaning products were identified as the first category of toxic products to be addressed under the program following a TUR assessment of City operations. The goals of the cleaning product program are listed below:

- To safeguard City custodial workers' health by minimizing workplace exposure to hazardous materials.
- To minimize the environmental impacts incurred due to the manufacture, use and disposal of custodial products used to clean City facilities.
- To increase workplace morale by allowing custodians to participate in decisions about their work.
- To achieve a cost savings while maintaining or improving the level of service.
- To decrease liability for workers compensation claims.
- To decrease custodial staff sick days due to exposure to toxic materials.

This program included a pilot testing phase to evaluate the effectiveness of various less-toxic or non-toxic alternative custodial products. City custodians were enlisted to test the products and provide feedback. The results of the pilot contributed to the development of purchasing specifications for the evaluation of bids from custodial product vendors. The specifications include environmental and public health criteria as well as performance and cost criteria. Please refer to the "Accomplishments" section below for more information on the cleaning products program.

Environmental Programs Division staff are currently working on the next phase of the TUR program which addresses the use of pesticides in City operations. For more information on this phase of the program please refer to the "Plans for the Future" section of this chapter. EPD staff have also been working with Fleet Maintenance staff to help identify viable alternative products to the chemicals they use in their operations. More information on these alternative products is presented below under the heading "City Department Highlights".

• **Waste Oil Recycling Program**

Since 1982 the City has provided curbside collection of waste oil and oil filters for Santa Monica residents. In 1994 the City expanded this program by providing reusable oil collection containers free to residents. Residents who change their own oil can drain it directly from the car into these containers, which can be used to transport it to the City's HHW Collection Facility, the Recycling Center, or one of 10 private waste oil collection facilities in Santa Monica for recycling. The collected oil is either cleaned and rerefined or used as bunker fuel to generate energy. Funding for the oil containers as well as for public outreach materials, school outreach and curriculum, and promotion of the program has been obtained through grants from the California Integrated Waste Management Board (CIWMB) each year since 1994.

• **Household Hazardous Waste Education Program**

This school-based outreach program is designed to educate students and the community about HHW issues and encourage action to address them. The program began in April 1996 at John Adams Middle School and Santa Monica High School and included the introduction of a pilot supplementary curriculum for grades 7 through 9, which uses investigation and action skills to study the use, disposal and alternatives to hazardous materials in schools and in the community. As part of the program, the students planned and presented the Gentle Earth Expo, an earth-friendly products fair and HHW collection event for the community to increase local awareness about HHW issues, on June 8, 1996 at John Adams Middle School. Primary funding for this pilot program was obtained from a competitive grant issued by the California Integrated Waste Management Board. The program will be offered again at John Adams and Santa Monica High during the 1996-1997 school year.

Existing Hazardous Materials Policies and Ordinances

• **Industrial Wastewater Pretreatment Program**

The adoption and enforcement of this program are mandated by the federal Clean Water Act's National Pollution Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit. As part of this program, which was initiated in 1988, businesses such as metal finishers, gas stations, auto repair shops, dry cleaners, and photo developers that produce wastewater containing toxic substances are required to obtain a permit from the City's Industrial Waste Section. Industrial Waste inspectors periodically inspect permitted business sites to ensure that wastewater isn't being illegally discharged to the storm drain system, to ensure that wastewater pretreatment equipment and oil/water separators are operating properly, to verify that

hazardous waste is properly stored, manifested and hauled offsite, and to verify that good-housekeeping procedures and best management practices (BMPs) are being properly implemented. Components of the Pretreatment Program addressing hazardous materials are presented below. Additional information on this program can be found in the “Stormwater, Wastewater and Santa Monica Bay” section of this report.

Dry Cleaner Control Program- Under this program, all dry cleaners in the city are issued zero discharge permits and are not allowed to discharge any process wastewater or separator water to the sewer or storm drain systems due to the presence of the solvent perchloroethylene, a known carcinogen, used in the dry cleaning process. All waste perchloroethylene liquid and filter cartridges must be hauled offsite and separator water must be treated onsite or hauled away. This program annually prevents approximately 13,100 gallons of perchloroethylene-contaminated water from entering the sewers, storm drains, soil, or groundwater.

Silver-Bearing Waste Reduction Program- All businesses conducting photo finishing activities (including photo finishers, printers, hospitals, schools, dentists, doctors and veterinarians) are required to treat silver-bearing waste streams on site or haul the waste away for offsite treatment. This program prevents the discharge of approximately 11,600 gallons of silver-bearing wastewater to the sewer each year.

Oil/Water Separator Policy- Existing auto maintenance facilities found to be discharging excessive oil and other pollutants to the sewer or storm drain system and all new auto maintenance facilities are required to install oil/water separators at their sites. In addition, all new developments and remodels of older facilities, regardless of business type or usage, are required to install oil/water separators in their parking lots and parking structures.

- **Toxic and Hazardous Household Products Labeling Ordinance**

To raise the awareness of consumers in Santa Monica about the environmental and economic impacts of using products containing hazardous ingredients, the City passed the Toxic and Hazardous Household Products Labeling Ordinance (also known as the Consumer Awareness Labeling Ordinance) in 1994. This ordinance requires the placing of signs on store shelves containing toxic or hazardous substances for sale, including automotive products, paint products, garden products, and pool or spa maintenance chemicals. In addition, retailers must display consumer information pamphlets near the products and make retail staff aware of the program. Both the signs and the pamphlets are designed to educate consumers about the toxic or hazardous nature of the products, the proper use of these products, instructions for the proper disposal of these products, and the identification and availability of more environmentally preferable product alternatives.

- **Ozone-Depleting Compound Restriction Ordinance**

This ordinance was adopted in 1990 and prohibits the sale, distribution, or manufacture in Santa Monica of products containing ozone-depleting compounds. An amendment prohibiting the use of ozone-depleting materials in construction went into affect in 1992. Because there is currently no economically feasible technology available as a substitute for the ozone-depleting compounds used as coolants or fire suppressers, their use is not restricted by this ordinance. However, these products are required to be recycled in the course of the installation, repair, service, or maintenance of equipment which uses them (refrigerators, air conditioning systems and fire extinguishers). Exemptions are provided to Health Care facilities, research projects looking at the effects of the release ozone-depleting compounds on the environment, and any business that is able to prove that no feasible alternative is available for use. Since it was adopted, this ordinance has been largely but not entirely superseded by subsequent Air Quality Management District (AQMD) regulations.

- **Hazardous Materials Release Response Plans and Inventory**

In 1983 the City adopted the Toxic Chemicals Disclosure Ordinance, which required local businesses storing hazardous chemicals to provide the City with an annual chemical inventory. In 1986 this

ordinance was amended to comply with provisions of the newly adopted state Community Right To Know Act. The state law requires any business with more than 55 gallons, 500 pounds, or 200 cubic feet of hazardous material to report it in an annual inventory report. Santa Monica's ordinance was again amended in 1990, imposing stricter standards than the state's requirements, requiring any business storing more than a consumer amount at any given time to report it in an annual inventory report*. In addition to the reporting requirements, there is a provision in the state law which gives the city the discretion of requiring any existing business to establish and implement a Risk Management and Prevention Plan (RMPP) if they have a specified amount of extremely hazardous materials handled on site at one time. All new businesses that surpass the threshold levels must file a plan. When the program started, the City encouraged businesses to change their production processes to reduce the amount of extremely hazardous materials on-site rather than prepare a RMPP. Most businesses have opted to change their production processes to avoid having to produce a RMPP. The Fire Department is in charge of annually inspecting businesses under this ordinance. Violation of its provisions can result in substantial civil penalties and criminal prosecution.

• **Underground Storage Tank Ordinance**

The City adopted the Underground Storage Tank Ordinance in 1983. This ordinance allows the City to assume the responsibility for implementing the State of California Underground Storage Tank Regulations outlined in Title 23 of the California Code of Regulations. The City's ordinance sets Title 23 requirements as minimum standards. It requires all new storage tanks constructed after January 1, 1984 to be double walled. For tanks constructed before this date a monitoring system must be installed and there must be a means for monitoring the tank. All underground tank operators must obtain a permit from the city. Inspections are to be made annually to assess the integrity of the tank systems. The City is currently in the process of identifying which tanks need to be double-walled to comply with a new federal law requiring all underground storage tanks to be double-walled by 1998.

Accomplishments

• **Toxics Use Reduction: Cleaning Products**

Implementation of this program has resulted in:

- Replacement of toxic products throughout the City with less or non-toxic alternatives in 15 of 17 cleaning product categories.
- The elimination of approximately 3200 pounds of hazardous materials in products purchased annually.
- A cost savings of approximately 5% resulting from: the purchase of more concentrated products that have lower packaging and shipping costs; lower cost per application of the alternative products; and better, less wasteful use of products due to improved custodial training.
- A proven and effective set of procurement specifications that can be adapted for use in future TUR efforts.
- Increased morale of the custodians, who recognize the City's concern for their health and working conditions and who appreciate the opportunity to participate in making decisions about their work.
- Recognition by City staff of the important role custodians play in the maintenance of City facilities.

• **Hazardous Waste Collection**

Household Hazardous Waste Delivered to the Collection

* The City is currently in the process of relaxing its reporting requirements back to the level of the state requirements. The stricter standards were instituted primarily as a data gathering mechanism for hazardous materials handlers. Because the implementation of the Consumer Awareness Ordinance and the Industrial Pre-Treatment Program now provides for the collection of this data, the City is able to relax these requirements.

Facility by Residents

FY 1992-1993	102,640 pounds
FY 1993-1994	(not available)
FY 1994-1995	101,380 pounds
FY 1995-1996	95,200 pounds

Hazardous Waste Generated by City Operations*

1994	14,730 pounds
1995	17,220 pounds
1996 (through Sept.)	2,030 pounds

* Does not include contaminated soil or groundwater generated during remediation of contaminated sites owned by the City

The reason for the decline in the amount of household hazardous waste delivered to the HHW Collection Facility by residents is unclear. It could be the result of reduced purchase and use of hazardous materials by Santa Monica residents. Alternately, it could result from reduced use of the facility and increasing improper disposal of hazardous waste in the municipal waste stream.

The figures for City-generated hazardous waste are somewhat misleading. The higher figures in 1994 and 1995 resulted from "housecleaning" of old, unused stockpiles of hazardous materials from several City facilities. Environmental Programs Division staff report that all of the known stockpiles of hazardous materials have now been disposed of and that the 1996 figures more accurately reflect the annual levels of hazardous waste generated by City operations.

• Waste Oil Recycling

For fiscal year 1994-1995 the amount of oil received at the Household Hazardous Waste collection facility increased by 100% over 1993-1994, going from 300 gallons per month to 600 gallons per month. The 10 private waste oil collection sites in the city reported about a 10 % increase in oil collection, or about 50 gallons per month each. All told, the City of Santa Monica collected 9,600 more gallons of waste oil in 1994-1995 than the previous fiscal year. Overall collection of waste oil was approximately 73,200 gallons for fiscal year 1994-95.

• Consumer Awareness Ordinance

Approximately 110 retail outlets are regulated by this ordinance. Stores are visited between one and four times per year by an Environmental Programs inspector to verify compliance. In general, compliance with the ordinance has been very good throughout the city. A survey of customers is planned to assess the impact of the ordinance on consumer purchases. This survey is scheduled to be completed by the end of the 1996-1997 fiscal year.

• Award for Public Education Video

In 1994 the City's Environmental Programs Division produced a public education video on hazardous waste entitled "When We Throw It Away, Is It Really Away?" which examines local, national, and international concerns over the use and disposal of household products that can endanger public health and the environment. This video was the winner of the 1995 Hometown USA Video Festival sponsored by the Alliance for Community Media. A shorter version of the video produced in 1993 was nominated for an Emmy award by the Academy of Motion Picture Arts and Sciences in the Science, Health and Environment category. In 1996 the City received funding from the California Integrated Waste Management Board to promote the video throughout the country. As a result of this effort, the one hour program was aired on 31 public television stations in May 1996.

City Department Highlights

• Fleet Maintenance

- Out of 585 vehicles that fleet maintenance is responsible for, 395 have been using re-refined oil since 1993.
- Propylene glycol antifreeze (a less toxic alternative to conventional ethylene glycol antifreeze) was introduced in 1995 and is currently being used in 395 fleet vehicles. Fleet Maintenance staff report that in addition being less toxic, propylene glycol does not require the addition of a pH enhancer, reducing supply costs and saving a step in the maintenance process.
- 300 City fleet vehicles currently have retread tires. Retread tires have been used on City vehicles for more than 20 years.
- The division is in the process of phasing out the use of petroleum-based solvents over the next 2 to 3 years. During FY 1996-97, two of the division's hand-parts washers will be replaced with a bioremediating aqueous-based parts washing system. A third, stand-alone, heated aqueous washer for large parts is currently in use.

• Public Facilities Maintenance

- In 1995 the Plumbing Shop stopped using sulfuric acids, mapp gas and acetylene gas in their operations.
- In 1995 the Carpenter Shop switched from petroleum-based to water-based adhesives and glues. The Carpenter Shop has been using asbestos-free roofing adhesives for several years.
- The Paint Shop: has eliminated all spray applications; discontinued the purchase of aerosol products; utilizes recycled paint when possible; reduced its consumption of mineral spirits; exclusively uses less-toxic graffiti removers; and is in the process of converting from oil-, lacquer- and solvent-based to water-based paints and finishes.
- All PFM division vehicles are inspected daily for fluid leaks.
- All outside contractors hired by PFM are required to follow the guidelines outlined above.

• Print Shop

- Beginning in 1994 the City's print shop instituted an informal policy to phase out the use of petroleum-based printing inks and replace them with vegetable-based inks. These inks are much less toxic than petroleum-based inks, producing about one twentieth the amount of volatile organic compounds (VOCs), and can be cleaned up using less toxic cleaning products. Vegetable-based inks are also more amenable to recycling as they are easier to break down in the de-inking process than petroleum-based inks.

• Police

- The Police Department has converted to the use of vegetable-based OC spray instead of CS or CN tear gas. The vegetable-based product is easily disposed of while CS and CN tear gas require incineration for disposal.

• Transportation

- The Maintenance Division of the Transportation Department has begun using parts cleaning tanks that filter and reuse the cleaning solvent, thereby extending the life-cycle of the solvent and reducing the volume of solvent used.
- Two hydraulic lifts were replaced in 1996 with electric lifts that do not require hydraulic fluid or underground storage tanks. More hydraulic lifts may be replaced if the electric lifts perform effectively.
- All used engine, transmission and differential oils are recycled.

Progress Towards Goals

The Sustainable City Program has two indicators related to hazardous materials. These call for a 15% reduction in the city-wide use of hazardous materials, and a 75% reduction in known underground storage tank sites requiring clean-up, both by the year 2000. Progress towards these goals is outlined below.

- **City-wide Use of Hazardous Materials**

No reliable data on the city-wide use of hazardous materials currently exists, therefore a baseline figure for this indicator has not yet been determined. In addition, it is unlikely that the City will be able to obtain quantifiable data for this indicator in the foreseeable future, due to the difficulty in measuring use. For instance, even if the City were able to track the amounts of hazardous materials (including cleaning products, paints, pesticides, herbicides, pool chemicals, and solvents) sold by Santa Monica retail outlets, this would not account for hazardous materials purchased elsewhere and used in Santa Monica. And although the City collects data on the amounts of hazardous materials stored onsite by commercial and industrial operations, these figures don't reflect the annual amounts used by these businesses. Data collected by the City's Household Hazardous Waste Collection facility are similarly ambiguous. The amount of hazardous materials collected at the facility can not be directly extrapolated to determine a corresponding increase or decrease in the residential use of these products.

In light of these difficulties, it is recommended that this indicator be withdrawn and replaced with indicators that target hazardous materials use in City operations, which can be more easily measured. The following indicators are proposed: *(1) A 10% reduction in the amount of hazardous waste generated by City operations by the year 2000, using 1996 figures as a baseline, and (2) A 10% reduction in the amount of hazardous materials purchased by the year 2000, using 1998 as a baseline.* No current data exists to establish a baseline for the second proposed indicator, however it is anticipated that efforts to improve tracking of City purchases will allow development of a baseline by 1998.

- **Known Underground Storage Tank (UST) Sites Requiring Cleanup**

This indicator calls for a 75% reduction in the number of UST sites in the City requiring cleanup, from 25 in 1993 to 6 by the year 2000. The baseline of 25 refers to the sites that are under the regulatory jurisdiction of the City of Santa Monica. These are primarily sites involving soil contamination only. The baseline does not include sites requiring cleanup in Santa Monica that are under the jurisdiction of the Regional Water Quality Control Board (primarily sites with both soil and groundwater contamination identified). In 1995, the number of sites requiring cleanup was 18, a reduction of 28% from 1993. Of these 18 active sites, six are currently being remediated, and five are undergoing investigation to determine the extent of contamination and develop remediation plans. Site investigation has not yet begun at the seven other sites.

Attainment of the 75% reduction goal for this indicator is somewhat outside of the City's control because of the relatively slow and variable pace of site remediation and because new underground storage tank leaks may occur at any time, increasing the number of sites requiring cleanup. In light of this, it is recommended that an additional underground storage tank indicator be adopted that reads: *Prior to December 22, 1998, all publicly and privately owned underground storage tanks shall either be removed from the ground, upgraded or replaced with systems in compliance with the new federal UST standards.* Attainment of this indicator is entirely within the City's control and will greatly decrease the likelihood of future underground tank leaks in the City. Out of a total of 175 existing tanks in Santa Monica, currently 106 tanks are in compliance with the 1998 standards. The City of Santa Monica owns and operates 25 underground storage tanks. Of these, 9 are currently in compliance with 1998 standards.

Obstacles

- **Tracking of City Hazardous Materials Purchases**

As mentioned above, the City's financial management computer system currently does not have the capability to access annual purchase amount and cost information for individual categories of goods and

services. As a consequence, staff is currently unable to develop a baseline for the recommended indicator calling for a 10% reduction in the City's purchase of hazardous materials by the year 2000. Staff are addressing the tracking issue and hope to develop tracking capability within the next year.

- **Inadequate Training of Janitorial Staff in the Use of Alternative Cleaning Products**

Staff have observed many janitors improperly applying alternative cleaning products, leading to product waste, janitor skepticism regarding the efficacy of the products, and in some cases, reversion back to the use of conventional toxic cleaning products. While all City janitors have received training on the proper use of the alternative products, refresher courses would be helpful in improving overall staff use of the products.

- **Inconsistent Availability of Alternative Cleaning Products in the City Warehouse**

All City Janitorial staff have been directed to obtain their cleaning products from the City warehouse, which stocks alternative cleaning products exclusively. However, staff have reported that the warehouse often does not have adequate stock on hand, causing the janitors to purchase conventional, toxic cleaning products from outside vendors. These availability problems have lead some janitors to avoid the warehouse altogether and purchase exclusively from outside vendors. This problem is compounded by the fact that warehouse staff are primarily temporary employees who are unfamiliar with the various products stocked in the warehouse. Because of this they have distributed inappropriate products required for the job, which leads to user frustration and dissatisfaction.

- **Lack of Participation in the CESQG Program**

Very few businesses have participated in the CESQG program since it began in 1994. For FY 1995-96, only 21 businesses participated in the program. It is likely that this is due to a general lack of awareness about the program and about the true costs of hazardous waste disposal.

- **Inadequate Training of Fire Department Inspectors**

Fire Department inspectors visit Santa Monica businesses that store and use hazardous materials to verify volumes and types of material stored as part of the Community Right to Know program as well to enforce fire code regulations pertaining to hazardous materials storage. Until recently, these inspectors have not had sufficient training or expertise to adequately conduct these inspections. The inspectors are now receiving detailed hazardous materials training in an effort to remedy this situation.

- **Lack of Enforcement of Ozone-Depleting Compound Ordinance**

Currently the Environmental Programs Division has one staff member who conducts hazardous materials-related inspections related to enforcement of the Consumer Awareness Ordinance. This staff person has not been trained to enforce the Ozone-Depleting Compound (ODC) Ordinance and is unable to commit sufficient time to conduct full ODC inspections. Although the ordinance has been largely pre-empted by subsequent Air Quality Management District regulations, there remain select sections of the City's ordinance which are not covered by AQMD regulations and remain unenforced.

Plans for the Future

- **Certified Unified Program Agency (CUPA) Program**

In response to recent state legislation requiring the consolidation of various hazardous materials permitting and inspection functions, the City has applied to the California Environmental Protection Agency to become a Certified Unified Program Agency (CUPA). As a CUPA, the City will, to the maximum extent practicable, consolidate, coordinate and make consistent the administrative requirements, permits, inspection and enforcement activities, and hazardous waste and hazardous materials fees of the

Community Right to Know program, Risk Management Prevention Plan program, the Underground and Above-ground Storage Tank programs, hazardous waste generator inspections, permit oversight, and permitting for hazardous waste treatment. The City expects to be certified by the end of 1996 and has already begun implementing many elements of the program.

- **Consumer Awareness Labeling Ordinance Outreach and Follow-up**

Additional public outreach is planned to provide consumers with information about the availability of alternatives to hazardous or toxic products. Bag stuffers are currently being developed that will alert consumers to less toxic alternatives to garden, automotive, and paint products. These will be distributed at retail stores regulated by the ordinance. To strengthen the labeling ordinance the City is working with the cities of Los Angeles, West Hollywood, Beverly Hills, Culver City, Redondo Beach, Long Beach, and Manhattan Beach to implement a voluntary labeling programs in each of these cities. A post-survey of consumers will be conducted in Santa Monica during the 1996-1997 fiscal year to gauge consumer awareness and behavior. Comparing these results with a pre-survey conducted prior to implementation of the ordinance will allow the City to measure the effectiveness of the ordinance.

- **Simplify Cleaning Products Specifications**

The bid criteria developed as part of the TUR program for janitorial cleaning products are being revised to make them easier to use and more objective. By simplifying the specifications they can be more easily used by Santa Monica staff as well as by other interested jurisdictions. Many like-minded jurisdictions have expressed interest in replicating Santa Monica's efforts but have not done so because Santa Monica's existing specifications were too complex for their staff to use effectively. The contract for alternative cleaning products will again go out for bid for FY 1997-1998.

- **Implementation of Integrated Pest Management (IPM) Program**

Environmental Programs Division staff have been working for several months on the next phase of the TUR program: the development of an IPM program to help reduce the amount of toxic pesticides used in and around City facilities. IPM programs seek to minimize the application of pesticides by focusing on long-term mechanical and administrative preventative measures to control pests, thereby reducing the use of pesticides while maintaining a comfortable and safe work environment. As part of this program the City will hire one contractor to provide IPM services for all City facilities. Staff members have been identified and trained in each City department to act as "pest managers" who will be responsible for implementing some of the IPM practices. Bid specifications have been developed and an IPM contractor was recently hired to provide the pest control services. The first phase of this program will concentrate on indoor and structural pests. A second phase beginning in 1997 will look at alternative methods and products for eliminating pests in landscaping operations. Following the first year of implementation, an evaluation will be conducted to determine the program's effectiveness at eliminating pests. As part of this program, the Environmental Programs Division is working with the State Department of Pesticide Regulation to develop model IPM bid specifications for use by any municipality in California.

- **HHW Facility Needs Assessment**

Within the next year the Environmental Programs Division plans to conduct a needs assessment of the HHW Collection Facility to help improve service and encourage greater awareness and utilization of the facility by both residents and businesses. The needs assessment will involve surveying residents and local businesses to determine their current awareness and use of the facility, their HHW disposal habits, and their needs and preferences. Likely outcomes of the needs assessment will include changing or expanding the facility's operating hours and expanding the level of services offered.

- **Underground Storage Tank Permitting and Inspections**

Environmental Programs Division staff are currently in the process of updating the permits for all privately-owned USTs in the city. In addition, staff has initiated an annual inspection program of all permitted facilities to evaluate record keeping, site maintenance, and tank monitoring procedures. It is anticipated that all permit records will be up-to-date by mid 1997.

- **Additional Public Outreach**

Other public outreach efforts planned for the coming year include: Implementation of the HHW Education program for 7th to 9th graders at John Adams Middle School and Santa Monica High School for the 1996-97 school year; A city-wide campaign promoting the use of propylene glycol antifreeze and rerefined motor oil; and development of a theatrical production about oil recycling geared towards elementary school students.

Recommendations

1.) Hazardous Materials Indicators

It is recommended that the indicator targeting a 15% decrease in city-wide hazardous materials use be withdrawn and replaced with two indicators that target hazardous materials use in City operations only, which can be more easily measured. The following indicators are proposed: *(1) A 10% reduction in the amount of hazardous waste generated by City operations by the year 2000, using 1996 figures as a baseline* and *(2) A 10% reduction in the amount of hazardous materials purchased by the year 2000, using 1998 as a baseline*. It is also recommended that an additional underground storage tank indicator be adopted that reads: *Prior to December 22, 1998, all publicly and privately owned underground storage tanks shall either be removed from the ground, upgraded or replaced with systems in compliance with the new federal UGT standards.*

2.) CESQG Program

To help increase awareness about this program among the Santa Monica business community, it is recommended that Environmental Programs Division staff work with the Industrial Waste Division and the Fire Department to encourage their inspectors to distribute program information during inspections of regulated businesses.

3.) Janitor Training

It is recommended that Environmental Programs Division staff investigate the possibility of providing the Janitorial staff with refresher courses on the proper use of the alternative cleaning products, either on an annual or biannual basis.

4.) Tracking of City Hazardous Materials Purchases

It is recommended that developing the capability of the City's financial management computer system to track hazardous materials purchases be made a priority for the coming year.

5.) Warehouse

It is recommended that the Maintenance Management Division, which oversees operation of the warehouse, investigate ways to improve inventory control and work with the Environmental Programs Division staff to educate warehouse staff about the types and uses of stocked cleaning products. Maintenance Management staff have indicated that a new computer system is currently being installed at the warehouse which should help to alleviate the inventory problems.

STORMWATER, WASTEWATER AND SANTA MONICA BAY

Background

Stormwater

Stormwater, which is more accurately called urban runoff, consists of rainwater as well as runoff draining to city streets generated by irrigation, car washing or the hosing down of streets and sidewalks. The majority of this urban runoff in Santa Monica drains untreated into Santa Monica Bay via an underground storm drain system. This system consists of 2,308 catch basins and 64 storm drain lines which discharge at five outfalls within the city limits. The largest of these is located on the beach at Pico Boulevard and is known as the Pico-Kenter outfall. In addition to runoff from Santa Monica, this outfall also discharges runoff from parts of Brentwood and West Los Angeles. The other four outfalls are located on the beach at Montana Avenue, Wilshire Boulevard, the Santa Monica Pier, and Ashland Avenue. The Montana and Wilshire outfalls typically only discharge runoff to the ocean during heavy rains. The remaining three outfalls discharge year-round, during wet and dry periods. Under the federal Clean Water Act (CWA) the City is responsible for the quality of the urban runoff entering the storm drain system and for the enforcement and implementation of Local, State and Federal stormwater regulations. City oversight of stormwater programs and operation and maintenance of the stormwater system is coordinated by the Department of Environmental and Public Works Management. The City is responsible for the operation and maintenance of 824 catch basins and approximately 20 miles of storm drain lines. The remainder of the catch basins and storm drains within the city are owned and maintained by Los Angeles County.

The CWA and the California Ocean Plan are the primary mechanisms through which pollutant discharges to water bodies are regulated in California. The CWA established minimum national water quality goals and created the National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) to regulate the quality of discharged water. As of 1990 all municipal stormwater runoff became regulated under the NPDES system. The City of Santa Monica is currently a co-permittee with all other cities in Los Angeles County on the County's NPDES permit which was issued in 1990. Under this permit all co-permittees were required to develop a stormwater management plan which includes implementation of 13 baseline best management practices (BMPs) related to stormwater. These BMPs include: (1) catch basin labeling, (2) institution of a public reporting program, (3) implementation of a municipal runoff control ordinance, (4) development of public education material, (5) catch basin cleaning, (6) encourage increased trash receptacle usage, (7) increased street sweeping, (8) discourage improper litter disposal, (9) inspection of restaurants and automobile facilities, (10) encourage residents to remove dirt, rubbish and debris from sidewalks, (11) establish a recycling program, (12) motivate residents to properly dispose of hazardous waste, and (13) encourage water conservation. To date Santa Monica has met all of its compliance deadlines for implementation of these BMPs.

The Los Angeles Regional Water Quality Control Board (RWQCB) recently completed a comprehensive revision of the NPDES permit for the Los Angeles region. This revised permit was approved in July 1996. The permit revision was undertaken due to a perceived need to toughen existing standards because compliance with the existing permit had been inconsistent throughout the region. The revised permit is more comprehensive and specific than the previous permit and requires the City to conduct additional employee education and institute a construction-site inspection program to help mitigate construction-related stormwater impacts.

Wastewater

Wastewater (or "sewage") generated by Santa Monica's residential, commercial and industrial water users flows through underground sewer lines to the City of Los Angeles' Hyperion Treatment Plant, located approximately 7 miles southeast of Santa Monica in Playa del Rey. There the wastewater is screened, settled, and biologically treated before being discharged into Santa Monica Bay. Santa Monica pays a fee to Los Angeles for disposal of its wastewater based on the monthly effluent flows to

the treatment plant. There are approximately 125 miles of sewer lines within the city limits. They are owned by Santa Monica and are inspected and maintained by the City's Environmental and Public Works Management Department. Permitting and inspection of commercial and industrial wastewater generators is overseen by the department's Industrial Waste Division. Santa Monica's sewer system is completely separate from the stormwater system with only the wastewater being treated before it enters the Bay.

Existing Stormwater and Wastewater Programs and Policies

Virtually all of the water that falls on or is used in Santa Monica eventually ends up in the Bay. Urban runoff flows directly into the Bay without treatment, much of the time carrying with it contaminants such as fuel and oil, paint, heavy metals, pesticides, human and animal waste, and trash. The contaminants introduced by urban runoff pose a severe threat to the economic, recreational and biological resources of the Bay and to the city's economy and its residents. And while wastewater receives treatment before being discharged, any increase in the volume of wastewater flowing to the treatment plant results in an increase in costs to the City. In addition, increased wastewater volumes can tax the existing system and require large capital outlays for upgrades to the sewage system and the treatment plant. To address these issues, the City has instituted several programs and policies in an effort to reduce the amount of contaminants entering the stormwater and sewer systems, reduce wastewater flows to Hyperion, and reduce the volume and toxicity of contaminated urban runoff reaching the Bay. A brief description of these programs and policies is provided below. In addition, water conservation programs and policies designed to reduce wastewater flows are described in the "Water" section of this report. Programs designed to reduce hazardous chemical usage and improper disposal are described in the "Hazardous Materials" section of this report

• Industrial Pretreatment Program

The adoption and enforcement of this program are mandated by the current NPDES permit. Initiated in 1988, the objectives of the pretreatment program are to: (1) prevent the introduction of any pollutants into Hyperion Treatment Plant which may interfere with the operation of the plant, including interference with its use or disposal of municipal sludge; (2) prevent the introduction of pollutants into the treatment plant which might pass through the plant and into Santa Monica Bay; (3) improve opportunities to reclaim and recycle municipal and industrial wastewater and sludge; (4) reduce the risks to public health and the environment caused by the discharge of toxic pollutants to the treatment plant; and (5) prevent pollutants from commercial industrial users from entering the storm drain system. Businesses such as metal finishers, gas stations, auto repair shops, dry cleaners, and photo developers that produce wastewater containing toxic substances are required to obtain a permit from the City's Industrial Waste Section. Industrial Waste inspectors periodically inspect permitted business sites to ensure that wastewater isn't being illegally discharged to the storm drain system, to ensure that wastewater pretreatment equipment and oil/water separators are operating properly, to verify that hazardous waste is properly stored, manifested and hauled offsite, and to verify that good-housekeeping procedures and BMPs are being properly implemented. Some components of the Pretreatment Program are detailed below:

Grease Reduction and Recycling for Restaurants - All new restaurants and cooking facilities are required to install grease interceptors to prevent excessive grease buildup and blockages in the sewer system. Restaurants are also required to recycle their cooking oil. As a result of this program approximately 72,500 gallons of used cooking oil is recycled each year by local restaurants.

Dry Cleaner Control Program - All dry cleaners in the city are issued zero discharge permits and are not allowed to discharge any process wastewater or separator water to the sewer or storm drain systems due to the presence of perchloroethylene, a known carcinogen, used in the dry cleaning process. All waste perchloroethylene liquid and filter cartridges must be hauled offsite and

separator water must be treated onsite or hauled away. This program annually prevents approximately 13,100 gallons of perchloroethylene-contaminated wastewater from entering the sewers, storm drains, soil or groundwater.

Silver-Bearing Waste Reduction Program - All businesses conducting photo finishing activities (including photo finishers, printers, hospitals, schools, dentists, doctors and veterinarians) are required to treat silver-bearing waste streams on site or haul the waste away for offsite treatment. This program prevents the discharge of approximately 11,600 gallons of silver-bearing wastewater to the sewer each year.

Oil/Water Separator Policy - Existing auto maintenance facilities found to be discharging excessive oil and other pollutants to the sewer or stormdrain system and all new auto maintenance facilities are required to install oil/water separators at their sites. In addition, all new developments and remodels of new facilities, regardless of business type or usage, are required to install oil/water separators in their parking lots and parking structures.

- **Urban Runoff Pollution Control Ordinance**

This ordinance was adopted by City Council in 1992 and requires specific BMPs aimed at keeping toxic chemicals and hazardous waste out of the storm drain system for existing properties, new developments, and projects under construction. The ordinance also instituted a city-wide stormwater public education program and prohibits the use of 38 fungicides and pesticides that have been banned from manufacture by the EPA.

- **Water Conservation Ordinance**

This ordinance, adopted by City Council in 1988 and revised in 1991, promotes water conservation and to reduced runoff to the stormdrain system. The ordinance prohibits hosing down of sidewalks, parking areas and alleys, and restricts washing of vehicles and the watering of lawns and landscaping.

- **Storm Drain Low-Flow Diversion**

In 1992 the City entered into an agreement with the City of Los Angeles to divert dry weather flows from the Pico-Kenter storm drain to the Hyperion Sewage Treatment Plant. In 1996 the City received approval from the Los Angeles Board of Public Works to divert the Pier storm drain to Hyperion. During the 1996 dry weather season, the Pier stormdrain was blocked off at the ocean and collected stormwater was periodically pumped into the sewer system. A permanent diversion system will be installed on the Pier stormdrain in 1997. These diversions serve to significantly reduce the amount of untreated dry weather runoff reaching the Bay, however, diversion of the Pico-Kenter stormdrain can be improved. The Pico-Kenter diversion system is equipped with an automatic rain-activated switch to turn off the diversion pumps and resume flows to the Bay in the event of a storm. This switch was disconnected when the rain gauge was moved from the Transportation Yards to the City Yards in 1995 and has not been reconnected, so the diversion pumps are currently being shut down manually during rainy periods. Because of this the diversion pumps are now shut down at the start of the rainy season (November or December) and remain off until June, allowing dry and wet weather flow to drain to the Bay during this period. Typically there are extended periods of dry weather during this interval, so it is likely that this policy allows a significant amount of low-flow runoff to drain to the Bay which could otherwise be avoided.

- **Fuel Spill Sensor System**

Eight electronic hydrocarbon sensors have been installed along the length of the Pico-Kenter stormdrain in Santa Monica. This system, which became operational in March 1996, is designed to alert City officials in the event of a fuel or oil spill to the stormdrain to allow a response team to contain the spill before it reaches the Bay. The system was installed as a joint venture between the City of Santa Monica, the City of Los Angeles and Los Angeles County.

- **Catch Basin Cleaning and Street Sweeping**

This program helps to remove debris and contaminants from the streets and catch basins that might otherwise be carried onto the beaches and into the Bay by stormwater flow. The City's 824 catch basins are cleaned on a quarterly or monthly schedule as needed and all city streets are swept at least once per week.

- **Catch Basin Pilot Study**

The City obtained funding from the Santa Monica Bay Restoration Project to conduct this study which involves the investigation of methods for filtering, collecting and containing pollutants in catch basins. Santa Monica is heading a consortium of 13 local municipalities, the County of Los Angeles and CalTrans, for this basin-wide study. The Engineering Division of the Environmental and Public Works Management Department is overseeing the project and is in the process of selecting a consultant to conduct the investigation. The study is scheduled to be completed in October 1997.

- **Stormwater Public Education Programs**

Listed below are public education programs related to stormwater and Santa Monica Bay that are implemented by the City.

Stormwater Environmental Educational Partnership (SWEEP) - This educational pilot program was funded by the Santa Monica Bay Restoration Project and is being implemented by the City in partnership with Heal the Bay, a Santa Monica-based environmental advocacy group. The program aims to increase public awareness about urban runoff pollution by training local junior high and high school students to make presentations to business and community groups and to distribute public education door hangers throughout the community.

Urban Runoff Videos - In 1990 and 1991 the City produced two educational videos about urban runoff that have aired on the Santa Monica cable television station and have been distributed throughout the country.

Catch Basin Stenciling Program - Santa Monica began the first catch basin stenciling program in the region in 1989. This program involves the painting of a stencil adjacent to catch basins indicating that the catch basin drains directly to the Bay. Where feasible, all of the catch basins maintained by the City have been stenciled. Because the painted stencils tend to fade over time, the City is investigating more permanent marking systems to use when restenciling.

Educational Posters for the Restaurant and Auto Maintenance Industries - Industrial Waste Division has developed and distributed educational brochures and posters for the restaurant and auto maintenance industries outlining BMPs to reduce urban runoff contamination and volume due to their operations.

- **NPDES Urban Runoff Training for City Employees**

In the summer of 1995 the City's Stormwater Coordinator conducted urban runoff training sessions for City field crews at the City Yards and the Airport, as required by the City's NPDES permit. Approximately 150 employees received training, which involved a presentation on urban runoff concerns and BMPs related to City operations as well as feedback from the employees on how to improve stormwater management at their job sites. The training sessions resulted in significant improvement of the City's stormwater pollution prevention plans due to employee recommendations of procedural and structural changes to help reduce runoff volume and toxicity.

- **Stormwater Enterprise Fund**

In July 1995 the City Council approved the establishment of a Stormwater Enterprise Fund (SEF) to provide secure, long-term financing for the City's ongoing stormwater management efforts. Prior to that time, stormwater programs were funded by revenues from the City's wastewater fund. The SEF was established because wastewater charges are based on water usage and do not equitably distribute or reflect the cost of stormwater management. The SEF generates revenue by levying each parcel of

real property in the city in direct proportion to the amount of runoff generated at the site based on land use and parcel size.

Accomplishments

**Average Wastewater Volumes to Hyperion Treatment Plant
(million gallons per day)**

<u>Year</u>	<u>Volume</u>	<u>% Reduction</u>
1990	10.4	-
1991	8.6	17
1992	8.2	21
1993	8.5	18
1994	8.3	20
1995*	8.2	21

* January through August 1995 only

• Reduction in Runoff Due to Urban Runoff Mitigation Ordinance

It is estimated that between 20 and 40 new development projects in Santa Monica have completed Urban Runoff Mitigation Plans since the ordinance was first implemented in 1993. An analysis of seven of these projects indicates that mitigation measures incorporated at these sites have diverted 1,094,363 gallons of runoff from the Bay in the period between October 1994 and March 1995. The amount of runoff reduction per storm averaged 31,105 gallons. The total anticipated runoff from the properties analyzed was reduced by 24%, exceeding the 20% reduction specified in the ordinance.

• EPA National Storm Water Program Excellence Award

In 1995 the City of Santa Monica was awarded second place in the Municipal Category of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency’s National Storm Water Excellence Award program. The award recognizes municipalities that are demonstrating their commitment to protect and improve the quality of the nation’s waters by implementing outstanding, innovative and cost-effective stormwater control programs and projects.

Progress Towards Goals

• Stormwater

The Sustainable City Program Dry Weather Stormdrain Discharge indicator lists the 1990 baseline as 500,000 gallons per day (gpd), the 1993 discharge as 350,000 gpd, and sets the target for the year 2000 at 200,000 gpd. The baseline flow and the 1993 figure are based on visual estimates and estimates calculated from pumping rates at the Pico-Kenter outfall, and so the total discharge from all five Santa Monica stormdrains is not known to any degree of accuracy. Also, these flow rates are not static but fluctuate significantly due to variable rainfall amounts and groundwater levels, water main breaks, and other external factors. The City’s Engineering Division estimates that the dry weather flow at the Pico-Kenter outfall varies throughout the year between 250,000 gpd and 500,000 gpd. Although the Low-Flow diversion of the Pico-Kenter and Pier stormdrains has significantly reduced discharge to the Bay, it is not known by how much. More accurate figures will likely be available when the dry-weather treatment facility comes on-line in late 1997. Due to the current limitations of the available data it is recommended that this indicator be revised to reflect those limitations (see “Recommendations” below).

- **Wastewater**

The Wastewater indicator calls for a 15% reduction in wastewater flow, from 10.4 million gpd in 1990 to the target of 8.8 million gpd in 2000. The City surpassed this target with a 17% reduction to 8.6 million gpd in 1991 and has maintained or exceeded this level since then. The wastewater flows for 1994 averaged 8.3 million gpd and dropped to 8.2 million gpd for the first eight months of 1995. The reduced wastewater flows are likely due to reduction in city-wide water usage due to the City's various water conservation programs and policies.

Obstacles

- **Implementation and Enforcement of Urban Runoff Ordinance**

City Engineers began implementing this ordinance in April 1993. An analysis of the implementation and enforcement of the ordinance in 1995 revealed the following problems:

Enforcement - Currently there are no field inspectors monitoring projects under construction for compliance with the terms of the ordinance. And while Engineering plan checkers have been reviewing plans for new development projects to ensure that they comply with the required 20% runoff reduction, no field inspections have been performed to verify that the runoff reduction measures have actually been completed. The Planning Department has been approached and asked to incorporate urban runoff inspections into their regular building and planning inspections, but so far they have refused to cooperate. In general, City inspectors do not appear to be very familiar with the BMPs outlined in the ordinance. The Environmental and Public Works Management Department is currently exploring ways to integrate urban runoff inspections into other inspection programs to increase efficiency and help remedy this situation.

Runoff Calculations - Although a sample calculation for maximum allowable runoff is distributed to developers with the ordinance, to date all of the submittals received by the City have used different methods to calculate maximum allowable runoff for the sites, producing widely differing results. In an effort to eliminate this problem the City has developed a simplified and standardized calculation form.

Record Keeping - It has been difficult to determine the number of new developments that have been subject to the ordinance because the City's current record keeping and filing system doesn't accommodate this program. To solve this problem, the City has developed urban runoff worksheets which will be filed and used for tracking compliance and is developing a new database which includes information on Urban Runoff Mitigation Plans.

Plans for the Future

Efforts planned for the coming year to further safeguard the Bay include:

- **Construction of a Dry Weather Runoff Treatment Facility**

This facility, which is scheduled to be operational in December 1997, will treat all dry weather runoff from the Pico-Kenter and Pier stormdrains, significantly reducing the amount of runoff reaching the Bay. The treated water will be reused for irrigation throughout the city, reducing the demand for fresh water. A preliminary design study was completed in April 1996 and consultant selection for the design/construction phase of the project is in progress. The facility will be located adjacent to the Santa Monica Pier.

- **Stormwater BMP Manual for New Development**

The City plans to develop a manual of design BMPs to help developers, architects and builders comply with the 20% runoff reduction requirement specified in the Urban Runoff Ordinance. The manual will include information on the cost effectiveness, efficacy and reliability of various runoff reduction measures.

- **Stormwater BMP Video for Construction Sites**

The City, in conjunction with Los Angeles County and various industry groups, plans to produce a videotape outlining proposed stormwater BMPs for construction sites. The video will be aimed at building contractors to help increase their awareness about stormwater issues and to provide examples of techniques to reduce runoff from construction sites.

- **Launch 5-Year Urban Runoff Public Education Program**

The City's Environmental and Public Works Management Department plans to begin this public education program in late 1996. This program, which is required by the City's NPDES permit, will include participation in Los Angeles County's urban runoff public education programs as well as development and implementation of a program for local residents, businesses and students to highlight urban runoff concerns and solutions for Santa Monica.

- **Industrial Waste Pollution Prevention Permits/BMPs/Education Materials**

Industrial Waste permits will be revised to include language about required pollution prevention and BMPs to reduce contamination reaching the sewer and storm drain systems. Educational posters and brochures will be prepared for the dry cleaning industry outlining BMPs to reduce urban runoff contamination and volume due to their operations.

- **Industrial Waste Spill Absorbent Pillow Program for Parking Areas**

By the end of 1996 all facilities with oil/water separators in their parking areas will be required to install spill absorbent pillows in the separators to improve their effectiveness.

- **Increase Industrial Waste Inspection Procedures for Urban Runoff Ordinance Compliance**

The Industrial Waste Division will expand its inspectors' site checklist to provide better enforcement of the urban runoff ordinance.

Recommendations

- 1.) The Dry Weather Stormdrain Discharge indicator should be revised. The current indicator targets a reduction of the dry weather discharge to 200,000 gpd by the year 2000. Because stormdrain flow rates vary significantly due to a variety of factors, and because the City currently has no accurate method to measure flow rates, it is recommended to revise this target to read: ***Achieve 100% diversion or treatment of dry weather runoff for all Santa Monica stormdrains from March through November by the year 2000.*** This target will require the City to divert or treat runoff from the Ashland Avenue stormdrain and increase by three months the time that the diversion pumps at Pico Kenter stormdrain are activated.
- 2.) City staff should continue to evaluate the implementation of the Urban Runoff Mitigation Ordinance and investigate ways to improve implementation, enforcement and compliance.

EDUCATION

Background

This section provides an overview of the City's educational efforts pertaining to various areas of sustainability at Santa Monica schools.

Santa Monica Schools

There are 26 schools in Santa Monica and one state community college. Of the 26 schools, 14 are private and 12 are public. A breakdown of the schools is provided below.

Public Schools

Elementary (grades K - 6)

Edison Elementary
2425 Kansas Avenue

Franklin Elementary
2400 Montana Avenue

Grant Elementary
2368 Pearl Street

McKinley Elementary
2401 Santa Monica Blvd.

Muir Elementary
721 Ocean Park Boulevard

Will Rogers Elementary
2401 Fourteenth Street

Roosevelt Elementary
801 Montana Avenue

Santa Monica Alternative (K-8)
2802 Fourth Street

Middle Schools (grades 6-8)

John Adams Middle School
2425 Sixteenth Street

Lincoln Middle School
1501 California Avenue

High Schools (grades 9-12)

Santa Monica High School
601 Pico Boulevard

Olympic Continuation H.S.
1018 Arizona Avenue

Private Schools

Carden Elementary (K-6)
958 Lincoln Boulevard

Calthorp Elementary (K-6)
438 San Vicente Boulevard

Crossroads Elementary (K-5)
1229 Fourth Street

Crossroads Middle & Upper (6-12)
1714 21st Street

Lighthouse School
1220 20th Street

Newbridge School (K-12)
3131 Olympic Boulevard

Pilgrim Lutheran School (K-6)
1730 Wilshire Boulevard

P.S. #1 Elementary (K-6)
1447 Euclid Avenue

St. Anne's School
2015 Colorado Avenue

St. Monica's High School (9-12)
1030 Lincoln Boulevard

St. Monica's Elementary (K-8)

Santa Monica Montessori (pre-6)

1039 Seventh Street

1909 Colorado Avenue

Waldorf Elementary (pre - 4)
1515 Pearl Street

Approximately 8700 students are enrolled in Santa Monica's public schools. Private school enrollment is unknown. The Santa Monica-Malibu Unified School District operates and maintains the public schools, as well as a Child Development Center, an Adult Education Center and three public schools in the City of Malibu. Oversight of the School District is provided by an elected seven member School Board that meets twice monthly. The City of Santa Monica provides a portion of the School District's annual operating budget.

Santa Monica College is a state community college with an approximate enrollment of 22,000 students. Oversight of college operations and policy is provided by an elected seven member Board of Trustees. The college caters primarily to students seeking an Associate of Arts degree or credit to transfer to a four-year university. The majority of SMC's operating budget is provided by the State of California. The remainder is generated by student fees and tuition, and from private donations.

Existing Programs

Listed below are descriptions of programs developed or sponsored by the City of Santa Monica (with the exception of the Santa Monica College Environmental Audit, which was conducted by SMC students and faculty) which are designed to educate Santa Monica students and teachers about various aspects of sustainability. Similar programs designed to educate Santa Monica residents and the business community are described in other sections of this report.

• School Gardening Program

This program was developed as a partnership between the City, the School District and Common Ground (a non-profit organization affiliated with the University of California Cooperative Extension) to construct educational gardens at Santa Monica public schools. The program is funded by the City with day-to-day operation and volunteer coordination being provided by Common Ground. SMMUSD provides office space for Common Ground's program manager, administrative assistance and the resources of their maintenance staff. The program began in 1995 and to date has resulted in the installation of new gardens at three schools and the upgrading and installation of drip irrigation systems at existing gardens at three other schools. New gardens will be installed at six additional schools by mid-1997 as part of this program (see "Plans for the Future" below).

• In Concert With The Environment

In Concert with the Environment is a short-term educational program funded by the Metropolitan Water District and Southern California Edison utilizing a computerized survey to educate students and their families about energy and water conservation. The program requires students to complete a household resource-use survey, which they input into computers supplied to the school by the sponsoring utilities. Specialized software produces a resource-use analysis, giving the students an individualized listing of what they can do to use natural resources more efficiently and demonstrating to their parents the costs of inefficiency. The program was first implemented in 9th grade science classes at Santa Monica High School in 1995 and was expanded to include 8th graders at Crossroads School in 1996. To date, approximately 1250 students have participated in the program.

• Household Hazardous Waste Education Program

This school-based outreach program was designed to educate students and the community about HHW issues and encourage action to address them. The program began in April 1996 at John Adams Middle School and Santa Monica High School and included the introduction of a pilot supplementary curriculum for grades 7 through 9. The curriculum uses investigation and action skills to study the use, disposal and

alternatives to hazardous materials in schools and in the community. As part of the program, the students planned and presented the Gentle Earth Expo, an earth-friendly products fair and HHW collection event for the community to increase local awareness about HHW issues, on June 8, 1996 at John Adams Middle School. This program will be offered again at John Adams and Santa Monica High during the 1996-1997 school year (see "Plans For the Future" below).

- **Environmental Teachers Workshops**

Since 1993 the City's Environmental Programs Division has conducted an environmental workshop program open to all Santa Monica K-12 teachers. The program involves field trips and presentations on various environmental issues (e.g. a trip to the Ballona Wetlands and a presentation of wetlands ecosystems; a trip to the City's Household Hazardous Waste Facility and a discussion on hazardous waste issues) to educate the teachers and provide them with curriculum and field trip ideas. The teachers receive 1 unit of CSUN or District credit for attending the 5 workshop meetings. Approximately 25 teachers have participated in the program in each of the last three years.

- **Environmental Education Mini-Grant Program**

This program was initiated in 1995 by the City's Environmental Programs Division to provide funding to SMMUSD teachers to develop and implement environmental education projects. A total of \$2390 was awarded to five projects in 1995. During the 1996-1997 school year it is planned to fund 10 projects to a maximum of \$500 each.

- **Water Conservation Poster Contest**

This program, initiated by the City's Environmental Programs Division in 1991, is designed to increase student awareness of water conservation issues. All 4th graders from SMMUSD schools are invited to submit a poster with a water conservation theme to the City for judging. Ten winning posters are chosen for entry into the Metropolitan Water District's area-wide poster contest. Winners of MWD's contest are published in a calendar. As part of the program, City staff give presentations on water conservation to participating classes, provide poster paper and supplies, and organize a poster display and awards presentation party for all participants.

- **School Recycling Program**

This program, which began in October 1995, provides for mixed waste paper collection at all public and private schools in Santa Monica. The City provides each school with large recycling bins, small bins for each classroom, technical support, and recycling curriculum. Students at the schools participate in the collection of the recyclables and learn about the importance of recycling in classroom presentations, projects and field trips.

- **Santa Monica College Environmental Audit**

In December 1993, the Santa Monica College Environmental Affairs Committee completed an environmental audit of the campus. The audit focused on daily operations at the campus in the areas of Energy Use and Air Quality, Water Use and Disposal, Solid Waste, Purchasing, Hazardous/Toxic Substances, Food Services, and Education. The audit report provides specific recommendations for operational improvements in each of these areas. Findings of the audit have led to operational changes which have resulted in significant campus-wide reductions in energy use, water use, and waste generation, as well as significant cost savings for the college.

Accomplishments

- **SMC and District Adopted Statements**

With the City's encouragement, both the Santa Monica-Malibu Unified School District and Santa Monica College have committed to sustainability by adopting statements of environmental principles. The Santa Monica College Environmental Directive was adopted by the Board of Trustees in June 1995. SMMUSD's Environmental Literacy Statement was adopted by the School Board in July 1995.

Both of these statements are similar to the Guiding Principles of the Sustainable City Program and express a commitment by the District and the College to sustainability.

- **School Gardens Program**

Over the past year this program has greatly enhanced the ability of local public school teachers to incorporate gardening and nature study into their curriculum by renovating existing gardens and building new ones at the following six public schools.

Edison School - Two new raised bed vegetable gardens and irrigation systems were installed last Spring. In the Summer four other garden plots were renovated and provided with hose hook-ups.

Franklin School - One new raised bed vegetable garden was installed and other existing beds were renovated last Spring. New and existing gardens were provided with drip irrigation systems.

Lincoln Middle School - A temporary vegetable garden was renovated by community service students last Spring for use by Lincoln students until a permanent garden can be installed following completion of earthquake renovation at the school. A drought tolerant demonstration garden was completed in front of the school and dedicated this Spring.

McKinley School - A 40' x 100' Environmental Garden was completed at McKinley School this Summer. The garden has 16 raised beds for vegetables, a demonstration drought tolerant garden, a small orchard, a rock garden, and a gazebo. Future plans include the installation of a fish pond. Several of the raised beds have been fitted with drip irrigation lines.

Roosevelt School - A drip irrigation system was installed at the school's existing vegetable garden last Spring.

Will Rogers School - A 15' x 50' garden with six raised beds for vegetables, drip irrigation, fruit trees and work areas was dedicated last Fall.

Progress Towards Goals

The goal expressed in the Sustainable City Program for education is to implement a Sustainable Schools Program in the Santa Monica-Malibu Unified School District by the year 2000. To date, the program format and a proposal for the program have been developed by City staff, with input from SMMUSD staff. The proposal is currently being review by the School Board.

The proposed program format is similar to the Sustainable City Program but also includes a curricular component. The program will involve reassessment of District policies related to operations such as purchasing, fleet management, waste disposal, energy use, water use, landscaping, and facility maintenance in the District offices and at the individual school sites. The curricular component will involve the incorporation of a broad-based sustainability curriculum into the existing curriculum at the middle school and high school levels. The curriculum will introduce students to sustainability issues in the areas of resource use and efficiency, solid waste, environmental health and pollution, nutrition, and the natural environment. It is designed to empower the students to address issues related to each of these areas at the local level by performing sustainability evaluations of their schools and providing recommendations for improving the sustainability of school operations based on the results of their evaluations to school administrators. The proposed program will be directed by a program coordinator based at the School District. The program coordinator will be assisted at each of the schools by site coordinators. The proposal recommends that oversight for the program be provided by a Sustainable Schools Advisory Board which will include District staff, City staff, representatives from the School Board, City Council, Chamber of Commerce, Task Force on the Environment and a community liaison.

Obstacles

- **Sustainable Schools Program Is Not a SMMUSD Priority**

Based on discussions with SMMUSD staff and School Board members, it is apparent that implementing the Sustainable Schools Program is currently not a high priority for the District. This is primarily due to

the large number of other existing and proposed programs competing for staffing and funding. District personnel have also indicated that they are unwilling to commit District funds towards the program. A potential reason for this lack of commitment is that District staff were not adequately involved in the formulation of the program and they have not been fully made aware of the potential benefits of the program.

- **Funding for the Sustainable Schools Program**

The initial Sustainable Schools Program proposal included a budget of \$75,000 to \$95,000 per year for two years to be provided by the City to begin the program. After the first two years, the proposal calls for program staff to obtain outside funding from foundations and other sources to finance the program. Any operational cost savings resulting from the program would also provide a source of funds.

Funding for the first year of the program was included in the City's FY 1996-1997 budget request but it was turned down by City Council. In its place, Council provided \$250,000 to the District to fund one or more Council-specified items, one of them being the Sustainable Schools Program. District staff have prepared proposals to the School Board for each of the funding options specified by Council. The District's revised Sustainable Schools proposal budgets \$50,000 for one year only. The School Board is currently reviewing the proposals. Discussion of the Sustainable Schools proposal at a September 1996 School Board meeting indicated that the Board will not likely fund the program because they feel the revised program budget is too small to develop an effective program. If the proposal is turned down, additional funds would have to be identified in the City budget to fund the program if it is to be implemented during the 1996-1997 school year.

Plans for the Future

- **School Gardens Program**

Plans are currently being developed for a vegetable garden at Santa Monica High School, three biome gardens and a vegetable garden at John Adams Middle School, a vegetable garden at Lincoln Middle School, and a vegetable and flower garden at the District's Child Development Center. These will all be constructed within the next fiscal year. Preliminary plans are also being developed for gardens at Grant Elementary School and for two gardens at the new Los Amigos School facility which will house Muir Elementary and SMASH.

- **School Recycling Program**

The City's Recycling Division plans to do more outreach in the schools in an effort to increase participation in the mixed paper recycling program, as well as expand collection of metal, glass and plastics to more of the school sites.

- **Household Hazardous Waste Education Program**

This program will be offered again during the 1996-1997 school year in the 7th and 8th grade science magnet classes at John Adams Middle School and in the 9th grade physical science classes at Santa Monica High School.

Recommendations

- 1.) If the Sustainable Schools Program is not funded by the School Board, it is recommended that City staff and Task Force members work with the District Administration and staff to revise the program proposal and identify funding for the program for next year. It is strongly recommended that input be obtained from District teachers, administrative staff and School Board members when revising the program proposal. Task Force members and City staff should also work to educate School Board

members, City Council members and District staff about the potential environmental and economic benefits of the program.

- 2.) City staff and Task Force members should contact members of the faculty and administration at Santa Monica College to investigate the feasibility of instituting a comprehensive sustainability program at the college.

HOUSING

Background

This section presents an overview of programs, policies and infrastructure related to affordable housing in Santa Monica. Please note that information on programs for the homeless is not included in this section. Homeless programs and services are described in the “Community and Economic Development” section of this report.

Affordable housing programs and policies for very low-, low-, and moderate-income households in Santa Monica are administered by the Housing Division of the City’s Resource Management Department (RMD). RMD’s Housing Authority implements the City’s Section 8 housing assistance program. The City’s Rent Control Administration administers and supervises the financial and personnel affairs of the Rent Control Board (see below) and provides services to both tenants and landlords including: resolution of excess rent claims; encouraging owners to make needed repairs; and informing tenants and landlords of their rights and responsibilities under the Rent Control Law. The Policy and Planning Analysis Division of the City’s Planning and Community Development (PCD) Department oversees the planning review and approval process for affordable housing projects within the city.

The following City Commissions and Boards provide oversight and guidance on affordable housing issues in Santa Monica:

Housing Commission - A Council-appointed seven member panel that monitors and evaluates City Housing programs and provides recommendations to City Council and City staff on existing and proposed housing policies, programs and projects.

Rent Control Board - A five member elected board that is responsible for policy- making on rent control issues. Rent Control Administration staff administer and supervise the financial and personnel affairs of the Rent Control Board.

Redevelopment Agency Housing Authority

The members of the City Council act as commissioners for these two bodies. They provide oversight and direction to the City’s Resource Management Department and Housing Authority staff primarily regarding budgetary and policy issues.

Existing Planning Documents

Listed below are City planning documents related to affordable housing in Santa Monica

- **Housing Element of the General Plan**

The most recent version of the Housing Element was adopted in 1993 and is currently being updated (see “Plans for the Future” below). It profiles the demographic composition of the city and outlines the goals, policies and programs which the City will undertake to ensure that the housing needs of existing residents and those expected to move into the community over the next five years are met.

- **City of Santa Monica Consolidated Plan**

This plan was prepared by staff from the City’s Human Services and Housing and Redevelopment Divisions in 1995. The plan outlines needs for housing, homeless services, infrastructure improvements, community facilities, community services, accessibility, and economic development within the city and presents a five-year housing and development strategic plan, outlining objectives, implementation and monitoring.

Existing City Policies and Ordinances

Listed below are City policies and ordinances related to affordable housing in Santa Monica.

Rent Control

In April 1979, Santa Monica residents voted to amend the City Charter to establish rent control. The Charter amendment provided for the establishment of the Rent Control Board which is responsible for enforcing the Rent Control Law. Daily administration of the law is provided by staff in the City's Rent Control Department.

The purpose of the law is to: preserve residential rental housing which is affordable to people with moderate and low-incomes; control monthly rents on residential dwellings; limit circumstances for evictions; and encourage the maintenance of rental properties. Under the terms of the Rent Control Law, the Board sets the maximum allowable rent for all controlled rental units in the City and annually approves general rent increases.

In January 1996 a new state law went into effect that phases out rent control over a three year period. The new law will allow landlords to raise rents by up to 15% upon voluntary vacancy of rental units a maximum of two times between January 1996 and December 1998. Beginning January 1999 landlords can establish initial rents for new tenancies at market levels. These rents will then be recontrolled. The new law does not affect existing tenants in rent controlled units.

Tenant Ownership Rights Charter Amendment (TORCA)

TORCA, adopted by the City in 1984, permits the conversion of rental units to ownership only if two-thirds or more of the building's tenants agree to the conversion and one-half or more declare that they intend to buy their units. In order to assist low- and moderate- income tenants to purchase their units, the City has established a loan program funded by a tax levied on units that are converted to condominiums through the TORCA process. The loan program provides eligible low- and moderate-income tenants with deferred-payment loans to assist the tenants in purchasing their units. A 1992 amendment to TORCA also allows the use of up to 50% of the TORCA tax for the acquisition, development and rehabilitation of affordable housing units. Currently no new TORCA applications are being accepted.

Zoning Incentives for Affordable Housing

In July 1992, largely in response to the homelessness situation in the City, the City Council adopted ordinance modifications establishing new standards to facilitate the development of affordable housing. These standards have been integrated into the City's Zoning Ordinance and provide for the following incentives:

- **Planning Fee Waiver:** The ordinance waives all Planning and Zoning review fees on developments that are 100% deed-restricted for affordable housing.
- **Special Needs Housing by Right in Residential Zones:** Permits senior and senior group housing, transitional housing, SRO housing, congregate housing, and domestic violence shelters by right in all multi-family residential districts.
- **Special Needs Housing by Right in Commercial Zones:** Permits single family housing, multi-family housing, shelters of less than 55 beds, domestic violence shelters, congregate housing, transitional housing, single room occupancy housing, and senior housing by right in the BCD, C2, C3, C3C, C4, C5, C6, CM, and CP zones.
- **Exemption from Story Limit:** Exempts 100% affordable housing projects from the applicable limits on the number of stories. Such projects are still subject to applicable height limits in each zone.
- **Height Bonus:** Offers height bonus of 10 feet for 100% affordable housing projects in non-residential zones, subject to consistency with the General Plan Land Use Element.

- **Augmented Density Bonus:** In addition to the state-mandated density bonus, the ordinance provides for an additional density bonus equal to the state bonus.
- **Reduced Parking Requirements:** Reduces parking requirements for affordable housing, senior housing, shelters, congregate care housing, and transitional housing.
- **Floor Area Bonus:** Offers a 50% floor area bonus to 100% deed-restricted affordable housing projects in residential zones.

Proposition R / Inclusionary Housing Program

In November 1990, Santa Monica voters approved Proposition R requiring that 30% of all new multi-family construction of two or more units (on an annual basis) be affordable to low- and moderate-income households.

To implement Proposition R, the City Council adopted Ordinance 1615 in March 1992 establishing detailed regulations for the City's Inclusionary Housing Program. The inclusionary housing program requires all residential projects of two or more units to provide 30% inclusionary housing. At least 50% of the required inclusionary housing units must be low-income units. Projects ranging from 2 to 6 units are required to provide only 1 low-income unit. Projects ranging from 7 to 19 units are required to provide 2 to 3 low-income units and 1 to 2 moderate-income units. All moderate-income inclusionary units required must be provided on-site. In limited circumstances an inclusionary fee may be paid in lieu of providing the required low-income units on-site. Projects of 20 units or more must provide all inclusionary units on-site.

Existing Housing Programs

Listed below are existing programs to promote the development and availability of affordable housing in Santa Monica.

Non-Profit Housing Corporations

There are several non-profit housing corporations in Santa Monica established to develop, purchase and renovate, or facilitate the construction of affordable housing for low- and moderate-income persons. These include the Community Corporation of Santa Monica (CCSM), the Ocean Park Community Center, the Retirement Housing Foundation, the Menorah Housing Foundation, Volunteers of America, Project New Hope, Upward Bound, New Directions, and Step Up On Second. The largest of these, CCSM, was established in 1982. As of October 1996, CCSM has developed and rehabilitated 567 affordable units in Santa Monica and is continuing its efforts to expand and maintain the city's affordable housing stock.

Fair Housing Program

The Fair Housing Program is run by the City Attorney's Office and involves the investigation of complaints involving charges of discrimination in housing based upon race, national origin, religion, sex, age, marital status, sexual orientation, AIDS, and children.

The City's Rent Control Board also provides a variety of services to both tenants and landlords including: resolution of excess rent claims; encouraging owners to make needed repairs through the rent decrease mediation and petition process; and informing tenants and landlords of their rights and responsibilities under the Rent Control Law.

In addition, the City contracts with the Legal Aid Foundation of Los Angeles to provide general legal counseling and tenant/landlord counseling for low- and moderate-income households.

Housing Trust Funds

The City maintains four housing trust funds which provide low-interest loans to qualified non-profit organizations to construct new multi-family affordable housing projects and to acquire and renovate existing multi-family units throughout the City.

Section 8 Affordable Housing Program

The Section 8 Program was enacted as part of the federal Housing and Community Development Act of 1974. Santa Monica's Section 8 Program is administered by the City's Housing Authority and is intended to ensure that very low-income families in Santa Monica can find decent, safe and affordable rental housing in the private market. The program provides rent subsidy payments to eligible households and ensures that units leased under the program meet housing quality standards. The program guarantees to the rental unit owner the payment of the difference between the approvable rent for the unit and 30% of the eligible family's monthly adjusted income. Funding for the program is provided by the federal Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). There are currently approximately 3000 applicants on the waiting list for this program.

Progress Towards Goals

The Sustainable City Program indicator for affordable housing calls for an increase of 750 deed-restricted affordable housing units in Santa Monica by the year 2000. The 1990 baseline of 1172 units presented in the 1994 Sustainable City Program document refers to the number of "deed-restricted, publicly assisted" affordable housing units in the City at that time. That baseline figure does not include the number of privately developed deed-restricted units because an inventory of those units had not yet been completed. As of October 1996, the number of publicly-assisted housing units in the City had risen to 1470, an increase of 298 since 1990. Housing Division staff estimate that there are an additional 700 privately developed deed-restricted units in the city.

Staff from the City's Rent Control Department and Housing Division are currently conducting an inventory of all publicly assisted and privately developed deed-restricted units. This inventory should be completed by early 1997. Because the existing baseline for this indicator does not accurately reflect the total amount of deed-restricted units in the city, it is recommended that a new baseline and target be developed for this indicator upon completion of the inventory. Input from the Housing Commission and Housing Division staff should be sought when setting the new target.

Obstacles/Needs

Housing needs and obstacles are currently being addressed in the November 1996 Draft 1998-2003 Housing Element Update (see "Plans for the Future" below).

Plans for the Future

In 1995 the Planning and Community Development Department initiated an update of the Housing Element of the City's General Plan. The updated element will contain a rigorous examination of potential barriers to affordable housing in Santa Monica and will present updated housing policies and objectives. As part of this process, three community meetings were held in 1995 to obtain input from Santa Monica residents. A draft of the updated element will be presented to the Planning Commission, Housing Commission, and Rent Control Board for review in December 1996. Public hearings will begin in January 1997 and the updated element is scheduled to go to City Council for review in February 1997. After City Council review the Draft Housing Element will undergo environmental review consistent with State CEQA requirements and review by the California State Department of Housing and Community Development. Final adoption hearings before City Council are scheduled for fall 1997.

Recommendations

- 1.) The baseline and target for the Deed-Restricted Affordable Housing indicator should be updated upon completion of the City's 1998-2003 Housing Element in Fall 1997. Staff from the Housing Division should be consulted when developing the new indicator target. This target should be consistent with recommendations in the updated Housing Element.

- 2.) The updated Housing Element should be reviewed when completed to determine if, based on its findings and recommendations, additional indicators for housing can be incorporated into the Sustainable City Program. The Planning Commission, Housing Commission, and City staff from the Resource Management and Planning and Community Development departments should be consulted during this process.

COMMUNITY AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Background

Community and Economic Development is an important and often overlooked area of sustainability. It involves such issues as employment and the local economy; availability of affordable housing, public land and recreational facilities; services for the poor, disabled, elderly and children; and local artistic and cultural resources. The combination of these elements greatly contributes to an area's sense of community and quality of life. This section provides an overview and evaluation of Parks and Open Space, Community and Social Services (including services for the homeless), Arts and Cultural Services, and Economic Development in Santa Monica. Information on affordable housing in Santa Monica can be found in the "Housing" section of this report.

• City Staff Involvement

Community and economic development in Santa Monica are primarily addressed by staff from the City's Community and Cultural Services (CCS), Resource Management, and Planning and Community Development (PCD) Departments. Within CCS, the Parks and Sports Division manages and maintains all park grounds, playing fields and public open spaces, administers sports and recreational programs, and maintains all public trees and landscaping. The Community and Senior Programs Division provides meals programs, recreational activities, and special events for senior citizens; programs for the disabled; community recreation classes; oversight of volunteer programs; and management of the Ken Edwards Center. Long range strategic planning for the arts and management of public arts are provided by the Cultural Affairs Division. The Events Facilities Division manages, markets, and maintains the Civic Auditorium and manages the City's community events process. The Human Services Division is responsible for human services planning and advocacy focusing on homelessness, children, youth and families, persons with disabilities, victims of domestic violence, seniors and low-income households. The Division funds over 50 human services programs provided by local non-profit organizations and administers a number of direct service programs including: CREST and afterschool programs, the Police Activities League Program at Memorial Park, and operation of the Thelma Terry Community Center at Virginia Park.

The Resource Management Department's Economic Development/Pier Division manages the City's Farmers' Market program and manages the public areas of the Santa Monica Pier. The PCD's Policy and Planning Analysis Division prepares reports, studies and policy analyses on a broad range of community issues including urban design, open space, population, employment, housing, historic resources, and regional planning. The Beach Division of the Environmental and Public Works Management Department operates and maintains the Santa Monica State Beach.

• City Boards and Commissions

Listed below are brief descriptions of the City Boards and Commissions that provide oversight and guidance for community and economic development programs and policies within Santa Monica.

Arts Commission - A 13 member panel that initiates and advocates for arts programs, reviews and makes recommendations to City Council for art acquisition and public art projects, solicits private funds and grants for art activities, and assesses ongoing art programs within the city.

Commission on Older Americans - A nine member panel that acts in an advisory capacity to the City Council and City staff on matters pertaining to senior citizens.

Commission on the Status of Women - A nine member panel that addresses issues related to women's equality including employment, education, health, and safety.

Planning Commission - A seven member panel that meets twice monthly to review requests for development permits, conditional use permits, appeals to Zoning Administrator decisions, and planning policy matters. This commission is involved in all long range planning issues for the city including land use and open space issues.

Recreation and Parks Commission - A seven member panel that advises the City Council and the Director of CCS in all matters pertaining to public recreation and parks management.

Social Services Commission - A seven member panel that advises City Council and City staff and reviews policies and programs for the provision of social services to Santa Monica residents.

**Redevelopment Agency
Housing Authority**

The members of the City Council act as commissioners for these two bodies. They provide oversight and direction to the City's Resource Management Department and Housing Authority staff primarily regarding budgetary and policy issues.

• **Neighborhood Organizations**

Santa Monica has six neighborhood associations that address issues affecting the various neighborhoods in the city and encourage community participation in the City's decision-making process by providing information and a forum for discussion to local residents. The organizations and the areas of the city they represent are listed below:

Wilshire-Montana Neighborhood Association (W/M) - between Montana Ave and Wilshire Blvd., east of 21st St.

Mid City Neighbors (Mid City) - south of Washington Ave and east of Lincoln Blvd. Southern boundary is Santa Monica Blvd. west of 20th St. and Colorado Ave east of 20th St.

Pico Neighborhood Association (PNA) - north of Pico Blvd. and east of Lincoln Blvd. Northern boundary is Santa Monica Blvd. west of 20th St. and Colorado Ave east of 20th St.

Ocean Park Community Organization (OPCO) - south of Pico Blvd. and west of Lincoln Blvd.

Sunset Park Associated Neighbors (SPAN) - south of Pico Blvd. and east of Lincoln Blvd.

Friends of Sunset Park (Friends) - south of Pico Blvd. and east of Lincoln Blvd.

Logistical support including staff assistance, newsletter production, and notification of pending City actions and relevant issues is provided to the neighborhood associations (with the exception of Friends of Sunset Park) by the Neighborhood Support Center (NSC), an independent non-profit agency established by the City in 1987 to provide centralized staff support for community participation efforts. Friends of Sunset Park is not eligible to receive NSC staff support because it wishes to endorse candidates for public office.

• **Economic Development Organizations, Agencies and Corporations**

Listed below are organizations, agencies, and corporations in Santa Monica that address economic development issues within the city.

Chamber of Commerce

The Santa Monica Chamber of Commerce was established in 1925 as a private, non-profit, non-governmental association of business, industrial, professional and community organizations. Membership ranges from individual entrepreneurs, non-profit organizations and action groups, to multi-

national conglomerates. The Chamber promotes Santa Monica as a regional business location and acts as an advocate for local business interests. Several committees including the Government Affairs Committee, Environmental Affairs Committee, Economic Affairs Committee, Education Committee and the Women's Business Council meet monthly to discuss various issues affecting the economic development and quality of life in Santa Monica.

Commercial Districts

There are six commercial assessment districts in Santa Monica. These include the Main Street Merchants, Central Business District, Bayside District, Bayside Restaurant Association, Bayside Merchants Association, and the Montana Merchants Association.. Businesses within each district contribute funding for marketing and promotion of the district. The Santa Monica Chamber of Commerce is contracted to administer funds for each district. Businesses along Pico Boulevard are not represented by a business district, but rather by the Pico Boulevard Committee, a Chamber of Commerce subcommittee.

Convention and Visitors Bureau

The Santa Monica Convention and Visitors Bureau is a private, non-profit organization created to promote Santa Monica as a conference, business and leisure travel destination. The Bureau originated as part of the Chamber of Commerce and became an independent organization under contract to the City of Santa Monica in 1982. The Bureau works to create a balanced tourism environment that maximizes return while minimizing negative impacts by encouraging off-season travel, longer stayovers and increased spending.

Pier Restoration Corporation(PRC)

The PRC is a private non-profit corporation established in 1983 to oversee the reconstruction of the Santa Monica Pier and to manage its ongoing operations. The primary task of the PRC is to solicit and negotiate investment by the private sector for Pier reconstruction and development. An 11 member Board of Directors provides oversight and reports to City Council.

Existing Open Space, Facilities and Infrastructure

Listed below are City-owned and operated open spaces, recreation facilities and public gathering facilities. Additional information on these facilities can be found in the City's Open Space Element-Recreation and Parks Master Plan Phase I Status Report and in the Master Environmental Assessment.

• Parks

There are 24 parks in Santa Monica comprising 112.6 total acres. These include: Ashland Park, Barnard Way Linear Park, Beach Parks #1 and #4, Clover Park, Crescent Bay Park, Douglas Park, Goose Egg Park, Hotchkiss Park, Joslyn Park, Lincoln Park, Los Amigos Park, Marine Park, Memorial Park, MGM Plaza Park, Ocean View Park, Ozone Park, Pacific Street Park, Palisades Park, Park Drive Park, Schader Park, South Beach Park, Stewart Street Park, and Virginia Avenue Park. All of these are owned and operated by the City, with the exception of MGM Plaza Park (3.5 acres), which is managed by Colorado Place but is open to the public as stipulated in the development agreement for the site. Many of the parks have tennis, volleyball and basketball courts, sports fields, and picnic facilities. In addition to the parks listed above, the City manages almost 209 acres of Santa Monica State Beach through an operating agreement with the State of California.

• Community Gardens and Demonstration Gardens

There are two community gardens available for use by Santa Monica residents:

- 2300 block of Main Street between Strand and Hollister - 60 plots (approximately 18' x 20' per plot).
- Broadway Park - 1400 block of Park Drive between Santa Monica Boulevard and Broadway - 10 plots (approximately 18' x 20' per plot).

These gardens have been in operation since 1973. A Community Gardens Advisory Committee has been established to oversee operations of the gardens.

The Environmental Programs Division maintains three xeriscape demonstration gardens in the Civic Center area which showcase the use of water-conserving irrigation equipment and vegetation. An additional xeriscape pocket garden installed and maintained by the City is located on Ocean Park Boulevard.

- **Library**

The Santa Monica Public Library includes the Main Library at 1343 Sixth Street and three branches: the Montana Avenue Branch, the Fairview Branch and the Ocean Park Branch. The library facilities and services are available to residents and non-residents at no charge.

- **Recreational Facilities**

There are four City-owned and operated recreational facilities (facilities primarily used for recreational activities) in Santa Monica: The Municipal Swimming Pool located at Santa Monica College, the Santa Monica State Beach Facility at 415 Pacific Coast Highway*, a gymnasium at Memorial Park, and the Police Assistance League (PAL)'s Youth Center on Olympic Boulevard. The PAL Youth Center includes a computer room, gymnasium, classroom, dance room, kitchen, lounge, and arts and crafts room. In addition to these facilities, a city-wide network of bicycle lanes and the Beach Bicycle Path provide areas for recreational cycling, and public tennis courts are available throughout the city.

- **Other Public Meeting Facilities and Open Space**

Ken Edwards Center for Community Services - The Center was opened in 1990 to provide meeting space for local non-profit agencies and the public. The Center is comprised of three components: the Community Conference and Meeting Space (includes 5 meeting rooms), the Senior Multi-Service Center, and Common areas. The Senior Multi-Service Center is occupied by two non-profit senior service organizations and the City's Senior Services Division, and includes a Senior Nutrition Program and dining room.

Thelma Terry Community Center - Located within Virginia Avenue Park, this community center provides services to the residents of the Pico Neighborhood through information referral, workshops, classes, activities and events.

Lincoln Park Community Center - Located in Lincoln Park on Wilshire Boulevard and 7th Street, this community center provides workshops, classes, meeting rooms, activities and events for local residents.

Senior Recreation Center - The Senior Recreation Center, located in Palisades Park, is a meeting and recreational facility that provides numerous cultural, recreational and health programs for senior citizens from Santa Monica and the surrounding area, either free or charge or for a nominal fee.

Marine Park Child Care Center - This facility located at Marine Park is funded by the City and operated under contract with the City by the Santa Monica-Malibu Unified School District. Onsite facilities include an auditorium used for community meetings and programs.

Civic Auditorium - The Civic Auditorium, located in the Civic Center on Main Street, hosts a variety of concerts, exhibits, and arts and cultural events.

Pier - The Santa Monica Pier provides various public recreation activities including fishing and an amusement park, and is the site of frequent concerts, arts and cultural events.

* This facility was damaged in the 1994 Northridge earthquake and has been closed since that time.

Third Street Promenade - The City maintains 2.4 acres of grounds at the Third Street Promenade, a pedestrian-only promenade between Wilshire Boulevard and Broadway. Although this area is not a natural open space, it provides valuable community and social interaction, and is a location for numerous cultural events and programs.

Existing Community and Economic Development Planning Documents

Listed below are existing City planning documents related to community and economic development.

• General Plan Elements

Listed below are the elements of Santa Monica's General Plan most directly pertaining to community and economic development issues. For additional information on the General Plan, please refer to the "Construction and Development" section of this report.

Land Use Element

The Land Use Element was originally adopted by Council in 1958 and was updated in 1984 and amended in 1987. It addresses the proposed general distribution and location of housing, business, industry, open space, education, public buildings and grounds, and other categories of land use; policy standards of population density and building use intensity; and contains specific development standards outlining the appropriate development densities and intensities for all land use districts.

Open Space Element

The Open Space Element was originally adopted in 1973 and is currently undergoing a comprehensive update which is scheduled for completion in mid-1997 (for more information on this update, please refer to "Plans for the Future" below). The stated objective of the existing Element is to define and identify those open space uses important to the community and to provide a program assuring their preservation. The Element includes an open space inventory, analysis, and map, and a policy program addressing preservation measures. The updated Open Space Element will include a vision statement outlining the comprehensive open space, community parks and recreation system in Santa Monica; an inventory of open space resources; long-range goals, objectives and policies; and a list of funding and implementation strategies.

• City of Santa Monica Consolidated Plan

This plan was prepared by staff from the City's Human Services and Housing and Redevelopment Divisions in 1995. The plan outlines needs for housing, homeless services, infrastructure improvements, community facilities, community services, accessibility, and economic development within the city and presents a five-year housing and development strategic plan, outlining objectives, implementation and monitoring. For more information on housing please refer to the "Housing" section of this report.

• Cultural Arts Master Plan

This plan provides guidance for the future provision of cultural activity in Santa Monica. The plan promotes the idea of public-private partnerships and includes recommended objectives for visual and performing arts and cultural events in the City. This plan is complemented by the Local Coastal Art Plan which was developed as a guide for the installation of outdoor public artworks within the Coastal Zone.

• Child Care Master Plan

This plan was prepared in 1991 by the City in conjunction with the Santa Monica-Malibu Unified School District and Santa Monica College. The plan evaluates the availability, affordability, and quality of child care in Santa Monica, outlines child care needs, and presents goals and objectives.

• Santa Monica Task Force on Homelessness - A Call to Action

This report, published in December 1991, presents the findings and recommendations of the Santa Monica Task Force on Homelessness, a Council-appointed citizens' task force created in March 1991. The report contains recommendations in the areas of Public Health and Safety, Social Services, Shelter and Housing, Resources and Funding, and Advocacy and Partnerships designed to help reduce the overall number of homeless people in Santa Monica.

- **Kids in Santa Monica**

This report provides a comprehensive assessment of the needs of Santa Monica's Youth. It was prepared in 1989 and presents the results of a study conducted by the Santa Monica Committee for Youth (appointed by the City Manager) to look at existing youth services, identify unmet needs and recommend strategies for enhancing youth programs. Much of the input for this report came from young people in Santa Monica. The report contains findings and recommendations in the following areas: Teen Pregnancy and Parenting, Substance Abuse, Mental Health, Youth Employment, Recreation, Child Abuse, Gangs and Juvenile Delinquency, School Dropouts, Children with Disabilities, Childcare, Networking and Collaboration, Youth Budget, Outreach and Public Information, Evaluation, and Technical Assistance.

Existing Programs and Services

- **Open Space Programs**

- **Community Gardens**

- This program began in 1973 and provides garden plots for use by City residents. There are currently two community garden locations with 70 individual plots (for details, please refer to the "Existing Open Space, Facilities and Infrastructure" section above). The City provides water and trash collection at the gardens. A Community Gardens Advisory Committee meets bi-monthly to discuss garden-related issues and resolve problems. The annual cost for a plot was recently raised from \$18 to \$40. Currently there is a 2 to 3 year waiting list with 126 people waiting for garden plots to become available.

- **Sustainable Landscape Workshops and Garden Tours**

- In 1991 the City began sponsoring annual Sustainable Landscape workshops and bi-monthly tours of local sustainably-designed residential gardens. The workshops and tours are directed at residents and landscape professionals to promote the use of sustainable practices in the design and maintenance of landscaped areas. To date approximately 1150 people have participated in the workshops and tours.

- **School Gardens Program**

- This program was developed as a partnership between the City, the Santa Monica-Malibu School District and Common Ground (a non-profit organization affiliated with the University of California Cooperative Extension) to construct educational gardens at Santa Monica public schools. The program is funded by the City with day-to-day operation and volunteer coordination being provided by Common Ground. SMMUSD provides office space for Common Ground's program manager, administrative assistance and the resources of their maintenance staff. The program began in 1995 and to date has resulted in the installation of new gardens at three schools and the upgrading and installation of drip irrigation systems at existing gardens at three additional schools. Additional gardens are in various stages of planning at six additional District schools.

- **Community, Recreational and Social Services**

- The following is a summary of existing Community, Recreational and Social programs either provided or funded by the City of Santa Monica. Additional information on these programs can be found in the Santa Monica Draft Open Space Element-Recreation and Parks Master Plan Phase I Report and in the City of Santa Monica Consolidated Plan.

- **Children, Youth and Family Programs**

- Connections for Children - The City funds comprehensive childcare information and referral services, childcare subsidies for low-income parents, parent education, and technical assistance to childcare providers.
- CREST and After School Programs - A variety of activities for elementary and middle-school aged children including child care, recreation, enrichment and sports activities.
- General Youth Classes - Include “Learning Through Play”, computer education, youth jazz dance, karate, and “Team Santa Monica”, a youth swim team.
- Junior Leader Program - A youth volunteer program that enables children ages 8 to 15 to assist recreation staff members with various activities including publicity, games, crafts and leadership.
- Marine Park Child Care Center - The City funds this childcare center for City employees and low-income families. The center is operated by the Santa Monica-Malibu Unified School District.
- Police Activities League (PAL) - This program was created in 1989 to provide constructive activities for Santa Monica Youth to reduce the incidence of juvenile delinquency. The program targets at-risk youth, and activities include theater workshops, movie clubs, tennis leagues, computer classes, and arts and crafts classes. Coaches and instructors for the program are Santa Monica Police personnel, CCS personnel, and local volunteers.
- Sports Classes and Leagues - Including tennis, flag football, volleyball and aquatics.
- Teen Parent Program - The City funds a childcare and educational program for teenage parents and their children.
- Youth Case Management and Counseling - The City funds school-linked services that provide comprehensive counseling and case management, dispute resolution, parenting and family support services targeting at-risk elementary, middle- and high-school aged youths.
- Youth Employment Programs - The City funds this collaborative effort between Santa Monica High School Alliance, Santa Monica College, the Virginia Park Community Center and the City’s Environmental and Public Works Management Department.
- Youth-Intergenerational Program - The Senior and Community Programs Division offers an intergenerational program that links children with older adults to share in recreational experiences.

Community Classes

- Art, Dance and Music Instruction
- Fitness Classes - Including yoga, stretching, and aerobics.
- Special Interest Classes - Including boating, self defense, photography, and dog obedience.

Community Services (General)

- American Red Cross (ARC) - The City funds ARC to provide cardio-pulmonary resuscitation training to students, City employees, low-income persons, and community groups.
- Community Assistance programs - The City funds two organizations to provide advocacy, general counseling and case management, emergency food distribution and senior socialization activities targeting low-income households and minorities in the Pico Neighborhood.
- Computer Access - The City funds a comprehensive model of learning opportunities in computer technology, technical assistance and education.
- Domestic Violence Services - The City funds a domestic violence program which provides assistance with restraining orders, shelter, counseling and education.
- General Health Services - The City funds the Venice Family Clinic to provide free primary care and specialty health services to low- and no-income persons in Santa Monica.
- Legal Services - The City funds community dispute resolution and legal services programs providing legal counseling, brief service and representation to low-income individuals.
- Santa Monica AIDS Project - The City funds this program which provides case management, information and referral, and support services to persons with AIDS/HIV.

Community Sports

- Aquatics - Including open swimming and recreational swimming.
- Sports Leagues - Including basketball, volleyball, and softball.
- Tennis - Clinics and instruction.

- Volleyball - Beginning and intermediate classes.

Disability Services

- Accessibility Projects - The Architectural Barrier Removal Program and the Curb Cut Program are administered by the Engineering Division of the Environmental and Public Works Management Department.
- American Disabilities Act (ADA) - The City's Human Services Division assists all City departments with implementation of the ADA and Federal 504 Regulations which require the provision of public accommodations to persons with disabilities. The division also sponsors special public awareness projects and materials regarding access and disability as well as technical assistance to businesses, social service agencies and other community groups.
- Center for the Partially-Sighted - The City provides funding to provide low-vision services including optometric, psychological and peer counseling, independent living and mobility training.
- Eyecycle Program - Teams up persons with impaired vision with sighted volunteers for monthly bicycle rides.
- Gardening - Allows disabled persons the opportunity to work on a City garden plot, with or without the assistance of volunteers.
- Social Programs - Include movies, dances and field trips for persons with developmental disabilities.
- Transportation - Santa Monica Municipal Bus Line buses feature wheelchair lifts to facilitate disabled access.
- Westside Center for Independent Living - The City funds this center to provide specialized information assistance and referral to persons with disabilities.
- Westside Special Olympics - A non-profit entity supported by the City to provide year-round sports training and competition for disabled persons.

Homeless Programs

Staff from the City's Human Services Division coordinate and administer programs for the homeless in Santa Monica. Implementation of the homeless programs is primarily handled by non-profit human service organizations that are funded by the City. These include Chrysalis, the Clare Foundation, the Ocean Park Community Center, St. Joseph Center, the Salvation Army, Step Up On Second, the Venice Family Clinic, and the Westside Food Bank. Services provided include the following:

- Coordinated Case Management Services - The City funds a coordinated case management program offered by five homeless service organizations providing assistance with government benefits, employment, shelter and housing.
- Emergency Shelter - The City funds Samoshel, an emergency homeless shelter located at 505 Olympic Boulevard that provides overnight shelter and meals to 100 homeless persons nightly.
- Employment Services - The City funds a number of homeless employment programs including job training and skill development, assistance with résumé writing, and job placement.
- Outreach Programs - The City funds an outreach program targeting homeless people in parks, beaches, and other public places. Outreach team members work closely with Park Rangers and the Police Department's Homeless Liaison Program to inform homeless persons of the availability of City-provided services.
- Transitional Shelter - The City funds two transitional housing programs that provide 55 transitional shelter beds for homeless adult men and women and 15 transitional shelter beds for mentally disabled homeless women.
- Westside Food Bank (WFB) - Funded by the City, this organization collects and distributes food to hungry and homeless persons in conjunction with Santa Monica's Human Services programs.

Library/Informational Programs

- Information Services - Information on most subjects is available in person, by telephone and through the Public Information Network (PEN) Quick Reference system from the Main Library Reference Department.
- Latino Outreach Program - Designed to serve the informational and educational needs of Santa Monica's Latino community, the program includes story hours, library visits, and life skills classes for adults and seniors.

- Library Service to Shut-Ins - Volunteers deliver library materials to any Santa Monica resident who is unable to visit the library because of illness, age, frailty or other disabilities.
- Public Electronic Network (PEN) - PEN is a computer bulletin board that allows Santa Monica residents to access information about City events, send messages to City departments, discuss City issues, and submit forms to City Hall. Free public PEN terminals are available at City Hall, the Libraries, and the Ken Edwards Center. Residents can also access PEN using a home or business computer with a modem.
- Santa Monica Reads - As part of this program, Literacy Coordinators match prospective students with tutors and recommend appropriate literacy courses.

Senior Services

- Meals -On-Wheels program - This program, which is sponsored by the City and operated by the Westside Interfaith Council, provides home-delivered meals to homebound seniors.
- Senior Health and Peer Counseling program - Provides local residents with health care services, including health screening, health education, and peer counseling services.
- Senior Nutrition Program - Hot meals are served on weekdays on a first-come-first-served basis to residents 60 and older at four sites throughout the city. Frozen home-delivered meals are available daily to homebound, frail and elderly people. A donation is suggested for these programs. A free monthly newsletter featuring health and nutrition information for seniors is also available.
- Senior Recreation Center Programs - Include dancing, choir groups, music classes, field trips, exercise classes, swimming, golf, movies, games, cultural programs, art classes, and a senior dining program.
- Senior Transportation Programs - These include reduced fares on Santa Monica buses, para-transit for doctor visits, and rides to nutrition sites and other Santa Monica locations.
- WISE Senior Services - Funded by the City, this organization provides case management, information referral, day care, in-home services, and para-transit services to Santa Monica seniors.

• Arts and Cultural Events

The City of Santa Monica Arts Program was established in 1982 under the guidance of the Santa Monica Arts Commission. The Cultural Affairs Division administers this program which provides for public artworks and cultural events. Listed below is a summary of public art and ongoing cultural events within the City.

Public Art

Santa Monica has 66 permanently sited public artworks including sculpture, murals, and environmental art, and 70 portable works displayed in public areas within City facilities. The City's Public Art Program is funded by a one-percent dedication through City capital improvement projects.

Cultural Events

Listed below is a summary of annual arts festivals and cultural events that take place in Santa Monica:

- Santa Monica Festival - A multi-cultural performing arts festival presented free to the public at Clover Park every April.
- Juneteenth - An African-American celebration that takes place at Virginia Park each June.
- Twilight Dance Series - A series of live concerts presented free to the public on the Santa Monica Pier in July and August.
- Festival of Corn - This festival takes place each July at Virginia Park and celebrates the traditions of Aztec, Mayan and Native American people.

• Economic Development Programs

Farmers' Market

Santa Monica has four weekly Farmers' Markets that are sponsored and run by the Economic Development Division of the City's Resource Management Department. Local farmers sell fresh

produce, dried fruits, nuts, bread, juices, flowers and plants direct to the public in the downtown area at Arizona Avenue and Third Street Promenade on Wednesday and Saturday; at the corner of Pico and Cloverfield Boulevards on Saturday; and on Main Street near Ocean Park Boulevard on Sunday. The Wednesday market downtown is the largest in the state, with over 90 farmers and approximately 8000 shoppers attending each week.

In July 1996, the Economic Development Division launched the *Sustainable Cities - Sustainably Grown - Farm Direct Program* in an effort to expand the reach of the existing markets. This program, which was inspired by a mandate from the Chefs' Collaborative 2000 for restaurants to make purchasing locally grown, sustainably-produced foods a priority, seeks to facilitate and increase the regular purchase of Farmers' Market produce by local restaurants and hotels.

The City also sponsors the Women, Infant and Children Farmers' Market Program, which allows women with young children who meet certain income requirements to buy produce at the Farmers' Markets using special vouchers (currently Farmers' Markets do not accept regular food stamps). The program serves approximately 2000 families per year.

Sustainable Quality Awards

Launched in 1996 as a partnership between the Chamber of Commerce and the City, this annual awards program recognizes local businesses that have incorporated sustainability into their operating practices. To apply, businesses submit an application summarizing how they have incorporated sustainability into their operations in the areas of economic development, social responsibility, and sustainability of the natural and built environments. Applications are reviewed by local experts in each of the four areas and Sustainable Quality Awards are presented to those businesses who achieved excellence in each area. The program is open to all Santa Monica businesses and to all members of the Santa Monica Chamber of Commerce, regardless of their business location.

Westside Small Business Development Center

The Economic Development Division of the City's Resource Management Department provides funding and support to the Westside Small Business Development Center. The Center provides in-depth, one-on-one business counseling at no charge; conducts training and educational workshops for a nominal charge; and disseminates information, referrals, and "how to" materials to existing and prospective small business owners and entrepreneurs.

Progress Towards Goals

Open Space

This Sustainable City Program indicator calls for an increase in Public Open Space from 164 acres in 1990 to 180 acres by the year 2000. The baseline figure from 1990 includes 106.5 acres of City-owned park space, 49 acres of public open space/medians, 3.5 acres of dedicated public open space on a private development (MGM Plaza Park), and 5 acres of open space at the Santa Monica Beach Club*. In 1992 an additional 0.8 acres along Ocean Park Boulevard was added to the City's open space inventory. These figures were obtained from the 1993 Master Environmental Assessment (MEA). The MEA defines public open space areas as landscaped sites that do not contain recreational facilities. The median acreage is defined as landscaped median strips greater than 1 acre that are used for public recreation along San Vicente Boulevard and Olympic Boulevard.

The 1996 MEA indicates that by 1995 the City's open space inventory had risen to 179.5 acres. This figure includes 109 acres of City-owned parks, 62 acres of public open space/medians, 3.5 acres at MGM

*Please Note: The 209 acre Santa Monica State Beach, which is managed by the City under an operating agreement with the State of California, is not included in these figures because, although it is available to all Santa Monica residents for recreational uses, it is viewed as a regional resource.

Plaza, and 5 acres at the Santa Monica Beach Club. A 2.9 acre parcel at Pico Boulevard and Cloverfield Avenue adjoining Virginia Park was recently purchased by the City but is not included in the open space total because the final design of the site has not been completed. These figures indicate that the City is now within 0.5 acres of the indicator target.

According to standards used by the Santa Monica Recreation and Parks Commission, 2.5 acres of open space should be provided for every 1000 City residents. With an estimated 1995 population of 89,194 residents, this standard currently requires approximately 223 acres of public open space in Santa Monica. Because the City has essentially met its current open space goal, it is recommended that the indicator target be revised to adopt this Recreation and Parks Commission standard. With a projected population of 90,777 residents by the year 2000, the revised target would be 227 acres of open space for the City at that time. The City is currently working to identify additional recreational and open space areas with the revision of the Open Space Element, development of the Parks and Recreation Master Plan, and a study of Airport Residual (non-aviation) Lands (see "Plans for the Future" below). Since approximately 37.5 acres of residual land at the Santa Monica Airport has been identified for potential conversion to public open space use, it is felt that this revised target is potentially attainable. (Please note: This recommendation may be revised if the City Council adopts an alternative target based on recommendations presented in the updated Open Space Element which is scheduled for completion in early 1997).

Community Gardens

There are currently two community gardens in Santa Monica. The Sustainable City Program indicator for community gardens calls for the construction of three additional gardens by the year 2000. No additional community gardens have been constructed since the baseline was established in 1993. In a telephone survey conducted for the update of the City's Open Space Element, community gardens tied for last in a list of community open space facility priorities. However, there is currently a two to three year wait for community garden plots, indicating that there is a strong demand for gardens among the small percentage of the local population that desires more garden space. Given that current community garden acreage totals less than one acre, this indicator goal should be retained and efforts should be initiated to meet it. (Please note: The target for the community gardens indicator is being reviewed and may be revised as part of the Open Space Element/Parks and Recreation Master Plan update process. If City Council adopts an alternative target based on recommendations in those reports, the Sustainable City target will be revised to conform with the adopted target).

Trees

The Sustainable City Program indicator for Trees in Public Spaces calls for an increase of 350 trees by the year 2000 from a baseline of 28,000 trees in 1990. This baseline is an estimate provided by the Parks and Sports Division. A detailed tree inventory has not yet been completed so progress towards this goal cannot be measured.

The City is in the process of hiring a Community Forester and is currently developing a Community Forestry Management Plan (see "Plans for the Future" below) which will include a detailed inventory of City trees. It is recommended that when the inventory is completed and the Community Forestry Plan is in place that this indicator be revised to reflect existing conditions and forestry program goals.

Obstacles/Needs

• Open Space

As part of the process to update the Open Space Element and develop a Parks and Recreation Master Plan for Santa Monica (see "Plans for the Future" below) approximately 3000 residents participated in

surveys to determine community open space needs and preferences. Survey results expressed the following community open space needs:

- as a top priority, existing parks and facilities should be improved and renovated.
- Santa Monica residents desire additional parks and open space.
- There is a strong desire for additional playing fields, aquatics facilities and bicycle paths.
- Residents support using public school facilities to expand parks and recreation opportunities for adults and youth.

The primary obstacle to meeting these needs is the lack of available public land in the city. The Recreation and Parks Master Plan currently being developed will address the identified community needs and investigate alternatives to overcome this obstacle. Community and Cultural Services staff have also indicated that there is a need for accessibility improvements at the City's parks and public facilities to provide access to the disabled community.

• **Community Development**

Listed below is a summary of community development and social services needs as identified in the 1995 Consolidated Plan and by Community and Cultural Services Department staff.

- There is a need to strengthen the delivery of services to at-risk youth to address the issues of increased violence, teen pregnancy, poor academic performance, low self-esteem and suicide.
- Quality childcare at affordable rates and childcare centers that offer "non-traditional" hours of operation are needed in the city.
- Additional community facilities and services (especially transportation services) catering to the needs of the elderly residents are needed.
- Affordable and accessible health services, emergency room care, and specialized medical care are needed for the City's low-income and homeless populations are greatly needed.
- Additional specialized medical care services including medical and social care for persons with HIV and AIDS, drug and alcohol recovery programs, and mental health care programs are needed for Santa Monica residents.
- There is a need to maintain a well-balanced continuum of care for homeless individuals and families to ensure adequate emergency, transitional, and permanent housing, employment and supportive services.
- Additional support services including independent living skills, computer technology, employment and housing are needed for persons with disabilities.
- Additional job training and employment services are needed to help enhance the local economy, reduce unemployment, and reduce the number of Santa Monica residents living below the poverty level.
- Additional legal support, conflict resolution, and counseling services are needed to assist low-income residents and victims of domestic violence.

The primary obstacle to meeting these needs is lack of available funding. Community and Cultural Services staff are currently addressing this obstacle by seeking funding from federal, state and local sources to expand existing programs to meet these identified needs.

Plans for the Future

• Update of Open Space Element

In 1995 the Community and Cultural Service (CCS) and Planning and Community Development departments initiated a long range planning process to update the Open Space Element of the City's General Plan and to produce the City's first Parks and Recreation Master Plan (PRMP).

As part of this planning process, program staff solicited input from community members regarding their preferences for how open space and parks should be designed, renovated, or expanded. The research portion of Phase I of this project was completed in February 1996 and included community open houses and meetings, phone surveys, park user surveys, student outreach, and an inventory of the existing open space and park system. The information gathered in this stage was used to guide the planning process for the remainder of Phase I. This involved the development of a Conceptual Framework, incorporating the public input, that will serve as the blueprint for the Open Space Element and PRMP. The Conceptual Framework was presented to a joint meeting of the Planning and Recreation and Parks Commissions in June 1996. It includes a description of Open Space System components, a vision statement, goals and policy directions, and open space benchmarks. Input from commissioners and the public is currently being incorporated into final drafts of the Open Space Element and PRMP which will be presented to City Council for approval in April 1997. The updated Open Space Element will provide long-range goals, objectives and policies for parks and open space in Santa Monica. The PRMP will present more specific implementation recommendations.

In July 1996, City Council allocated \$180,000 to conduct a study to identify and assess the feasibility of parks and recreation land-use alternatives for the residual (non-aviation) land areas at the Santa Monica Airport. This study, known as the Airport Non-Aviation Land Study, began this Fall and will be presented to City Council in April along with the Open Space Element and the PRMP. (Please note: The recommendations from these studies may lead to the revision of indicator targets for Open Space, Community gardens and Public Trees addressed in this report).

• Beach Improvement Group Project

CCS and EPWM Department staff are currently overseeing the design and public input process for five capital improvement projects collectively known as the Beach Improvement Group (BIG) Project. The five projects include: renovation of the northern section of Palisades Park, reconstruction of the California Incline, widening of the Santa Monica Pier bridge, improvement to sidewalks, landscaping and park areas along the beach between the Pier and Bay Street, and enhancement of the gateway where Interstate 10, Pacific Coast Highway, and the Pier intersect. City Council approved the conceptual design for the project in July 1996. The project is now in the design development phase which is scheduled for completion by January 1997. Construction will likely begin in Fall 1997, with project completion by Winter 1998.

• Community Forestry Program

CCS Department staff and Environmental Programs Division staff have begun working with the local non-profit group TreePeople to develop and implement a community forestry program in Santa Monica. TreePeople is an urban forestry organization in Los Angeles that received a \$150,000 matching grant from the Forest Service to fund pilot urban forestry programs. TreePeople will assist with program development and when completed, intend to use Santa Monica's program as a model for the entire Los Angeles region. CCS is currently in the process of hiring a Community Forester who will oversee the development and implementation of a comprehensive Community Forestry Management Plan for the City

as well as all City tree maintenance operations. It is expected that this position will be filled by January 1997.

As a first step in the development of the community forestry program, the City will conduct a tree study to analyze the economic, social, and environmental effects that an integrated urban forestry program could have. An integrated urban forestry plan is designed to meet multiple goals, including providing jobs for people planting and maintaining trees, education opportunities, and a higher quality of life. If planned carefully urban forestry can contribute significantly to water and energy conservation, air pollution and storm water mitigation, and greenwaste recycling efforts.

In the wake of the passage of Proposition 13 the City's tree trimming budget was cut dramatically. As a result, the condition of the City's urban forest suffered from neglect. As part of the initial phase of the community forestry program the City significantly increased funding for tree trimming contract services with West Coast Arborists (WCA) to supplement the City's tree trimming staff and perform tree trimming and maintenance services. WCA is trimming all of the City's trees on a systematic block-by-block basis and City staff will continue to respond to citizen complaints.

• **Integrated Pest Management for Parks**

The Environmental Programs Division has recently begun working with the Community and Cultural Services Department to develop an integrated pest management (IPM) program to control outdoor pests at the City's parks, cemetery, right-of-ways, and other open space areas. This is the second phase of the City's IPM program. The first phase, which is currently being implemented, addresses indoor and structural pests (see the "Hazardous Materials" section of this report for more information). Implementation of this program will likely begin in the Spring of 1997.

• **Visual Art in Community Places**

Under the guidance of the Santa Monica Arts Commission and the Parks and Recreation Commission, the Visual Art in Community Places program will commission temporary artworks for placement in the City's parks and other open areas. As part of this program, artists will be encouraged to propose sites in neighborhood communities and will interact with Santa Monica's neighborhoods and address social, environmental and cultural issues through the visual arts.

Recommendations

- 1.) The Public Open Space indicator should be revised to coincide with the Recreation and Parks Commission's standard specifying 2.5 acres of open space be provided for every 1000 city residents. Given Santa Monica's population projection of 90,777 residents in the year 2000, the revised indicator target will be 227 acres of public open space. If the City Council adopts an alternative target based on recommendations presented in updated the Open Space Element (scheduled for completion in early 1997) this target should be reviewed and revised with input from the Task Force on the Environment, Community and Cultural Services staff, and the Recreation and Parks Commission.
- 2.) Efforts should be taken to identify space and funding for the construction of three additional community gardens. If an alternative target for community gardens is adopted by City Council based on recommendations in the updated Open Space Element, the Sustainable City Program target should be revised to coincide with the adopted target.
- 3.) The baseline and target of the Trees in Public Spaces indicator should be revised following completion of a detailed City tree inventory and development of the Community Forestry Program. The indicator should be based on accurate baseline conditions and the target should reflect the goals of the Community Forestry Program.

- 4.) The updated Open Space Element and Recreation and Parks Master Plan should be reviewed when completed to determine if, based on the findings and recommendations of those reports, additional indicators for open space can be incorporated into the Sustainable City Program. The Planning Commission, the Recreation and Parks Commission, and City staff from the Community and Cultural Services department should be consulted during this process.
- 5.) The Social Services Commission and staff from the Human Services Division should be consulted about including recommendations and objectives for community and social services presented in the Consolidated Plan as additional indicators for the Sustainable City Program.
- 6.) Staff should investigate the feasibility of instituting an economic development program designed to encourage the siting of “green” businesses in Santa Monica.